ELMWOOD HISTORIC DISTRICT: ELMWOOD HISTORIC DISTRICT (EAST)[6]

"Every city has its favorite residence district. The people of Buffalo have decided, and not without good reasons, that their favorite district is that called the Elmwood."

-- "The New Elmwood District," *Greater Buffalo*. (1902)

"Nature and man seem to have worked harmoniously in the creation of what is known as Buffalo's 'Elmwood District."

--"The New Elmwood District," *Commerce.* (August, 1903)

OVERVIEW

The Elmwood Historic District is significant under Criterion A in the area of Community Planning and Development and C in the area of Architecture as an exceptional, highly intact residential neighborhood located in the City of Buffalo. Much of the district's architecture and planning represents the first era of street-car suburbanization in Buffalo, which occurred during the golden age of industrial, economic and population growth following the Civil War. The district contains nearly 5,000 resources. For the purposes of managing the National Register listing process, the district has been divided along the commercial spine of Elmwood Avenue into the Elmwood Historic District (West) and the Elmwood Historic District (East). This nomination documents the Elmwood Historic District (East) portion of the district on the National Register, while providing a historic context for both. The Elmwood Historic District (West) was listed on the NY State and National Registers in 2012. The nominated district contains more than 1,800 properties and nearly 3,500 resources in total, reflective of the city at the height of its prominence as the eighth most populous city in America.[7] The district evolved over time, transforming from a forested, pastoral area filled with nurseries and farmhouses into a wealthy residential area populated with large estates in the nineteenth century, and from a bustling streetcar suburb into a modern community that experienced several stages of automobile-oriented design in the twentieth century. Due to the presence of large estates, which occupied especially large plots of land at the turn of the twentieth century, much of the streetcar suburb style of development east of Elmwood Avenue occurred a few decades later than in the Elmwood Historic District (West). The portions of the district that formerly held these estates prevented new development until a later date than occurred west of Elmwood Avenue, creating a patchwork pattern that gradually filled in new buildings as the estates were later subdivided beginning in the

[6] Section 8 combines the narrative previously prepared by Jennifer Walkowski for the Elmwood Historic District (West) with additional research and discussion specifically related to the Elmwood East area provided by Annie Schentag. For ease in reading, the two portions are not differentiated.

[7] United States Bureau of the Census, "Table 1: Rank by Population of the 100 Largest Urban Places, Listed Alphabetically by State: 1790-1990," Released June 15, 1998, Accessed June 22, 2015, http://www.census.gov/population/www/documentation/twps0027/tab01.txt.

1920s. The period of significance for the Elmwood Historic District (East) thus features a later end date than that established for the Elmwood Historic District (West). Beginning in 1867 with the development of Frederick Law Olmsted's park and parkways system, which first gave shape to the district as an attractive community for development, the period of significance ends in 1965 with the construction of the Scajaquada Expressway, marking the district's complete transition into the age of the automobile.

Through much of Buffalo's early history, the area that would become the Elmwood Historic District was largely forested, undeveloped land.[8] In the 1804 plan, this area was marked off as "farm lots" and a number of nurseries later prospered in the area. Forest Lawn Cemetery, founded in 1849 on the Scajaquada Creek, was one of the first large-scale improvements in this region, noted as being distant from the city center. After the city's boundary expansion in 1853 encompassed the Town of Black Rock, in which this area originally laid, this swath of land became attractive for new development. At the invitation of Buffalo businessmen seeking to enhance the quality of their city, Frederick Law Olmsted overlaid his masterpiece Buffalo parks and parkways system over the area between 1868 and the 1870s, transforming the raw land into a carefully crafted and manicured naturalistic landscape. His parks were immediately popular, encouraging the development and growth of Buffalo's streetcar system in the 1870s and 1880s to create better access. When a horse-drawn streetcar line opened on Elmwood Avenue in 1889, the era of rapid growth of the area began. At nearly the same time, H.H. Richardson and Olmsted developed the massive Buffalo State Asylum for the Insane. The Buffalo State Asylum, The Park (now Delaware Park) and Forest Lawn Cemetery, all immediately north of the Elmwood neighborhood, physically helped to form the northern extents of the city and established the standard for high-quality architecture in what is now the Elmwood Historic District.

The "Elmwood district," as it was called during its primary development phase beginning in the 1890s, developed rapidly within a relatively short amount of time due to several simultaneous, converging forces. Olmsted's new parks and parkways made this area of the city very attractive for development, and land values immediately began to rise. The streetcar systems allowed for better access to the portion of Buffalo, linking to the jobs and businesses in downtown. At the same time, in the post-Civil War era, Buffalo's economy was booming, which fueled an incredible growth in the city's population. In 1850 the city's total population was 42,261; by 1870, only two decades later, it had swelled dramatically to 117,714, nearly tripling in size. The economic and commercial growth in Buffalo during this era also created a large middle and upper-middle class of business owners and managers and others., all looking to build or purchase stylish, modern houses on

[8] The term "Elmwood Historic District" will be used throughout this nomination as a title applied retroactively to the region, even before it was labeled as thus in the 1890s. The term applies to the entirety of the district, with the exception of when distinguished along the eastern or western portion of the total district, as in Elmwood Historic District (East). When distinguished as Elmwood Historic District (East), the discussion applies solely and/or most prominently to the eastern portion of the district. Henceforth, the term "Elmwood Historic District" and "Elmwood district" will be used interchangeably throughout this document. In contemporary Buffalo, this area is also colloquially referred to as the "Elmwood Village."

comfortable suburban lots. As these forces converged, the Elmwood Historic District was the natural area for this growth and became one of the prime real estate areas of the city beginning in the 1880s, and especially between the 1890s and 1910s, resulting in the construction of numerous individual single-family houses, some multiple-family houses, apartment buildings, some churches and eventually leading to the establishment of a commercial strip along the Elmwood Avenue streetcar line.

Prior to the 1890s, this section of Buffalo had no name and no identity. First only identifiable as part of the city's large 11th Ward, the name "Elmwood district" or "Elmwood Avenue district" first appeared around 1890, immediately following the opening of the first streetcar line. Developers used this new name as a way to brand and market the area as a new, desirable residential neighborhood. Encouraged by the garden-liked environment of the Olmsted parks and parkways system that laced through the area on both sides of Elmwood Avenue, development here primarily consisted of free-standing single family houses. In some cases, houses were built for specific owners, but mostly houses were speculatively built by developers, builders and investors. In the popular styles of the era, most of the houses were designed in the Queen Anne, Colonial Revival, Tudor Revival and Craftsman styles. Also, as the city's population shifted from downtown Buffalo and into neighborhoods like the "Elmwood district" in the late 1800s, many existing and newly formed congregations built new churches in the neighborhood, primarily along Richmond Avenue, within walking distance of their members and parishioners. Finally, enterprising businesses located here to serve the growing residential neighborhood with basic needs. By the turn of the twentieth-century, the Elmwood Historic District had emerged as Buffalo's most desirable residential neighborhood.

By the 1920s, changes began to subtly shape the Elmwood Historic District. Though the neighborhood had been built thanks to the streetcar, by the 1920s automobiles were emerging as the most popular means of transportation. The individual ownership of automobiles in the Elmwood Historic District meant a change in the physical design of the neighborhood, as barns and carriage houses were transformed into automobile garages, new garages were constructed, and Elmwood Avenue was widened to accommodate this new means of travel. The influence of this new transportation method also began to physically manifest in the district in the form of new lot sizes, which became larger or were altered in order to provide ample space for driveways and garages. Due to the slightly later settlement of the area east of Elmwood Avenue, which began in earnest around 1890, the typical lot size on new streets such as Auburn Avenue and Cleveland Avenue was slightly larger than in the western portion of the district. This resulted from a number of different factors, including the substantial lot size established by previous earlier estates that only existed east of Elmwood Avenue, different real estate developers than in the west, as well as the attempt to provide space for automobiles in lots that were not fully divided until the introduction of this new transportation method. The Elmwood Historic District (East) in particular also accommodated the automobile in a series of new car-centric development patterns, including landscaped, median streets and small cul de sacs.

With the extension of Elmwood Avenue in 1910-1911, creating a direct link between downtown Buffalo and the residential Elmwood Historic District, Elmwood Avenue itself transformed into a commercial strip. Around the same time, the residential areas of the Elmwood Historic District also began to transform. While the architecture and physical character in the district remained largely intact, a new, largely middle-class population moved in. As wealthy older residents who could afford large mansions and a live-in staff passed away, many of the larger houses were divided into apartments. This phenomenon was further exacerbated by the Great Depression in the 1930s. Despite this transformation, the desire to live in and amongst the Olmsted parkways, within easy walking distance of the shops on Elmwood Avenue, continued to make the Elmwood Historic District neighborhood one of the most popular and desirable residential neighborhoods in the city of Buffalo.

The history of the Elmwood Historic District (East) encapsulates an evolution in settlement patterns, as the neighborhood became increasingly more densely developed over time. During the span of a few decades, the district developed from a rural area to an urban one, transitioning from forest to farmland to parks and large estates to a streetcar suburb and, eventually, to the nascent automobile-oriented urban designs that can still be seen in the district today. This pattern of development is thoroughly intertwined with a broader history of transportation, which underwent a series of advancements that greatly impacted the urban design and architecture of the neighborhood at each new stage. The neighborhood's transition from rural to urban is mirrored in the transition of transportation methods over time, from horse and carriage to streetcar and then automobile. As each new form emerged, it deeply impacted the physical, social and economic character of this district, and the Buffalo region at large. In tracing the history of these advancements in terms of both urban settlement and transportation, the Elmwood Historic District (East) provides excellent examples of these transitions at each stage of development.

Today many consider the Elmwood Historic District characteristically "Buffalo" in spirit and form. Built during the height of the city's economic, cultural and financial boom at the end of the nineteenth and dawn of the twentieth centuries, the free-standing, single-family houses are characteristic of Buffalo's finest residential stock. In other cities, such as Boston or Baltimore, residential growth was marked with attached row houses and town houses. Construction in the Elmwood Historic District occurred during an era when cramped tenement quarters were seen as unhealthy and dangerous, and the wide-open natural landscape established by Olmsted for fresh air and light became standard for a healthy way of life in the industrial era. Free-standing houses and their own individual parcels were also built to serve as small-scale replicas of the type of mansions built on large landscaped parcels constructed by the rich, allowing every citizen to be the resident of his/her own castle. Today, the Elmwood Historic District retains the spirit of its original design as a largely residential neighborhood, and the small individual shops and boutiques on Elmwood Avenue (for the past 15 years,

collectively known as the "Elmwood Village") are a reminder of the family-run stores and shops that originated on the street in the 1920s.

EARLY HISTORY OF BUFFALO (ca. 1790s – 1853)

The era of widespread land sales and the process of land subdivision in the Buffalo area began in July of 1797, when surveyor Joseph Ellicott was contracted by Theophilus Cazenove, agent for the Holland Land Company, to serve as chief surveyor of the Holland Purchase. Ellicott had previously assisted his brother Andrew in surveying and platting the city of Washington, D.C. in 1791–92. During this time, the Mile Strip Reservation along the Niagara River was also surveyed by Ellicott at the expense of the Holland Land Company and its boundaries established and clarified.[9] Along with the assistance of brother Benjamin, Joseph Ellicott completed the survey of the Holland Purchase by 1800.[10] Ellicott secured the ideal site for the new settlement on the Buffalo Creek and took the first steps toward creating the civil vision and commercial wealth that would lead to the Elmwood Historic District less than a century later.[11] Envisioning a community he called "New Amsterdam," Ellicott laid out what would be the future city of Buffalo and was eager to begin establishing the settlement. Ellicott was also aware of the advantages of the lands held by New York State in the Mile Strip Reservation along the Niagara River, seeing the establishment of a village at Black Rock as "equally or more advantageous for a town than Buffalo."[12] Fortunately for Ellicott, the state did not survey the Mile Strip until 1803-04, first offering lands for sale in the Village of Black Rock (Upper Black Rock) only in February 1805. Finally the Holland Land Company authorized Ellicott to commence his survey for "New Amsterdam," which he completed by Ellicott in 1804.[13]

With the grand Baroque-influenced street plan he had helped create for Washington D.C. still fresh in his mind, Joseph Ellicott laid out "New Amsterdam" with a radial street plan overlaid onto a grid pattern, a design that set the stage for the later development of the city and the Elmwood Historic District. This radial plan was unusual among other early city plans in America created by land companies and developers of this era, as it was easier

---

[9] In the fall of 1798, Seth Pease surveyed and established the line of the State reservation along the Niagara River, one mile away from the shoreline. Some difficulty was experienced in determining the boundaries of the southern end, due to the shape and angle of Lake Erie and the Niagara River. After a great deal of negotiations between the Holland Land Company and New York State, it was determined that the point of origin for the south end of the Mile Strip would commence at the point where the water of the Niagara River was a mile wide at the mouth of Lake Erie, creating a large circle at the terminus with a mile-wide radius. In 1802, New York State moved to extinguish the Native Americans' title to the land in the Mile Strip Reservation, and quickly began to open it up for settlement. This area would become known as Black Rock. H. Perry Smith, *History of the City of Buffalo and Erie County with Biographical Sketches of Some of Its Prominent Men and Pioneers...* (Syracuse, NY: D. Mason, 1884), 78.

[10] *Municipality of Buffalo, New York a History, 1720-1923*, 81.

[11] H. Perry Smith, 79.

[12] *Municipality of Buffalo, New York a History, 1720-1923*, 92.

[13] *Municipality of Buffalo, New York a History, 1720-1923*, 92-101.

and cheaper to lay out a simple grid of streets with regular sized lots than it was to plat the angles and curves of Ellicott's grand design. The state-created Village of Black Rock (Upper Black Rock) reflects this phenomenon, with its regular grid of rectangular lots laid out regardless of the topography or other natural features. Ellicott's plan for what Buffalo, reflecting its kinship to the ambitious and aspirational plan of the new nation's capital, is progressive and forward-looking, aiming beyond just the early pioneer era to a future city of substance. Its design is intended to stand out as a beautiful, sophisticated community that would attract land sales and encourage settlement, especially in contrast to the mundane grid of Black Rock. The center of Ellicott's plan was Niagara Square, an open, traditional village square intended to serve as a market place and for public gatherings in the tradition of early American village squares. Ellicott located the center of his plan in close proximity to the mouth of the Buffalo River, seeing it as the key to the commercial development of the new village. Niagara Square was also sited due to the topography of the landscape, located just north of the Terrace, a drop-off separating a generally flat plain from the lower, swampy areas near the river. From Niagara Square, roads radiated into the countryside. Ellicott gave the roads in the new settlement names in honor of the Dutch investors and patrons, such as Schimelpeninck Avenue (now Niagara Street), Vollenhoven Avenue, and Vanstaphorst Avenue (now Main Street in the city). Other streets were named in honor of Native American tribes, including Chippewa Street (the village's northern border at the time), Huron Street and Mohawk Street. Delaware Street, running northward from Niagara Square, was named by Ellicott for one of the Native American groups said to frequent the portage road around Niagara Falls.[14]

Main Street, then called Vanstaphorst Avenue, ran north-south through Ellicott's plan for Buffalo, just to the east of Niagara Square, and terminated at the Buffalo Creek. As the oldest and primary thoroughfare to and from the new settlement, it is surprising that Ellicott did not chose to have Main Street run directly through Niagara Square, the center of his plan. As the primary road between the water routes in Buffalo and Batavia, then the base of the Holland Land Company's operations, and Albany to the distant east, the well-traveled Main Street would naturally evolve into a primary commercial section in the young village.[15] Delaware Street, running north-south through Niagara Square, ran only between Chippewa Street to the north and terminated, not at the Buffalo Creek, but at the Terrace. Cut off from the water and not serving as a major commercial artery, this truncated route encouraged the early growth of a residential sector on Delaware Street and around Niagara Square.[16] It would appear based on Ellicott's plan, that rather than make commercial activity the central focus of his new city, he intentionally encouraged the growth of a fine residential sector in the village of Buffalo in the most elegantly designed portion of his plan. Thus, right from the beginning, Ellicott prioritized the sophisticated character of the new city.

---

[14] Francis R. Kowsky, "Delaware Avenue, Buffalo, New York," in *The Grand American Avenue: 1850 - 1920*, ed. Jan Cigliano (San Francisco: Pomegranate Artbooks, 1994), 36.
[15] "Our Chief Thoroughfare," *Grosvenor Library Bulletin* 4, no. 1 (September 1921): 18.
[16] Kowsky, "Delaware Avenue, Buffalo, New York," 36.

With the announcement in 1819 that the state planned to construct a "Grand Canal" from the Hudson River to the Great Lakes, further attention was brought to Buffalo and Western New York. It was after this second "birth" of Buffalo, following the devastation of the War of 1812 and the events of 1813 that the settlement began to flourish. As the western terminus of the canal was resolved in 1823 in Buffalo's favor, a census taken in January of 1824 found 2,412 residents in the entire township of Buffalo and 1,039 in neighboring Black Rock. The community featured a large number of people who were employed in the building trades, including 51 carpenters and joiners, 19 masons and stone cutters, and 7 blacksmiths, indicating that construction was thriving in Buffalo during the 1820s.[17]

With the opening of the Erie Canal in October 1825, Buffalo began to establish itself as an industrial and commercial center on the Great Lakes. The Village of Buffalo was initially incorporated in April 2, 1813, then reorganized in 1815 and again in 1822, establishing the first official government for the community.[18] The 1830 federal census recorded a population of over 8,600 residents in Buffalo, marking a dramatic, nearly fourfold increase in only a few short years. Maturing beyond the hardscrabble, pioneer settlement that had characterized Buffalo through the first few decades of its existence, the City of Buffalo was officially incorporated on April 20, 1832. At this time, the city marked its northern boundary as North Street, with the majority of settlement and commercial activity still centered on Niagara Square.[19] Smaller pockets of settlement continued to be present at Cold Spring, to the city's northeast, and in Black Rock, to the northwest.

Buffalo saw tremendous growth and development of its rail system in the 1840s. During this time, the Erie Canal was reaching the maximum capacity and pinnacle of its growth and use as a transportation and freight system, and the region's rail network developed as a complement to the canal system. Perhaps the most important rail line established in this era was the Buffalo and Albany connection, which was completed in early 1843. Coupled with the growth of Midwestern cities such as Detroit and Chicago in the 1840s and the development of Joseph Dart's grain elevator in 1842, Buffalo's national roles as a grain port and transportation hub were just beginning to reach their strides in the 1840s. Joseph Ellicott's small walkable settlement of 1804 grew through the period of canal boats in the 1820s and 1830s to become a continental center of high-speed mechanized transportation systems in service to and from its manufacturing and commodity transfer sites.

[17] Larned, 35-36.
[18] John Homer French, "Buffalo City," in *Gazetteer of the State of New York: Embracing a Comprehensive View of the Geography, Geology, and General History of the State, and a Complete History and Description of Every County, City, Town, Village and Locality: With Full Table of Statistics* (Syracuse, NY: R. Pearsall Smith, 1860), 284.
[19] Larned, 41-43.

The success of the Erie Canal and Buffalo's growing role as a commercial and industrial center linking the east coast with the inland cities in the developing United States attracted a dramatic increase in population for the city. The state census conducted in 1845 tallied 29,773 residents in the city of Buffalo, while only five years later, the federal census recorded the Buffalo population at 42,261 – an increase of about 42 percent in just five years.[20] The cityscape was rapidly developing due to this tremendous population explosion, and the decision was soon made to expand the city boundaries. In April 1853, the city charter was revised and the boundaries of Buffalo were expanded to include a vast swath of new territory. Little opposition was raised by the diminished Village of Black Rock when the new boundaries completely absorbed the former rival into the growing city.[21] The new boundaries also encompassed the surrounding forested and farmland areas, noted as the Holland Land Company Farm Lots in previous maps. The city had grown from approximately four and one-half square miles in 1832, when it was originally incorporated, to roughly forty-two square miles in 1853. The city also created 13 wards, increased from the original 5 wards.[22]

The most lasting physical legacy from this early era of Buffalo's history is the visionary radial and orthogonal street grid laid out by Joseph Ellicott in 1804. In the 1860s and '70s, Frederick Law Olmsted grafted his impressive network of parks and parkways to Ellicott's original civic vision, gracefully accommodating the greatly growing city of Buffalo and creating the tableau for what became the Elmwood District.

HISTORY OF THE ELMWOOD DISTRICT (ca. 1860s – ca. 1910s)

With the significant expansion of Buffalo's area in 1853, a vast new swath of territory was brought into the jurisdiction of the city. This included Black Rock to the west, in the former Mile Strip Reservation along the Niagara River, Cold Spring to the east, near the intersection of the present Main Street and Ferry Streets, and the distant Buffalo Plains community, formed along current Main Street in the city's far northeastern corner, and Scajaquada Creek, a significant stream running from east to the Niagara River at Black Rock.

LOTS

As the earliest purchasers of Holland Land Company Inner Lots also purchased many of the original Outer Lots, so did many later nineteenth century residents in Buffalo purchase land in the Holland Land Company outer-most Farm Lots.[23] According to the Holland Land Company records, land transactions began in this region

[20] Larned, 61.
[21] White, Vol 1, page 383-384.
[22] Chuck LaChiusa, "The History of Buffalo: A Chronology: Buffalo 1841-1865," Buffalo as an Architectural Museum, accessed August 07, 2012, http://www.buffaloah.com/h/1865.html.
[23] An abridged list of land purchasers in this area can be found in Ketchum, vol. II, 216.

immediately after Ellicott's survey of Western New York was completed in 1800 and resumed again following the hostilities of the War of 1812. Unlike the more square shaped lots in Buffalo's Inner Lots, which were tightly bounded by several roads, in the area that would become the Elmwood Historic District lots was generally long rectilinear strips of land, stretching between Main Street to the east and the Mile Strip Reservation line to the west, then the only defining boundaries of this district. Without the presence of east-west or north-south roads and paths in this area, access for these long lots was only allowed via the primary thoroughfare in the area, Main Street, and they ended at the Reservation line boundary. Because of the oblique route of Main Street, angled generally eastward, these lots varied in size and acreage, with slightly smaller lots located closer to North Street and larger lots located further north.

These early landowners held farm-sized lots stretching east from the established Main Street route to the Milestrip Reservation line. Tracts varied in size, because of the curves of Main Street and the Reservation line, but generally were rectangular in shape. Lot 54 was initially purchased on June 6, 1804 by William Raymond, who sold the parcel to Alvin Dodge on March 30, 1813.[24] Benjamin Hodge originally purchased the 57-acre lot 55 on August 14, 1806 before selling it to Elisha Williams on July 13, 1811.[25] Solomon Spaulding put a deposit down on lot 56 on April 24, 1804 before paying off the balance on the property on February 29, 1812.[26] William Hodge (elder) originally purchased lot 57 on October 29, 1803 for about $6 an acre and paid off the balance on March 30, 1813.[27] Christian Staley purchased the 63-acre lot 58 on May 15, 1804, taking full ownership of the parcels on February 29, 1812.[28] William Deshay originally purchased lots 59 and 60 in October 1803 before taking final ownership of the more than 130-acres of land in February 29, 1812.[29] Lot 61 was initially divided between George Burgar and Isaac Hurlbut, who each purchased a portion of the over 117-acre lot on October 11, 1803.[30] Burgar later sold his land to Jacob Morrison on October 2, 1813.[31] Isaac Hurlbut paid off his portion by February 29, 1812.[32] The roughly 165-acre lot numbered 62 was initially divided between Samuel Sturgeon, who bought the northern part on September 27, 1806, while John Lyon (or Lion) bought the southern portion on

[24] Karen E. Livsey, *Western New York Land Transactions, 1804-1824; Extracted from the Archives of the Holland Land Company* (Baltimore: Genealogical Pub., 1991), 35, Ancestry.com. Also, Peter Emslie, "Map of Township II R.8 & W. Part T.II R.7 Holland Cos' Land and N.Y. State Reservation in the Town of Black Rock," map, in *A Deed Atlas of the County of Erie, NY : Showing the Dimensions of Lots and Subdivisions of Lots as They Were Originally Converted by the Holland Land Co., the Farmers Loan & Trust Company and the State of New York, Together with the Village of New Amsterdam, Now City of Buffalo* (Buffalo, 1859).
[25] Livsey, 35. Also, Emslie "Map of Township…"
[26] Livsey, 35, 77.
[27] Grace Carew Sheldon, "Unknown - Article about William Hodge, Sr.," *Unknown* (Buffalo), December 31, 1909. Also, Livsey, 35, 100. And, Emslie "Map of Township…"
[28] Livsey, 5, 6, 77.
[29] Livsey, 5, 10, 77.
[30] Livsey, 5, 10, 13.
[31] Livsey, 100. Also Emslie "Map of Township…"
[32] Livsey, 77.

October 27, 1806.[33] Nathaniel Sill purchased the north portion of lot 62 on May 26, 1815.[34] In a transaction dated October 3, 1815, John Lyon sold his land to Granger & Remington, a Buffalo firm. Beyond this lot, Erastus Granger owned tracts of land at lots 63 and 48.

William Hodge (younger), son of early settler William Hodge (elder), gives some description of the area that would become the Elmwood Historic District during its earliest history, noting the residences of some of these early purchasers. Born in Exeter, NY in 1804, the younger Hodge arrived in Buffalo with his parents when he was only a few months old in 1805. While many of the buildings Hodge notes in his description appear to have been located along Main Street and thus in outside of what became the Elmwood district, Hodge's description provides a good picture of the area during the 1810s and 1820s, some twenty years after settlement began:

> *At the present North street, the "outer" village lots terminated and the "farm" lots commenced. The first lot on the east side of Main street, above North, was farm-lot No. 30, and the lots from this to No. 52 were on the east side of the street…on the west side of the street, was No. 53, on which was a small log house occupied by a Mr. Raymond* [most likely William Raymond]. *This house was subsequently the dwelling of Major Noble, and then of Sacket Dodge. The lots number from this upward were on the west side of Main Street. On lot 54 was a log house occupied by another Mr. Raymond, a brother of the one just mentioned. This lot was afterwards owned and occupied by Alvan L. Dodge, for many years. Lots 31, 32, 55, 56, had no houses upon them, except that in 1811 Major Ward Cotton built a log house on lot 55 and occupied it…On lot 57 was a small log house occupied by Michael Hunt. This lot was afterwards the site of Hodge's Brick Tavern…On lot 58 was a small log house occupied by Christjohn Staley* [a.k.a. Christian Staley], *standing back on the side hill near a spring. This house was on the old traveled road, running about where Delaware street now is. On lot 59 was a double log house, the logs being hewed on two sides. This was occupied by William DeShay, and subsequently by Samuel McConnell. It is now the location of Spring Abbey.[35] On this same lot was a small log house occupied by David Reese…On lot 60 was a small framed house occupied by Lyman Persons. On lot 61, near the Jubilee Spring which was on lot 62, was a log house occupied by John Mains and afterwards by George Wormwood. On lot 62 was a small framed house occupied by Shadrach Remington, - father of the Reverends David and James Remington, and grandfather of Cyrus K. Remington of Buffalo. An old log house stood on the back part of this lot. On lot 63 was a small log house occupied by Mr. Wintermute. On lot 64 was a small log house standing down the creek at the stone quarry, which was occupied by Ebenezer Averill."*[36]

[33] Livsey, 13, 77.
[34] Emslie "Map of Township…"
[35] An original footnote from the 1922 Frank Severance text indicates that Spring Abbey was then known as the Home of the Friendless. Today it is the Bristol Home and is still extant, located at 1500 Main Street.
[36] The stone quarry that Hodge notes was later incorporated into Delaware Park. Quoted from William Hodge (younger), "The William Hodge Papers," 202-204.

Hodge recollects the approximate course of what is now Main Street from the distant Buffalo Plains neighborhood (today, now the University at Buffalo's South Campus) south through the Cold Spring area to Buffalo around the year 1825: [37]

> *Coming westward, thence, the road bore a little to the left of the present main road, keeping on the "limestone ridge" for about one mile. Then it crossed the present road on "Flint Hill,"* [an area known as the home of Erastus Granger, between the Scajaquada Creek and present Jewett Parkway] *about sixty rods east of the present parkway* [present Main Street]*, still following, or nearly so, the rocky ridge, to Conjockety's creek* [Scajaquada Creek] *at the old the old fording place, now in Forest Lawn Cemetery. By descending a steep bank, of about twenty feet, and turning immediately to the right, the creek was reached. On this bank, or bluff of high ground, there was a log building called the Lyon house. Mr. Lyon* [presumably the John Lyon noted previously, living at lot 62] *lived there as early as 1806; but I do not know whether he or the Indians built the house. Near the traveled track, at the bottom of the hill, and before it crossed the creek, was a spring of good water and near the house were several apple trees, planted by the early white settlers, if not by the Indians. When I first saw them, more than sixty-seven years ago, they were quite large. And I remember, by the way, several apple trees which stood on the same (the north) side of the creek, near its mouth where the Indian chief, Conjockety (whose name it bears), had his dwelling-place. The Indians may have planted both these clusters of trees. They however disappeared long ago, through neglect, or by the ruthless hand of the white man.*
>
> *Crossing the creek, and continuing a short distance on the 'flat,' and passing a beautiful spring of water, the road, after a westerly course of thirty or forty rods, ascended to high ground, and turned southward. Soon it crossed the old Gulf road, now Delavan avenue. This road took its name from the deep gulf caused by the running water from the Jubilee spring* [today, located in what is now Delaware Avenue near Auburn Avenue]*, and the Staley spring* [presumably located on lot 58 owned by Christian Staley]. *The gulf was bridged as soon as the Holland Land Company's lands were surveyed, about the year 1804. This Gulf road was the first and nearest one from our Main street (in the vicinity of Conjockety's creek and "The Plains – to Black Rock. But it was little traveled, at an early day, and only in a dry time, or in winter when the ground was frozen. The old Guide-board road* [present North Street] *mentioned below, was the principal traveled road to Black Rock ferry from the East.*
>
> *After crossing the Gulf road, the old main road followed about the course of the present Delaware street, passing close by the Jubilee spring. Just north of this spring was a second log house, on what we used to call the Remington lot, or farm, Shadrach Remington and family having come and occupied this farm before the War of 1812* [apparently the south half of lot 62 as previously noted]. *To the south of this Jubilee spring was a third log house, which was, I well remember, occupied by John Mains, and afterwards by George Wormwood. The road still following nearly the course of Delaware street, crossed lot No. 58, lying on the north side of the present Utica street; on which lot was a fourth log house,*

[37] Hodge describes the main route through this area, which appears to largely trace the route of the present-day Delaware Avenue.

occupied by Christjohn Staley [Christian Staley]. *Down the hill, east of this house, was a fine large spring of water, which I remember visiting as early as 1810. The spring is still [1885] in the same place, and looking very much as it did more than seventy-four years ago.*[38]

Near the present Utica street the road bore a little eastward, and after crossing this street, continued about parallel with Delaware, crossing lots 57, 56 and 55, (the "Cotton" lot); then bearing a little westward again, it crossed lots 54 and 53 to the old Guide-board road (now North street)…[39]

Hodge goes on to comment on the rationale behind these early roads, as well as some of the conditions faced by travelers and residents:

In a new country such paths usually go from one watering-place to another, and this course would be more than half as far as the wagon-track by way of the breach. But, in fact, in those days the road from the Cold Spring to near Conjockety's (or Granger's) creek, consisted of a log-way or causeway, and I have seen much of this road many times in the spring and fall flooded with water.[40]

Hodge gives a short description of the general setting of the area, giving a sense of its lack of improvements:

It should be noted that before the Gulf road above-mentioned was opened and the gulf bridged, those who lived in the vicinity of "The Plains" used to reach Niagara river by following the north bank of Conjockety's creek. Many continued to do this for years after the Gulf road was opened, as it was better traveling.

People from the neighborhood of the Cold Spring reached the river by going through the woods on the north side of lot No. 58, starting in about where Utica street now is, and keeping on the high ground' passing near Staley's house and spring, and keeping on in a nearly direct course to the river.[41]

These early descriptions of the area demonstrate the makeshift qualities of roads and utilities in this region before the boom in real estate development occurred in the district.

Both the western and eastern portion of the land that was to become the Elmwood Historic District was a predominantly rural area in the first half of the nineteenth century. The Rev. Dr. John C. Lord, an early resident who built a stately Gothic Revival mansion on Delaware Avenue, later recalled the landscaped of this area in 1825:

---

[38] Original footnote in text here reads "All trace of it is now gone" written by editor Frank Severance in 1922.
[39] Quoted from William Hodge (younger), "The William Hodge Papers," 230-232.
[40] Quoted from William Hodge (younger), "The William Hodge Papers," 232.
[41] Quoted from William Hodge (younger), "The William Hodge Papers," 234.

> *...north of Chippewa and Niagara, was an almost unbroken forest, where the huntsman often pursued the game abounding in the primeval woods. I remember well, that within a year or two after I became a resident of this city, an enormous panther was killed a little beyond North street, in the rear of what was then called the Cotton farm.*[42]

The relative wildness of this area in the first decades of the nineteenth century demonstrates a remarkable difference to its appearance today.

ROAD DEVELOPMENT

Gradually as Buffalo began to grow during the 1830s and 1840s, these Farm Lots also began to see new development. Improvements included the establishment of new roads in the area, which were generally rough, dirt routes that followed the path of waterways. Emslie's 1859 deed atlas of the area appears to capture some of the earliest roads from the 1820s or 1830s in what would become the Elmwood district. While unnamed on his map, Main Street (then known as the Buffalo Road) is clearly visible.[43] At the point where the road bends, at the Cold Spring, other roads intersect at that location. Running in an east-west direction from the Mile Strip Reservation is a road that appears to be current Ferry Street. Interestingly, another street springs from this intersection, heading in a northwesterly direction away from Main Street toward what may have been a ford at Scajaquada Creek. While unnamed on Emslie's map, this road appears to be the Buffalo-Tonawanda Road. This road also appears as an indistinct line on a map from 1829, supporting the notion that, while now existing, this road was an important connection between the Buffalo Road/present Main Street and Buffalo and Ellicott Creek to the north at the time.[44]

Ferry Street is one of the oldest streets in the Elmwood district. It connected Cold Spring in the east to the Black Rock ferry and Niagara River in the west. Local resident William Hodge noted the road's rudimentary conditions, reflecting that in its earliest days it was "flooded with water" during much of the spring and fall.[45] Ferry Street at its present route likely dates to the period when the Black Rock ferry was moved from its original

---

[42] Quoted from Order of the Church Session, comp., *Memoir of John C. Lord, D.D., Pastor of the Central Presbyterian Church for Thirty-eight Years* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Courier Company, Printers, 1878), 9-10, http://ia600506.us.archive.org/1/items/memoirofjohnclor00buff/memoirofjohnclor00buff.pdf.

[43] Main Street had initially served as an early footpath used by the Native Americans, and as early as 1800, Joseph Ellicott straightened and began the process of formalizing and improving the street as a connection between his "New Amsterdam" settlement and the Holland Land Company office in Batavia further to the east, referring to the route as the Buffalo Road. Main Street was one of the earliest streets in the Buffalo area and became a natural point for early settlement and development.

[44] Emslie, "Map of Township…" Also, David H. Burr, "Map of the County of Erie," map, in *An Atlas of the State of New York* (New York, NY: D.H. Burr, Publisher, 1829), http://www.davidrumsey.com/luna/servlet/s/1d28sd.

[45] Quoted from William Hodge (younger), "The William Hodge Papers," 232.

site at the black rock northward to the Ferry lot, an approximately 100- acre lot designated in the Mile Strip Reservation in 1826.[46] By 1835, the road extended from the State Reservation Line in Black Rock to Main Street and was recorded as being four rods, or 66-feet, wide; a road of substantial size.[47] West Ferry Street would become a primary west-east route in the Elmwood Historic District, containing some of the larger and finest examples of residential architecture in the area.

Other roads soon developed in this area, one of the earliest being what is now Delaware Avenue, originally known as Delaware Street. While a more populated street in early Buffalo, in its northern extents the street remained a crude pathway, carved roughly through the forest, for several decades, as described by Rev. Lord. Originally laid out by Ellicott in his 1804 plan for Buffalo, Delaware Street only extended as far north as Chippewa Street, at the city's then boundary. Literally inch by inch, the road crept northward as the settlement expanded; by 1827 it was extended to North Street, and between 1835 and 1836 it was recorded that the street was roughly extended through lot 53 to lot 62. The boundaries of the street were surveyed and marked by "monuments." In 1842, Delaware street was extended to meet the Buffalo-Tonawanda road, and the two roads were joined to form one continuous road. This new Delaware street extended from the city of Buffalo northward some six miles to the growing Erie Canal community at Tonawanda, at the northern edge of Erie County. This alteration also removed the Buffalo-Tonawanda Road from its previous location at the intersection of Main and Ferry Streets, creating the intersection present there today.[48]

The northward extension of Delaware Street was significant, as it bisected the long lots, previously established by the Holland Land Company that stretched the mile between Main Street and Rogers Street at the Mile Strip Reservation line. While ownership of these lots did not immediately change hands, many of the lot holders had built their houses and farms closest to Main Street, the best and only north-south road to traverse this area through much of the early 1800s. The construction of Delaware Street clearly begins to divide the older settled areas of the Cold Spring neighborhood from what would become, by the late 1800s, the "Elmwood district." In the mid-1800s, the access granted by the extension between points began to open this middle ground to development. The presence of Delaware Street encouraged and attracted land sales in this area, helping to begin the process of settlement and suburbanization in what would become the Elmwood district.

What is today known as Ferry Street is also one of the oldest routes through this region. As Hodge noted, many early trails and roads through the vicinity of the young Buffalo connected sources of water before the time it was

---

[46] Charles D. Norton, "The Old Black Rock Ferry," in *Publications of the Buffalo Historical Society*, vol. I (Buffalo, N.Y.: Bigelow Brothers, 1870), 107.

[47] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 244-245.

[48] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, *Index to Records of Streets, Public Grounds, Waterways, Railroads, Gas Companies, Water Works, Etc., of the City of Buffalo, from 1814 to 1896.* (Buffalo, NY: Bureau of Engineering, 1896), 171-172.

piped to households. This appears to have been the case here, as Ferry Street linked the Black Rock ferry at the west to the Cold Spring at the east. Ferry Street at its present route likely dates to the period when the Black Rock ferry was moved from its original site at the black rock northward to the Ferry lot, an approximately100-acre lot designated in the Mile Strip Reservation in 1826.[49] By 1835, the road extended from the State Reservation Line in Black Rock to Main Street and was recorded as being four rods, or 66-feet, wide, a road of substantial size.[50] West Ferry Street would become a primary west-east route in the Elmwood Historic District, containing some of the larger and finest examples of residential architecture in the area.

Another of the early streets in the Elmwood area was Rogers Street. Tracing a portion of the State Reservation's eastern boundary line, and thus the "back" of Black Rock, this street was established as a north-south route in 1837. Named in honor of Henry W. Rogers, a prominent local attorney in Buffalo, Rogers Street extended at this time between York Street (now Porter Avenue) and terminated at Utica Street.[51] Just beyond the North Street border, Summer Street was established as an early east-west route. By the 1830s, the growing population in Buffalo was already well established in the city's northern edges, and several houses and farms were built just beyond its borders. In 1835, a four-rod-wide (66-foot) road between Main Street and the Mile Strip Reservation line, running through lot 54, was surveyed.[52] Rogers Street would later be reimagined by Olmsted and incorporated into his park system as The Avenue, later renamed Richmond Avenue.

NURSERIES

As the streets were gradually beginning to be carved out through the Elmwood Historic District during the first half of the nineteenth century, allowing greater access, one of the most successful industries to emerge in the transitional period was the nursery industry. The development of the nursery industry during this era marks an important shift in the culture of Buffalo and in the nature of the Elmwood district as it evolved from forest to farm to nursery to park to suburb. The earliest residents in the region were concerned with basic human needs, such as food and shelter, both of which had to be obtained using their own skills and labor. By the 1840s and 1850s, with the growth of business, commerce and industry in Buffalo, the increasingly wealthy population could concern themselves with cultural pleasures, such as art, design and architecture. As the forest was cleared, family farming could mature into agricultural industry.

[49] Charles D. Norton, "The Old Black Rock Ferry," in *Publications of the Buffalo Historical Society*, vol. I (Buffalo, N.Y.: Bigelow Brothers, 1870), 107.
[50] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 244-245.
[51] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 602.
[52] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 707.

Some of the nurseries in the future Elmwood district were established relatively early on, providing fruit trees and plants to farmers. In subsequent decades, the nursery industry was fueled by the emerging naturalistic, picturesque aesthetic promoted by the writings of people such as Andrew Jackson Downing, whose 1841 work, *A Treatise on the Theory and Practice of Landscape Gardening, Adapted to North America,* was widely popular. This new emerging field of landscape architecture created the desire among Buffalo's growing and appreciative population, influenced by the trends in other leading areas of the nation, to plant rare, unique and beautiful trees and plants on their properties in the 1840s and 1850s. "Buffalo has many wealthy citizens, who take pride in ornamenting their grounds with choice trees and shrubs, as well as cultivating the finer variety of fruits," the Buffalo Horticultural Society reported in 1853.[53]

William Hodge (elder) established one of the earliest known nurseries in the Elmwood district. When he purchased lot 57 in 1809, the parcel already contained apple trees that had been planted by Joseph Husten. This nursery was said to have been the first planted in the Western New York frontier. In 1825, Hodge and his wife traveled with a group of Buffalonians and Governor DeWitt Clinton to New York City, as he brought water from Lake Erie eastward to mingle the waters in the ocean at the harbor, the so-called "wedding of the waters." During this prestigious trip, Mr. Hodge was said to have visited nurseries on Long Island and to have purchased new trees for his nursery in Buffalo.[54] The elder William Hodge operated his nursery until 1834, when he sold the enterprise to neighbor Abner Bryant. Bryant at the time owned the adjacent farm lot 56, just south of the Hodge property. It is said that, from the Hodge nursery, most of the apple orchards in Western New York can trace their origins.[55] With the success of William Hodge's early nursery, other sites also developed in the Elmwood district. A map of the area from 1855 indicates three large nurseries in the area, stretching between the current Richmond Avenue and Main Street: the Erie County Nursery, operated by Henry C. and Isaac Bryant, sons and successors to Abner Bryant, and the Buffalo Nursery operated by Col. Benjamin Hodge, an older brother to William Hodge (elder).[56]

The other notable nursery depicted on the 1855 map of the area is the J. B. Eaton & Co. Nursery and Greenhouses, also known as Oaklands Nursery, located on lot 61 just east of the present Elmwood Avenue at Ferry Street. Oaklands Nursery featured a large, state-of-the-art greenhouse, initially constructed by the firm of Mason & Lovering in the fall of 1853 before it was taken over by Eaton shortly after. A plan of the greenhouse was published in *The Horticulturalist* journal in 1854, a popular national publication edited for many years by

---

[53] P. Barry, ed., *The Horticulturalist, and Journal of Rural Art and Rural Taste*, vol. IV (Rochester: James Vick, Jr., 1854), 150.
[54] Quoted from William Hodge (younger), "The William Hodge Papers," 184-185.
[55] Quoted from William Hodge (younger), "The William Hodge Papers," 177-178.
[56] Frank Williams, *Williams' New Map of the City of Buffalo, Compiled from Actual Surveys & Reliable Records: Showing All the Territory Embraced within the City Limits, Dimensions of Blocks, Original Lot Lines, Public Improvements, Etc., Etc.*, map (Buffalo: Frank Williams, 1855). Also, "Western Horticultural Review: Changes," in *The Horticultural Review and Botanical Magazine*, ed. J.A. Warder, M.D., vol. II (Cincinnati: Morgan & Overend, 1852), 530.

landscape architecture pioneer Andrew Jackson Downing, touting them as "the most complete and elegant plant houses which we have seen in this country."[57]

The Oaklands Nursery greenhouse is notable as it would have been one of the most architecturally and technologically sophisticated buildings in this area of Buffalo in the 1850s. Constructed of hollow brick and glass, the greenhouse must have stood out in its otherwise naturalistic surroundings.[58] This building, with its expanses of glass, marble walks and complex steam heating system, introduced a higher level of design and materials in this landscape, a precedent for development in the Elmwood district in the decades to follow.

EARLY RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT IN ELMWOOD EAST

At the same time that the eastern areas of the Elmwood district were being transformed for cultivated nursery use, the surrounding areas began to reflect a slow residential growth in the mid-1800s. During this time the area was still largely rural, and remained outside the city lines until the 1850s. Aside from the nurseries, small houses dotted many of the rudimentary thoroughfares through the area, most serving as the residences of farm laborers and workers who worked nearby at the nurseries. This period witnessed two major forms of early settlement for the Elmwood District- the prevalence of nurseries (as we have seen), and the appearance of farmhouses. Both of these developments, occurring contemporaneously, speak to the pastoral character of the district from the 1830s to the 1870s.

There are several good examples of early farmhouses in the Elmwood Historic District (East), which also share a common history and development with those in the Elmwood Historic District (West). Often positioned with deep setbacks from the street, these farmhouses were built on generous lots made possible by the pastoral character of the neighborhood. One such house stands at 639 Lafayette Avenue (ca. 1905, contributing), a frame L-plan vernacular residence that is one-and-one-half stories in height. It features paired entry doors with a transom, and has a porch with simple Italianate columns that wraps around the front and side elevation. The deep setback and generously wide lot identify this house as older than many of its turn-of-the-twentieth-century neighbors. Likewise, 700 West Delavan Avenue also stands out on its street as an excellent example of early vernacular housing. This two-story frame, L-plan house features wood clapboard sheathing, round headed windows on the upper story and a wrap-around porch. The porch is elaborated with a turned balustrade, frieze and carved brackets, suggestive of Eastlake or Queen Anne style ornamentation. The house at 794 Potomac Avenue (ca. 1880, contributing) exhibits a similar lot size and setback, with a 1.5 story frame L-plan house with a front porch extending from the asymmetrical entrance to the side of the building. These farmhouses are all

[57] Barry, 150-151.
[58] Barry, 189-190.

significant as rare remaining early examples of housing that date to the era just after Olmsted's parks and parkways began to attract attention to Buffalo's 11th Ward, but were built prior to the widespread real estate and development boom that replaced many existing buildings with larger Victorian-era houses.

Summer Street was established as an east-west corridor by the 1830s, prompting the construction of some early farmhouses, whose residents were attracted to this convenient road access. One of the earliest buildings on this street was erected at the corner of Summer Street and Delaware Street in the 1830s for Captain Allen, a distinguished sailor who had once commanded the *Commodore Perry* and the *Superior*. Built initially as a small two-room cabin, the farmhouse at 742 Delaware Street (ca. 1835, demolished) was enlarged by the Rose brothers in the early 1850s.[59] Although the address of this house is listed outside of the Elmwood District, in the Delaware Avenue Historic District (NR ref. no 74001232) instead, there was substantial overlap between these two regions. Particularly in the decades that followed, large estates were created to span these two districts, made possible in part by the immense wealth of some property owners who chose to band together and purchase contiguous tracts of land.[60] Many of the mansions that boasted frontage on Delaware Avenue were also connected, in the back of their lots, to the back of lots that faced Bryant Street or Summer Street. In this sense, earlier residences, like the Captain Allen house, played a significant role in determining future development patterns in what would become the Elmwood Historic District (East).

FOREST LAWN CEMETERY

It was this natural landscape, still distant from the center of the emerging city of Buffalo, which attracted another development in the area in the 1840s, Forest Lawn Cemetery. As most of Buffalo's early burial grounds were located close to the population centers, concerns arose in later years about burying those who had succumbed to diseases such as cholera in such close proximity to the residents of the growing city. These real estate and health motives also combined with a new romanticism and sentimentality about death, which gave rise to the rural cemetery movement. The rural cemetery movement promoted cemeteries with picturesque landscaped burial grounds, combining naturalistic settings with elegant monuments, memorials and statuary, creating a place for mourning and also recreation.

[59] Henry and Edward Rose were English-born architects who were responsible for designing several buildings in Buffalo in the 1850s, perhaps most notably the Arcade building located at 403 Main Street on the site of what would become the Brisbane building. They were also successful landscape architects, employed by the prominent Rumsey family to design the principal features of Rumsey Park, a large, sprawling estate owned by the prominent businessman and benefactor, Bronson Case Rumsey. The ample grounds, which included a lake, wooded island and chalet, were located near what is today Johnson Park in downtown Buffalo. During this time, they converted the former Allen residence into a 1 ½-story farmhouse, and also built the house at 148 Summer Street (1870, contributing) for the Rumsey family.

[60] For more on this, see "Large Estates"

Responding to the rural cemetery influence and the dire need for more burial space in Buffalo, Charles E. Clarke purchased 80 acres of land in 1849 in lots 64 and 65 on the north bank of the Scajaquada Creek, more than 2 ½ miles north of the city center. Clarke appears to have acted both as a private developer and as one concerned for greater health for the public.[61] In the spring of 1850, work began on the project, which Clarke named Forest Lawn Cemetery, to deliberately shape the rough topography of the area and carefully manicure the existing vegetation. In 1864, the Buffalo City Cemetery, a non-profit incorporated trust, was established and in 1865 the trustees invited Spring Grove Cemetery (in Cincinnati, Ohio) superintendent and trained landscape gardener, Adolph Strauch, to create a more open, airy, unbroken landscape.[62] The relationship between the cemetery and the city of Buffalo sets the stage for and nicely presages the character of the Elmwood District:

> *It was considered of the first importance to locate this Cemetery where it would enjoy a permanent seclusion; where the expenditure of taste and money would become a heritage of all coming time; where desecrating tendencies of modern commercial growth should never violate its sanctity, or the encroaching waves of a noisy, restless city life, disturb its repose.*
>
> *The grounds now embraced by "Forest Lawn" seem to fulfill these conditions, without being at too great a distance from the paved thoroughfares of the city.*[63]

While the intent of the builders of Forest Lawn Cemetery may have been to remain remote, far from the reaches of the city, the park-like grounds had the opposite effect, quickly attracting people to this region of Buffalo and encouraging its later development. The creation of the cemetery that would provide the northeastern border of the Elmwood Historic District was a notable milestone in this area's transition from farms to more refined, garden-like settlement.

CREATION OF THE 11th WARD

In response to its rapidly growing population and the new development in the outlying Town of Black Rock, the city of Buffalo dramatically expanded its municipal boundaries with the revised city charter of April 1853. The area characterized in descriptions by settlers such as Dr. Lord and William Hodge as a rural fringe area was then

---

[61] Clarke, a lawyer in Buffalo, and not only the founder of Forest Lawn Cemetery, but also was noted as a founder and president of Buffalo General Hospital in 1855. His involvement in both these medical-based projects indicates he may have had an interest in the health and well-being of his community beyond just seeing Forest Lawn as a development scheme.

[62] Forest Lawn Cemetery reached its current size of 240 acres in 1884, with a purchase of seven acres of land. Albert L. Michaels and Bette A. Rupp, "A History of Forest Lawn Cemetery," in *Forest Lawn Cemetery: Buffalo History Preserved*, by Richard O. Reisem (Buffalo, NY: Forest Lawn Heritage Foundation, 1996), 39-50. Also, John A. Bonafide, *Forest Lawn Cemetery*, report no. 90000688, State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination, 1990.

[63] *Forest Lawn: Its History, Dedications, Progress, Regulations, Names of Lot Holders, &c.* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Thomas Howard & Johnson, 1867), 119.

made a part of the city of Buffalo. Under the political divisions of the new city charter, much of this region was organized as the 11th Ward. This large ward encompassed land stretching from the Niagara River, including the former Mile Strip Reservation, to Main Street, running from North Street as far north as the Scajaquada Creek. The 11th Ward encompassed the established street patterns of Upper Black Rock, generally east-west roads, and the undeveloped areas near Delaware Street and Main Street. In order to begin preparing the new territory for development, City Surveyor George Cole was tasked with surveying the new area by the City Council in the spring 1855. With the rapid growth and expansion of the city at its previous northern border around North Street, a neighborhood now known as Allentown, Cole also began to lay out roads through the new territory.[64]

With the absorption of this area and the incorporation of the Black Rock community into the city of Buffalo, efforts were made to knit together, where possible, the streets of Black Rock from the west and Buffalo from the south. While a few north-south streets, primarily Delaware Street, Main Street, and Rogers Street, were already established, many of the new roads first created in the Elmwood district were east-west streets, originating in the Mile Strip Reservation in Black Rock. Some of these west-to-east streets conform, either tracing a dividing line or bisecting a larger parcel, to the long, narrow lots created by Joseph Ellicott in his original 1804 plan for the Holland Land Company Farm Lots. Some of these were extensions of roads originally created running west-to-east from the Niagara River and the Erie Canal to the Mile Strip Reservation line.

A map of these new city boundaries published in 1854 provides clear evidence of the street pattern in the new territory annexed by Buffalo.[65] In the 11th Ward, the street pattern within the former village of Black Rock appears as a distinct, well-developed grid of streets, in contrast to the less-developed Elmwood district region. South of Ferry Street, the streets were a dense grid, while north of Ferry Street, Black Rock contained only a few west-to-east streets that extended from the river to the Mile Strip Reservation line. These streets include Bouck Street, Clinton Avenue, Bird Avenue and Forest Avenue.[66] At the time, many of the streets would have been simple dirt roads, not widely used for traffic.

The street pattern depicted in the Elmwood district reveals a different situation of origin. In the area between the Mile Strip Reservation line and Delaware Street, only a few roads existed in 1853. Summer Street, established by at least the 1830s, ran between Rogers Street and Delaware Street, just north of North Street. Bryant Street had been cut through lot 56. Running between Rogers Street and Main Street, the first official record of Bryant Street was recorded in 1854; however, a road existed here prior to this date, used by the Bryant family in their

[64] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 45. Also cited elsewhere in the book for other streets.
[65] "A New Map of the City of Buffalo, Embracing All the Territory including Upper & Lower Villages of Black Rock, Cold Springs, &c. as Authorized under the Act of 1853," map (Buffalo, N.Y.: Jewett Thomas &, 1854).
[66] "A New Map of the City of Buffalo…"

nursery.[67] North of Bryant Street, in lot 57, Utica Street was present between Massachusetts Street in Black Rock, across Rogers Street, and extended to Main Street. William Hodge noted that a road here, running to Black Rock, was in existence as far back as 1816.[68] Linking Bryant Street and Utica Street, a small street is present. While unnamed, the street is later identified as Oakland Avenue (now Oakland Place), apparently taking its name from the Oaklands greenhouse nearby. North of Utica Street, Butler Street was identified (now Lexington Avenue). While street records only extend back as far as 1854, when this territory was put under city jurisdiction, the street was apparently previously in existence. The long stretch of Ferry Street is also noted on the map, running from between the river and what is now Bailey Avenue. Although it was one of the earliest and primary routes from Black Rock to Main Street, even Ferry Street was not a well developed road in the mid-1800s, noted in the 1840s as being "a narrow dirt road, corduroy in some places, and occasionally too narrow for two vehicles to pass each other."[69]

North of Ferry Street, the streets depicted in the area that became the Elmwood district on the 1854 map all have their roots in roads established in Black Rock. Originally known as Batavia Street, Bouck Street (now Lafayette Avenue), named for 1840s New York State Governor William C. Bouck, was extended from the Niagara River, through the Mile Strip Reservation line, and ended at Delaware Street. Clinton Avenue (now Potomac Avenue) was initially laid out in Black Rock but was extended from Black Rock to Delaware Street in 1853.[70] A street is also indicated running roughly north-south between Ferry Street and Clinton Street. Roughly tracing the Mile Strip Reservation line, this road appeared on slightly later maps as Putnam Street (named for local land owner James O. Putnam). Bird Avenue was laid out in Black Rock in 1853, before being extended eastward to Delaware Street that same year.[71] The eastern end of Bird Avenue also formed the early entrance path into Forest Lawn Cemetery, crossing the Scajaquada Creek to arrive at the cemetery site on the north bank. Named for the thick, dense forests present in this area, Forest Avenue was the northernmost street in the 11th Ward, running just south of the Scajaquada Creek. While a roadway here was probably already in existence, the first official record of the street is dated 1855.[72]

As one of the earliest and only routes through this area of the city, Delaware Street had proven to be one of the most popular streets for the construction of large houses since the 1850s, following its extension. Many of the city's emerging business leaders had chosen to build large, stately residences on the street decades before the

[67] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 61.
[68] The Hodges may have given the street its name of Utica. In his memoir to his father, William Hodge (younger) tells a tale of how his father once walked 200 miles to Utica, NY to learn the trade of screen-making. William Hodge (younger), "The William Hodge Papers," 176, 291.
[69] *Buffalo Courier*, "Deer Shot in Utica Street," February 19, 1911.
[70] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 535.
[71] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 44-45.
[72] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 256.

creation of the Olmsted parks and parkways. Many of these properties encompassed enormous swaths of land, since the only real access point for these parcels was along Delaware Street and The Avenue (Richmond Avenue), with few other cross-streets allowing for more interior access. The character of Delaware Street as a fashionable street in Buffalo was established early on. Myron P. Bush, co-owner of the prominent Bush & Howard tanning business with George R. Howard, built one of the earliest houses on Delaware Street. In 1859, Bush purchased five acres at the northwest corner of Delaware and Summer Streets and hired architect J.D. Towle of Boston, Massachusetts to build what was considered one of the showpieces of Buffalo.[73] George R. Howard also had a prominent house on Delaware Street on land that he had purchased in 1872, with property that extended westward to The Avenue. Howard partnered with Aaron Rumsey in the prominent tannery company of Rumsey and Howard, before joining forces with Myron P. Bush. He built a massive mansarded Second Empire style house with a prominent five-story mansard tower. After his death in 1888, his property began to be sold off in smaller plots, facilitating the development of streets just north of Summer Street.[74] In 1873, Jewett M. Richmond purchased a massive lot, stretching from Delaware Avenue near Bryant Street all the way to the west, ending on The Avenue. In 1879, the street was renamed in his honor (Richmond Avenue).[75] In their houses, these men established a high level of architectural achievement, which was later emulated on a small scale by many of the middle- and upper-middle class property owners in the Elmwood Historic District.

The first New York State census to record the expanded city of Buffalo was conducted in 1855, and it provides a great deal of information on the buildings and residents of Buffalo's new 11th Ward. While this ward covered territory larger than the future Elmwood district and many of the population figures and structure information likely pertains to the more developed Black Rock neighborhood, the census information paints an interesting picture of this still lightly settled region of the city. The total population of the 11th Ward in 1855 was recorded at 3,314, with the total city population noted at 74,214 residents, making the enormous 11th Ward only 4.5 percent of the total population.[76] In comparison, the 11th Ward encompassed 2,778,900 acres of the total 25,343,576 acres of the city of Buffalo at the time; or just over 10 percent. While 1,431 people residing in the 11th Ward were born in New York State, 281 people were born outside of the state, and more than 1,600 people

[73] The house was later demolished in 1903 for the Frank H. Goodyear House. *Buffalo Times*, "Boston Architect's Famous Houses," December 10, 1926.

[74] The George R. Howard House was later torn down in 1915 for the construction of a new mansion for Grace Millard Knox, widow of Seymour H. Knox. Chuck LaChiusa, "Knox House," Knox House, 2002, accessed May 21, 2012, http://www.buffaloah.com/a/del/800/hist/index.html.

[75] Richmond's house suffered a devastating fire in 1887, but was rebuilt. It was later remodeled by Thomas B. Lockwood. Today, the Richmond-Lockwood House is listed as a contributing building in the State and National Register Delaware Avenue Historic District (NR Ref. No. 74001232). Chuck LaChiusa, "Richmond-Lockwood House," Richmond-Lockwood House, 2003, accessed May 21, 2012, http://buffaloah.com/a/del/844/tc.html.

[76] Franklin Benjamin Hough, *Census of the State of New-York, for 1855: Taken in Pursuance of Article Third of the Constitution of the State, and of Chapter Sixty-four of the Laws of 1855* (Albany: Printed by C. Van Benthuysen, 1857), xx, http://nysl.nysed.gov/Archimages/88819.PDF.

were born in another country. The majority of these foreign-born residents came from England, Ireland, Germany and Canada.[77] The census indicates that 657 families resided in the 11th Ward in 1855, and there was a total of 596 buildings. There were two churches in the ward, as well as three schools and seven grocery stores. The 11th Ward contained two hotels, and five retail stores. While this area saw widespread use for nurseries and greenhouses, 252 cows, 229 horses, 140 hogs and 57 pigs under six months of age were also tallied, suggesting that more traditional agriculture was still an important occupation.[78] It is quite a contrast: the 11th Ward retained much of its Joseph Ellicott-era Farm Lot character even as nationally significant modern-day villas were being constructed on Delaware Street.

Perhaps some of the more interesting data revealed in the detailed 1855 state census comes from the chart listing the materials and values of dwellings. While encompassing some of the stately dwellings in Black Rock, mostly along Niagara Street, the data for Buffalo's 11th Ward reveals a changing landscape. William Hodge (younger) had noted with great accuracy and detail the number of log houses in the area in the 1810s and 1820s, but a generation later in 1855, only one log house was noted remaining in the entire 11th Ward.[79]

While the 11th Ward was sparsely settled in the mid-1800s, there is some indication of who was living in the area in the1850s. Buffalo's City Directory from 1855, the same year of the state census, indicates a few residents on Summer Street, the southernmost street in the future Elmwood district. Later recollections of Summer Street indicate that the earliest houses on the street were located on the south side and served as coachman's houses attached to the large houses that fronted North Street.[80] While none of these residences were given street numbers, many of these early houses were noted as being near Delaware Street. A few houses were also noted as being located along Ferry Street, again, near Delaware Street. One of these residents was Amasa Mason, a nurseryman, whose "large and costly residence" was noted as being constructed on Ferry Street on the same property as the Oaklands Nursery in 1854.[81] In fact, many of the early residents of the area in 1855 were employed as gardeners at the large nurseries in the area. Many of the other residents listed as living in the area had no occupation listed, indicating they possibly worked off their land in some fashion.[82]

THE NEED FOR OPEN SPACE

[77] Hough, 84-90.
[78] Hough, 6-13.
[79] Hough, 233.
[80] *Buffalo Courier*, "Deer Shot in Utica Street," February 19, 1911.
[81] *The Commercial Advertiser Directory of the City of Buffalo* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Thomas and Lathrops, Publishers, 1855), 193.. Also, Barry, 189.
[82] *The Commercial Advertiser Directory of the City of Buffalo*, 153, 226.

The success of the Erie Canal created new wealth and new opportunities for residents, allowing the city to mature from its rough-scrabble pioneer existence to a society that had both the means and the opportunity for leisure and recreation. As downtown Buffalo began to swell in population in the mid-1800s, growing to more than 42,000 residents in 1850, many residents looked to the still undeveloped and unspoiled regions in the 11th Ward for their recreation and entertainment, escaping the noise and the dirt of the industrialized city. Improved roads, such as the Buffalo and Williamsville Macadam Road (now Main Street) and Delaware Street provided the primary routes for escaping the downtown core of Buffalo in the 1850s. This trend is indicative of a new way of living that was emerging in Buffalo during the 1850s.

Upon its opening in Buffalo in 1849, Forest Lawn Cemetery became one of the most popular recreation spaces. The cemetery grounds were said to have become so crowded with picnickers and visitors that the management had to sell tickets to control the crowds and maintain the consecrated space.[83] One alternative was provided by local florist Johann Westphal. Around 1849, Westphal had established a garden at his property on the east side of Delaware Avenue, just south of Forest Lawn Cemetery. Known as "Westphal's Garden," this private park became a favorite location for beer drinking and picnicking. Westphal's Garden was described:

> *From the street nothing is particularly observable but a forest of native trees, occupying a large portion of the entire territory, but when this forest is once entered upon, the visitor finds avenues and walks laid out among hills and dells, all of them beautiful and many of the entirely impervious to the sun.*[84]

Another popular picnicking site in the general area, west of Richmond Avenue, was known as Clinton's Grove or Clinton's Forest. Located at the southern corner of Forest Avenue and Grant Street, extending to Baynes Street and Bird Avenue, Clinton's Grove was another popular private park in the 1860s, owned by George DeWitt Clinton. Here it was noted that there was a large, unsheltered platform used for dancing, and people brought their lunches and beer to enjoy.[85] The emergence of these privately owned, for-profit parks and recreation areas indicates how desperate Buffalonians were for recreation and outdoor entertainment in the mid-1800s. Even parks and recreation areas that charged a fee to use and enjoy were attractive to city residents.

With increasing leisure time, the enjoyment of natural spaces became a primary concern in Buffalo during the 1860s. By the 1850s and 1860s, Buffalo had largely transitioned from its early pioneer wilderness into a booming modern, industrialized city. With the increasing noise and pollution in areas of Buffalo such as the

---

[83] David A. Gerber, "The Germans Take Care of Our Celebrations." in *Hard at Play: Leisure in America, 1840-1940*, by Kathryn Grover (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1992), 52-53. Also, *Geschichte Der Deutschen in Buffalo Und Erie County, N.Y.: Mit Biographien Und Illustrationen Hervorragender Deutsch-Amerikaner, Welche Zur Entwickelung Der Stadt Buffalo Beigetragen Haben.* (Buffalo, NY: Reinecke & Zesch, 1897), 100-101.

[84] *Buffalo Commercial Advertiser*, "A Public Park," July 16, 1856.

[85] *International Gazette*. "Clinton Grove Popular Picnic Grounds in 60's." December 27, 1930.

waterfront and east side and the growing urban density in the city's core, and out of concern for the welfare of their city, civic leaders and residents began to desire a clean, safe natural environment for recreation and enjoyment. "We know, that aside from our noble Lake and River, the suburbs of Buffalo are somewhat deficient in variety of natural scenery, the area embraced by the Cemetery grounds being a marked exception," noted an 1867 history of Forest Lawn Cemetery.[86] Buffalo was said to be facing a "poverty of rural recreation" in this era.[87] In the 1850s, the desire to establish a public park, not a park open only to subscribers, became a great source of concern. An editorial in the *Buffalo Commercial Advertiser* from 1856 noted:

> *Public grounds are of the last importance in a large and growing city like Buffalo…we should be glad to see any plan adopted by which so beautiful and capacious a park might be secured for the recreation of all inhabitants. We incline, however, to the opinion that this can only be effectually done by purchase of the property by our city authorities and converting it into a public park, free for all.*[88]

The growing aspiration to create a public park, rather than more private or subscription parks, was also inspired by the increasing spirit of reform. Buffalo's wealthy industrialists were highly influenced by a prevailing moral sense that their wealth was to be used for the larger common good, to help elevate Buffalo as an important American city. It was this sort of paternalistic theory that encouraged the development of the Buffalo park system and spurred one of the largest and most dramatic projects ever undertaken in the city of Buffalo, one that would come to define the appearance and character of the Elmwood Historic District.[89]

FREDERICK LAW OLMSTED – PARKS & PARKWAYS

At the invitation of Buffalo businessmen seeking to enhance the quality of their city, Frederick Law Olmsted overlaid his masterpiece Buffalo parks and parkways system over the area between 1868 and the 1870s. During this time, Olmsted and his partner Calvert Vaux transformed this raw land into a carefully crafted and manicured naturalistic landscape that would come to define the character of the Elmwood district as it is known today. These efforts were realized in not just a single park, but in an interconnected network of parks and parkways, a park system. The plan for the Buffalo park system, known as the Delaware-Front Park system, was drawn by 1870 and substantially completed by 1876. The results of these efforts manifested not only in the physical presence of the parks, but also the creation of a framework for future development. In laying out this new park system, Olmsted established an armature that would inspire, shape, and determine the development

---

[86] *Forest Lawn: Its History, Dedications, Progress, Regulations, Names of Lot Holders,* 119.
[87] *Eleventh Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1881* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1881), 76.
[88] *Buffalo Commercial Advertiser*, "A Public Park," July 16, 1856.
[89] Francis R. Kowsky, "Municipal Parks and City Planning: Frederick Law Olmsted's Buffalo Park and Parkway System," *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* 46, no. 1 (March 1987): 50, JSTOR.

that would occur in the district henceforth, encouraging the settlement patterns that are still present in the Elmwood Historic District today.

This extensive system of small parks linked with landscaped roads and a larger city park would create interconnectivity between many parts of the city, centered on the Elmwood Historic District. Olmsted's plan also created a framework, like that originally created by Joseph Ellicott, for a region of the city that had grown without a plan through the nineteenth century, improving access and encouraging development. Olmsted's scheme envisioned three parks in the city's 11th Ward, The Park (now Delaware Park) being the largest, with The Front (now Front Park) along the Niagara River, with The Parade (later Humboldt Park, now Martin Luther King, Jr. Park) to the east. These major parks were designed to serve as primary nodes, connected by an intricate system of parkways and circles. Together, these parkways and circles form what historian Francis Kowsky has termed "sylvan tributaries" running throughout the city.[90] This citywide park system was designed to be accessible to all, and thus the plan not only embraced neighborhoods that had already developed but also joined them to areas that Olmsted and Vaux predicted would become populated over time.

The crowning centerpiece of this elaborate park system is The Park (Delaware Park), which was established on 350 acres of land just north of Forest Lawn Cemetery. To create a naturalistic landscape, The Park incorporated an area that Olmsted and Vaux termed "greensward," meaning rolling meadowland dotted with trees, and also a 46-acre lake. The greensward was ringed by a density of trees, typical of Olmstedian designs, which was intended to insulate the park against the city beyond. A series of bridal paths, carriage drives and footpaths wound through the park. Like he had done at Central Park, pedestrian travel was separated from the carriages to create a safe, relaxing environment for all.[91] Olmsted was attracted to the existing natural features in the area where he established The Park. While he appreciated the natural lay of the land, he was also enticed by the park-like Forest Lawn Cemetery. Olmsted used the expanse of trees and meadow at Forest Lawn as a visual southern extension of The Park, blurring the lines between the two naturalistic elements.[92]

Beyond just the creation of natural landscapes for recreation, Olmsted's plan shaped the development of this region of Buffalo. Perhaps most significant is that his design finally reconciled the criss-crossed Black Rock and Ellicott street grids, a generation after Black Rock was subsumed into the city of Buffalo. Located outside the existing population centers of Cold Spring, Black Rock and downtown, The Park was deliberately located by Olmsted where the land was vacant and inexpensive, yet he wanted The Park to be accessible to all and joined it to these existing centers with new parkways embracing areas which he knew would become populated over time. Olmsted defined parkways (a term he coined) as "broad thoroughfares planted with trees and designed

[90] Kowsky, "Municipal Parks and City Planning," 56.
[91] Kowsky, "Municipal Parks and City Planning," 52-53.
[92] Kowsky, "Municipal Parks and City Planning," 53.

with special reference to recreation as well as for common traffic."[93] For these parkways Olmsted both created new roads and also built on existing streets, creating an approach to the primary city park through a hierarchy of streets, from stately 100-foot wide avenues to broader 200-foot wide parkways to an even more grandiose 400-foot wide parkway leading to The Park. At the intersection of York, North and Rogers Street, near the sites of what had been the former Black Rock Burial Grounds and the Buffalo "Pest House," Olmsted created The Circle (now Symphony Circle). Olmsted reconfigured Rogers Street (now Richmond Avenue), north of The Circle, as The Avenue, underscoring his vision for the roadway as one of the most prominent approaches to The Park from the south. His plan for The Avenue widened the existing carriageway and planted it with a double-row of elm trees on either side. Where the original Rogers Street had terminated at Ferry Street, Olmsted created Ferry Circle, beyond which he extended the path of the street northward through unimproved land. Where The Avenue intersected with Bidwell Parkway, Olmsted designed Bidwell Place (now Colonial Circle), a spacious rectangular shaped area. Bidwell Parkway linked the western elements of the plan, while Chapin Parkway similarly linked to components on the eastern side. Both were established as 200-foot wide parkways with a broad, tree-lined central median for horseback riders and pedestrians, with a roadway on either side. Where these two parkways met, Olmsted created Soldier's Place, a generous 700-foot diameter circle.

Emerging from the north side of the circle was Lincoln Parkway, perhaps the most gracious of the streets designed by Olmsted, envisioned as a gateway to The Park. Lincoln Parkway was designed with a broad central road, divided from smaller access roads by a grassy, treed strip of land.[94] Separate pathways were provided for pedestrians, carriages, and later, automobiles, creating a distinctive design that is both aesthetically pleasing and effective for regulating traffic patterns on this residential street. Connecting Soldier's Place to the Gala Waters (now Hoyt Lake) and, eventually, the Albright Art Museum, Lincoln Parkway attracted some of the wealthiest citizens of the city, who erected large mansions in the early 1900s.[95] Today, Lincoln Parkway still retains much of the original character, plantings and naturalistic elements of Olmsted's original plan.

The park system that Olmsted and Vaux designed in Buffalo effectively brought the influence of sophisticated European urban planning to what, at the time, was a rural hinterland. Influenced by the work done by Georges-Eugene Haussmann in his bold redesign of the streets of Paris between 1853 and 1870, in designing a similar network of formalized boulevards, broad vistas, and terminal monuments in Buffalo's northern regions, Olmsted defined this former farm and nursery outskirts area as an attractive, civilized, cultured area to be enjoyed by all. Olmsted worked to integrate earlier elements of Joseph Ellicott's plan for the city, linking many of the new streets and parkways to Ellicott's preexisting ones and extending and expanding Ellicott's vision of two generations before. Olmsted appreciated the early plan of Ellicott, itself influenced by grand European

[93] Quoted in Kowsky, "Municipal Parks and City Planning, 58.
[94] Kowsky, "Municipal Parks and City Planning," 58.
[95] The Albright Art Museum became the Albright Knox Art Museum in YEAR.

models. Olmsted built off of Ellicott's 1804 plan to create one large, comprehensive plan that united both the settled areas of the city with the new areas as well, setting the stage for the growth and character of the future Elmwood district. Olmsted and Vaux were so thrilled with the accomplishments in Buffalo that they exhibited their Buffalo parks and parkways plan at the 1876 Centennial Exposition in Philadelphia, where Olmsted noted that Buffalo was "the best planned city, as to its streets, public places and grounds in the United States, if not the world."[96] Thus, the stage was set for the development of the character of the Elmwood Historic District.

While obviously focused on the design and structure of the parks and parkways themselves, Olmsted also envisioned the larger impact these features could have on the surrounding areas. Olmsted's placement of the parks in the undeveloped 11th Ward was not merely because of the availability of vacant land, but was also done with an eye for encouraging the growth and development in Buffalo's northern areas at a time when the populations was growing dramatically. Olmsted was a firm believer that parks and parkways improved the quality of life in cities, both for living and working, stating:

> *A park fairly well managed near a large town, will surely become a new centre of that town...It is a common error to regard a park as something produced complete in itself, as a picture to be painted on a canvas. It should rather be planned as one to be done in fresco, with constant consideration of exterior objects, some of them quite at a distance and even existing as yet only in the imagination of the painter.*[97]

While some residential growth was occurring in the future Elmwood district already by the 1860s, the placement of the parks was a deliberate attempt to stimulate and encourage residential development in the area. Olmsted envisioned creating neighborhoods much like his parks, with a new sense of spaciousness and openness lacking in the densely developed urban center to the south. Olmsted saw the development of freestanding houses with yards and space as parts of a new model for nineteenth-century residential living, compared to the crowded tenement-type housing found in older regions of cities. The park and parkways system in Buffalo was inherently designed to be integrated into this new model of residential living, fostering the growth of a suburban area. Olmsted was keenly aware of the influence of the park system on residential growth, intentionally setting the stage for the future Elmwood Historic District to become one of Buffalo's most fashionable and desirable new residential neighborhoods.

Like Ellicott more than 60 years before, Olmsted inspired the city of Buffalo to create a park system plan not only for use by the current residents, but with consideration for future generations as well. Olmsted's vision for

[96] Quoted in Kowsky, "Municipal Parks and City Planning," 49.
[97] Quoted in Kowsky, "Municipal Parks and City Planning," 62.

the park influenced city leaders and the Buffalo Park Commissioners, who noted in their *Second Annual Report* from 1872,

> *The Act of the Legislature requires us, in selecting and locating the lands, to have 'in view the present condition and future growth and wants of the city.' The plans which were adopted were meant to meet this double purpose – not to be beyond our present ability, and yet to be sufficient for the future.*[98]

The report continues:

> *To another generation, the Park will be the object of municipal price, and will be associated with the holiday pleasures of the people, and it is hardly worthwhile to speculate as to the expenditure which will then be cheerfully made for its improvement and ornamentation.*[99]

That residents were already attracted to the new parks while they were still under construction was an indication of how hungry Buffalonians were for a public recreation ground.[100] Buffalo park commissioners and Olmsted were correct in their assumption that former undeveloped farm lands near the parks and parkways would increase in value. A review of maps of the city from 1866, prior to the development of the parks, and from 1872, reflects how popular the Elmwood district became in just a few short years. The *Map of a Part of the City of Buffalo*, created by surveyor Peter Emslie in 1866, depicts the 11th Ward area as sparsely settled east of Black Rock. While this atlas does not show parcel boundaries or note individual owners in most cases, it does give a good impression of the general density of areas of the city and those streets that were developed at the time. Delaware Street had several buildings indicated, and Ferry Street was also fairly well developed. Summer Street and Bryant Street had a few buildings recorded, but were still fairly open. Other streets showed were noted as having no buildings constructed on them, and generally the area of the future Elmwood district was undeveloped. The 1866 atlas image does depict the development of new roads in this part of Buffalo. Here, Elmwood Avenue is now visible. Elmwood Avenue consisted of several various street segments, gradually connected together, but the portion of the street located in the Elmwood district had its origins in 1854, when it was laid out between Ferry Street and the Gulf Road (Delavan Avenue) and named Oakland Avenue. On the 1866 map, south of Ferry Street, Elmwood Avenue is noted extending to Butler Street (now Lexington Avenue) and from Utica Street to Bryant Street, but is a vague dotted line between Butler Street and Utica Street, and near Summer Street. This indicates that the road had not yet been run through these blocks, as Elmwood Avenue cut through several of the nurseries in this area. The road may have existed as an informal path though the nursery grounds but was not connected until later. Ashland Avenue, an informal road laid out in the 1850s, and

---

[98] *Second Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1872* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Warren, Johnson &, 1872), 11.
[99] *Second Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners*, 12.
[100] *First Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January, 1871.* (Buffalo: Warren, Johnson &, 1871), 13.

Oakland Place (not to be confused with the original name of a portion of Elmwood Avenue, this route corresponds to the current street), both of which ran from Summer Street to Ferry Street, also has a similar dotted indication, signifying that these new north-south thoroughfares were not well established in the 1860s prior to the creation of the park system. These roads may also have been private roads, not open to the public.[101] In the Elmwood Historic District (East), Oakland Place provides an excellent example of the new street development that continued to occur after the installation of the park system in the district. Formerly laid out in 1887 and paved in 1888, Oakland Place provided a new north-south street that was quickly developed, with several upscale residences appearing within the same year.[102]

As soon as 1872, the vacant land in the area of the parks was already noted in the park reports as being in demand, and many new roads were introduced in the area. The *Atlas of the City of Buffalo*, published in 1872, reflects this phenomenon. On plates for the 11th Ward there is clear visual evidence that the tracts of land once owned by Buffalo's pioneers are in the process of being sub-divided and parceled into smaller plots. While the Elmwood district is portrayed as still only having a few residences constructed in the 1870s, primarily in the southern portion of the district, much of the land has been divided into smaller parcels, suitable for the construction of houses, rather than the farm tracts which had proceeded. The large tracts given over for use as nurseries have disappeared by this point, indicative that this land was now more valuable for development.[103] Olmsted's streets and parkways were established by this point, noted as being generally open while work continued on planting and finishing. In 1872, The Avenue (Richmond Avenue) was established, running from The Circle (Symphony Circle) north to Bidwell Place (Colonial Circle). North of Bidwell Place, Rogers Street continues to Forest Avenue. Elmwood Avenue ran from Butler Street (Lexington Avenue) north to Delavan Avenue. The rapid physical transformation of Elmwood shown between 1866 and 1872 reflects the growth of real estate speculation in the area. Because of the new desirability of the area, Buffalo Park Commissioners feared that the development of new streets in the area would be haphazard and irregular, ruining the orderly Olmstedian vision for the region. From a financial perspective, they were also concerned with maintaining and increasing the value of land around the parkways, as they informed the Common Council in their report.

> *The vacant lands in the vicinity of the Parks are eagerly sought after. New buildings are constantly being erected, and our population is gradually but steadily creeping towards its borders. With this fact in view it may not be amiss to call the attention of your honorable body to the importance of causing a survey to be made of the whole northern and eastern portion of the city, with the view of*

[101] "Map of a Part of the City of Buffalo**,"** from *New Topographical Atlas of Erie County, N. Y. From Actual Surveys Especially for This Atlas.* (Philadelphia: Stone & Stewart, 1866).
[102] Martin Wachadlo and Charles LaChiusa, *Oakland Place: Gracious Living in Buffalo* (Buffalo: Buffalo Heritage Unlimited, 2006), 7.
[103] "Parts of the Eleventh and Twelfth Wards," and "Part of the Eleventh Ward," plates from G.M. Hopkins & Co., comp., *Atlas of the City of Buffalo, Erie County, New York* (Philadelphia: Edward Busch, 1872).

> *having the streets so laid out as to harmonize with a general system, with the Parks and their approaches as the objective points. It is not too soon now to block out the vacant lands within the city limits and mark the lines of streets which must at no distant day be required for the section of the city…The adoption of some general plan as here indicated would enhance the value of the land and bring it speedily into marker, soon to be occupied by suburban homes.*[104]

The establishment of the Buffalo parks and parkways system in Buffalo marked an important turning point in the history of the city's northern fringes. Their development marks the close of the early development history of the region, which persisted into the mid-nineteenth century, and the beginning of the maturation of the city of Buffalo on the national stage. The development of the parks marks the start of a period of rapid growth and settlement that took place in the Elmwood district area in the 1880s and 1890s, setting its configuration and character to high standards.

BUFFALO STATE ASYLUM

The third major development to occur in the 11th Ward during this era that helped shape the Elmwood District was the project for the Buffalo State Asylum for the Insane. Known by different names over the course of its existence (including Buffalo State Hospital, the Buffalo Psychiatric Center, and currently the Richardson-Olmsted Complex), this project was a large undertaking that had a dramatic impact on shaping and taming the landscape at the area north of the 11th Ward. A break-out project designed by soon-to-be nationally prominent architect Henry Hobson Richardson on grounds designed by Frederick Law Olmsted, the Buffalo State Asylum helped to establish the high standard of architecture set amidst an enveloping designed landscape for the Elmwood area. With Forest Lawn Cemetery and the Olmsted parks system, notably The Park, the establishment of the Buffalo State Asylum also helped to shape what would become the northern boundary and the essential character of the Elmwood Historic District.

While the Buffalo State Asylum created a notable architectural feature in the landscape of the 11th Ward, the grounds of the hospital also were a significant new addition to the area. The grounds were surveyed by Marsden Davey in 1870 and designed by Frederick Law Olmsted between 1871 and 1881, with later improvements and refinements made between 1881 and 1899.[105] The grounds promoted Thomas Kirkbride's philosophy of the therapeutic landscape, where ample natural light, fresh air and healthy activity were thought to improve the physical and mental wellbeing of the patients. This concept of open space and a natural landscape promoting health and well-being was influential in the development of open, single-family houses in the Elmwood Historic

[104] Quoted from *Third Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1873* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Warren, Johnson &, 1873), 11.
[105] Heritage Landscapes, *Cultural Landscape Report: The Richardson Olmsted Complex, Buffalo NY*, report (October 2008), 1-2.

District. With the completion of the Buffalo State Hospital buildings and grounds, the final piece of the framing element of the edges of the Elmwood Historic District was in place. While the grounds of the hospital formed a barrier for development, the building's twin towers created a significant visual landmark on the horizon that is as recognizable today as it was in the nineteenth century.

The decades between the 1850s and the 1880s saw the dramatic transformation of this region of Buffalo from the natural to the naturalistic. The natural environment was the area that the early pioneers and settlers encountered in northern Buffalo in its earliest phases. The establishment of the nurseries during the 1840s and 1850s was the first stage towards the creation of a naturalistic landscape in the future Elmwood district. Naturalistic can here be defined as a man-made landscape that intended to imitate or create the effect or appearance of nature, or paraphrasing how Olmsted described his work, art completing nature. This transition marked the increasing sophistication of not only the city of Buffalo as a whole, but also of the Elmwood Historic District area as well, transitioning from the pioneer era to the high design and high-mindedness of a world-class city. Taken together, Forest Lawn Cemetery, The Park (Delaware Park) and the Buffalo State Asylum created a carefully manicured, naturalistic greensward, to use a term invented by Olmsted himself, of over 500-acres in the northern region of Buffalo.

With these three elements in place, by the 1870s and 1880s the boundaries of the Elmwood district had largely been established. The Allentown neighborhood around North Street, to the south, was reaching its capacity following the Civil War era. Black Rock and the Mile Strip Reservation to the west had rapidly developed beginning in the 1820s and 1830s following the success of the Erie Canal. The Cold Spring neighborhood, developed along both sides of Main Street, had become a thriving population center in northern Buffalo since the early settlement era. Delaware Street (later Avenue), extended northward beginning in 1842, also helped encourage early growth and development along this primary spine. With the creation of the cemetery, parks and parkways system and asylum, the northern borders of the future Elmwood district had been defined. What was remaining inside of these borders was an empty canvas ready for development.

Not only were the physical parameters of the Elmwood district established, but the character of what this Elmwood district neighborhood would become was also created in this period. The nurseries in the area helped establish this region of the city as a lush and protective naturalistic landscape, filled with manicured flowering trees and exotic plants, and sophisticated modern greenhouses. The future character of the neighborhood had already been elevated by the elegant plans of Olmsted and the creation of The Avenue, Bidwell and Chapin Parkways, the circles and other elements in the area. These new, improved roads designed by Olmsted encouraged modern, more efficient modes of transportation in and around the Elmwood area, which encouraged and enabled residential districts to be separated in space from manufacturing and commercial areas but still be in proximity to them. Already an area buffered and removed from the industrial areas such as Black Rock, the

Hydraulics and Buffalo's East Side, the Elmwood Historic District was an area well-suited for the gracious, open residential neighborhood envisioned by Olmsted, a therapeutic landscape for the industrial-era family. While Olmsted may not have developed a comprehensive plan for the Elmwood neighborhood, as he later did for Parkside, his parks and parkways helped to plant the seeds for the future character of the neighborhood by establishing an armature and a standard that encouraged its development as a beautiful, naturalistic, healthy and desirable residential area for the latter half of the nineteenth century.

STREETCARS AND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN BUFFALO, 1860-1890

In 1860, a new mode of transportation was established in the 11th Ward that encouraged and aided travel to and from the area. While the majority of travelers to the cemetery or the private parks took their own personal farm wagons or carriages in the 1850s, the cost of maintaining the vehicles and horses was an expense that not all Buffalonians could afford. As a result, walking was the primary means of travel in the first half of the nineteenth century, even among the middle and upper classes, and many people necessarily resided in close proximity to their places of business and shops. The 1860 establishment of a horse car line created a new transportation option in the city. The Buffalo Street Railroad commenced operations on Main Street on June 17, 1860. This line extended from "the Dock" at the Buffalo Creek northward to Edward Street by June 11th and was continued on to Cold Spring (likely terminating at the intersection of Main and Ferry Streets) on July 14, 1860. [106] Already by the mid-1860s, the impact of the horse car systems was felt in Buffalo:

> *A very material addition to the comfort and convenience of our citizens has been made by the Street Railroads. They have rendered distant parts of the city readily and cheaply accessible, and have correspondingly enhanced the value of lands outside its more settled limits.*[107]

One of the biggest challenges towards realizing the vision and potential for the park and parkways system as a place of social and economic egalitarianism was in the relative lack of accessibility. While Olmsted had promoted accessibility to the already-populated centers with the design of his parkway system, linked into the existing street systems in the future Elmwood district area, it was still a difficult, expensive and tedious trip from the more settled areas of the city to the distant northern area. Already by 1873, just a few short years after construction of the parks began, the Buffalo Park Commissioners made a plea to the city for improved public access to the parks. In their *Fourth Annual Report*, made in January of 1874, the commissioners reported that many of the visitors to the park arrived in private carriages, sometimes as many as 1,000 a day, but many people walked from the horse car station at Cold Spring. However, they noted, the walk was long and could be

[106] Larned, Vol 1, 145-148.
[107] Sanford B. Hunt, *The Manufacturing Interests of the City of Buffalo including Sketches of the History of Buffalo : With Notices of Its Principal Manufacturing Establishments.* (Buffalo: C.F.S. Thomas, 1866), 24.

especially difficult in inclement weather. "A cheap and convenient line of stages or a branch from the horse car lines would be a great boon to this class," the report noted.[108]

Improvements to the transportation system did not take long. The horse car line was extended from Cold Spring to The Park in 1879, providing an easier and more affordable means of traveling to and from the park. The Buffalo Street Railroad also opened additional lines in the area, including a Ferry Street line in 1885 and a Forest Avenue line that connected to The Park in 1888.[109] These lines helped to open up access between the downtown, Black Rock and East Side neighborhoods to the 11th Ward and the Elmwood district, which only a decade before had been seen as a distant region. For the Elmwood Historic District, the most significant improvement to Buffalo's streetcar system was the establishment of a horse car line on Elmwood Avenue. Opened on July 1, 1889, this horse-drawn line ran from Virginia Street to Forest Avenue and immediately began to improve access to the park.[110] This line also dramatically opened up the still largely vacant land in Buffalo's 11th Ward for development, ushering in the era of dramatic real estate sales and speculation. Nearly immediately following its opening, advertisements began to appear marketing the new "Elmwood district" to prospective house builders and purchasers, marking the start of a boom in real estate.

Vast improvements were made to streetcar transportation in the late decades of the 1800s. The first experimental electric streetcar service was established on the line from Main Street and Michigan Avenue to Delaware Park, via Harvard Place, Delevan, Delaware and Forest Avenues in 1889 and was noted as being an immediate success. [111] The entire line of streetcars was converted to electric power beginning in 1891 and progressed quickly in the ensuing years.[112] Elmwood Avenue's line transitioned to electric service in 1892. The new electrified cars provided several benefits to travelers, as compared to the horse-drawn cars. The electric cars travelled more quickly, which meant that people could travel greater distances in an equal amount of time. Thus, people could live further away from their place of employment, making Elmwood increasingly attractive for residential growth. At the time, most workers worked and lived, often in tenements, "downtown," but as their income and opportunities began to increase, they were able to afford single-family houses.

At nearly the same time, the New York Central Railroad established a line that circled the city of Buffalo, known as the Belt Line. The New York Central Railroad had operated a track in the northern area of Buffalo in 1880, known as the Niagara Falls Branch, which operated a station on Main Street, near the present Jewett Avenue. However, the New York Central's expansion in 1882, which nearly encircled the city, was an attempt

---

[108] *Fourth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1874* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Warren, Johnson &, 1874), 19.
[109] Larned, Vol 1, 145-148.
[110] *Twentieth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1890* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Courier Company, Printers, 1890), 32.
[111] D. David. Bregger, *Buffalo's Historic Streetcars and Buses* (Charleston, SC: Arcadia Pub., 2008), 9.
[112] Larned, Vol 1, 148.

by the railroad to decentralize the industrial development that was occurring on the east side and create connections to factories in other locations in Buffalo.[113] Tracks cut through largely unsettled areas of the city, running north of The Park and Forest Lawn Cemetery. Stations convenient to the parks in the northern areas of the city were located at Central Park, near Main Street and Amherst Street, and on Delaware Street, north of the park. On December 24, 1890 a permanent electric streetcar line was opened on Main Street, running from Cold Spring and the New York Central Railroad Belt Line station near Jewett Avenue.[114] This connected the passenger service of the Belt Line with the street car system, and allowed for better access to the park area. The Olmsted-designed park gave the railroad a reason for being in this area of the city.

LARGE ESTATES, 1885-1920s

At the same time that the dense, streetcar suburb style development was occurring on commoditized lots in the western portion of the district, many of the new residential developments in the Elmwood Historic District (East) were large, wealthy estates. Although these developments emerged somewhat contemporaneously, the history of the eastern portion of the district contains a greater amount of mansions and large estates than the west, resulting in a different settlement pattern. The presence of these large residential estates in the Elmwood Historic District (East) appears to correlate to this area's adjacency to the large Delaware Avenue estates of the very wealthy, located to the immediate east of the nominated district. Beginning in the 1880s, these estates were established on lots that were carved out and pieced together from earlier farm lots, thereby influencing future settlement patterns in the district for decades to come.

The Elmwood Historic District (East) was uniquely situated at the juncture of two prestigious areas of the city, making the district particularly attractive to wealthy citizens who were looking to establish their new, large estates on prime real estate at the end of the nineteenth century. First, the establishment of Olmsted's park system in the 1870s made properties near the new park system especially desirable in the decades that followed, not only for their convenient access to these green spaces but also for the prominent social and economic status associated with these expensive areas. The proximity to the Olmsted park system, in combination with the availability of large plots of land and the new construction of roads, led to the establishment of several wealthy estates in Elmwood Historic District (East) in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. Secondly, wealthy citizens were also attracted the district for of its proximity to the city's elite, who resided in the adjacent 'Millionaire's Row' district to the East. Although distinct and separate from the Elmwood Historic District, 'Millionaire's Row' provided an instant status boost to properties located east of Elmwood Avenue. Occupying several blocks along Delaware Avenue, Millionaire's Row included several prominent mansions, the largest of which were located mostly between Summer Street and West Ferry Street. In an effort to situate one's residence

[113] Mark Goldman, *High Hopes: The Rise and Decline of Buffalo, New York* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1983), 178.

as close to the aristocratic prestige of 'Millionaire's Row' as possible, wealthy citizens constructed large estates on Summer Street, Bryant Street and West Ferry Street, radiating eastward from Elmwood Avenue towards Delaware Avenue. The combination of these two regions, both prestigious, drew some of the city's wealthiest citizens to the Elmwood Historic District (East) during the last decades of the twentieth century.

In contrast to the middle and middle-upper class houses that appeared in the Elmwood Historic District (West), the large estates that populated the Elmwood Historic District (East) belonged to an even wealthier class of residents. Although these large estates had an indelible impact on the character of the Elmwood Historic District (East), the exact definition of 'estate' is somewhat elusive. The usage of this term is diverse, and can be similarly applied to both a sprawling country property in seventeenth century Britain or a late-nineteenth century residential property on the outskirts of Buffalo. Despite the presence of this term throughout history, "no one has really managed thus far to produce a typology of estates, which would recognize their diversity and allows us to make meaningful comparisons and identify significant differences across time and space."[115] While the term does span across several centuries and countries, the word 'estate' can still refer to a few key, core qualities of this kind of real estate, common throughout all estates.

Although there is no specific lot size or house size that defines an estate, the term commonly describes "an extensive and contiguous or near continuous area of land, owned as absolute private property by an individual."[116] An estate is generally comprised of two main units, which include both "a central mansion and garden, and an accompanying park or 'home farm.'"[117] Beyond these basic components, however, the true nature of an estate lies in its relationship to status, both financially and socially. The visible stature of an estate, conveyed through both a large mansion and extensive grounds, is, as architectural historian James Ackerman acknowledges, an expression of power that "reinforces and justifies its social and economic structure and its privileged position within."[118] Historian Louise Mozingo echoes this interpretation, stating, "The scale and opulence of an estate testifies to an incontrovertibly prestigious status and operates as a lavish stand in for myriad dispersed properties." [119] Estates, then, intentionally reference power, status, wealth and privilege, rendered in physical form through building materials and landscape design. By this definition, the Elmwood Historic District (East) contained several large estates during the last two decades of the nineteenth century. The large mansions and sprawling grounds situated on the eastern edge of the district were large estates that

---

[114] Bregger, 9.
[115] Jonathan Finch and Catherine Giles, *Estate Landscapes: Design, Improvement and Power in the Post-Medieval Landscape* (Woodbridge, UK: Boyell Press, 2007), 2.
[116] Finch and Giles, 1.
[117] Finch and Giles, 2.
[118] James Ackerman, *The Villa: The form and Ideology of Country Houses* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1990), 10.
[119] Louise Mozingo, *Pastoral Capitalism: A History of Corporate Landscapes* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2011), 103.

expressed this condensation of power and influence, attesting to the considerable wealth and prestige of the residents who lived there.

The division between urban life and suburban or rural life was of popular concern during this time. As industrial cities became increasingly congested and polluted, many were captivated by visions of an alternative life outside the central city. Formed partly in reaction to the industrialization process, popular taste at the time was guided by prominent thinkers such as Andrew Jackson Downing, whose 1850 work *The Architecture of Country Houses* influenced several generations to come. Similarly, architect Henry Hudson Holly identified this phenomenon in *Holly's Country Seats* in 1863, stating "though compelled to spend the business hours of the day in the city, they gladly hasten when those are over to peaceful homes, removed from the bustle and turmoil of the crowded town."[120] Holly, directly influenced by Downing, viewed this trend optimistically, reflecting "taste has improved greatly since the days of Downing...many young Americans of intelligence and culture are studying and assuming its values."[121] Influenced by this kind of taste-making literature, wealthy citizens came to view the city as a dirty, debase place, and instead retreated to a quieter residential setting at the end of their workday.

Transportation improvements also played an important role in this exodus, as roads, trolleys and streetcar lines became increasingly efficient, convenient, and affordable. As transportation access to the city opened up new areas of Buffalo for development, businessmen increasingly settled just outside the city lines in areas where more land was available for purchase, including the Elmwood Historic District.[122] Holly noted the direct relationship between transportation improvements and new settlement patterns: "This manner of living is becoming very popular, especially among the business community....So many are ready to avail themselves of this rapid transit that we see studded along the lines of our railroads picturesque and cheerful homes."[123] In Buffalo, this manifests quite clearly in the Elmwood Historic District (West), particularly in the houses that begin appearing in great numbers along Elmwood Avenue and nearby on streets like Ashland Avenue. Yet these houses were still situated in relatively close proximity to one another in comparison to the estates that appeared in the eastern portion of the district. In the eastern portion of the district, the city's wealthy aristocracy was able to erect larger residences on more extensive grounds, reminiscent of Holly's vision of a 'country' life on the outskirts on the city.

---

[120] Henry Hudson Holly, *Holly's Country Seats: Containing Lithographic Designs for Cottages, Villas, Mansions, etc. with Their Accompanying Outbuildings* (London, UK: D. Appleton, 1863), 21.
[121] Holly, 24.
[122] For more on this, see "Streetcar Suburbs in the United States"
[123] Holly, 21.

Reflecting both the immense wealth of these residents and their desire to live in a decidedly un-urban setting, many of these tracts resembled carefully manicured 'estate parks' that were reminiscent of Olmsted's public park system nearby. Several estates were even designed by professional landscape architects, reflecting the widespread belief that an aesthetically pleasing environment could elevate one's physical and mental health. Attesting to the relative wealth of these residents, Holly insists that the planning of an estate's grounds is "something so peculiar and intricate that none but a professional can do it justice."[124] Far more than simply gardening, he suggested, was required in order to create a "truly harmonized setting."[125] For property owners wealthy enough to replicate Olmsted's visions on their own land, these estate parks demonstrated both their social prestige as well as the broader popularity of these beliefs during the late nineteenth century.

Larger lots and more elaborate houses appeared in the eastern portion of the district than in the west, more easily evoking some of Holly's depictions of an ideal residential setting. Holly's vision of this kind of residential scene testifies to the expansive kind of wealth required to establish this kind of estate, where, he believes, *"the heads of families are not only recuperating from the deleterious effects of city life, but are, with the aid of fresh air and wholesome food, laying the foundation for greater strength and increased happiness for their children."*[126] Holly envisioned a residential estate as not only an escape from the city, but also as a method for 'laying a foundation' for future generations. Encouraging the wealthy aristocracy to consider their estate as an investment that would extend beyond their own lifetime, Holly compared the establishment of a family estate to the planting of a tree: "People who build [in this manner] are often like those who plant trees, whose full luxuriance they themselves can never expect to enjoy; and the children who come after them reap the benefit of the generous forethought."[127] Establishing this kind of inheritance, in the form of extensive, private real estate development, was likely beyond the means of most people during the mid-to-late nineteenth century.

For those who could afford to do so, establishing a family estate was best achieved, in Holly's terms, by a process he called "clubbing." Rather than purchasing a single property for the head of household, a family, or a group of families, would often band together in order to expand the scope of their real estate holdings. Holly describes this method, stating "It is by a number of families clubbing together, and procuring an attractive spot...which, by mutual agreements and some slight restrictions, can be laid out in a picturesque manner for building."[128] This process occurred in several large estates in the Elmwood Historic District (East), where some of Buffalo's wealthiest families, such as the Albrights, the Goodyears and the Larkins, purchased several lots and effectively combined them into one large property. Some of these estates were located directly adjacent to

[124] Holly, 30.
[125] Holly, 31.
[126] Holly, 21.
[127] Holly, 27.
[128] Holly, 22.

the mansions on Delaware Avenue, effectively creating a region comprised of some of the city's most elite citizens that spanned both the Elmwood District and the Delaware Avenue district.

Unlike the streetcar suburb style of development that was occurring west of Elmwood at this time, these large estates prevented any other kind of substantial development immediately adjacent to the mansions owned by the wealthy elite. In these estates, one's 'neighbor' was often a member of one's family, or a closely related family, instead of a stranger. Holly described this strategy, stating "if each one takes pains to keep up his own place and contributes to the care of the roads, he enjoys the advantages of cultivated surroundings as if the whole were his private estate."[129] Whether owned by a directly related family member, a colleague or friend, these estates provided a sense of security for their property investment, ensuring a stable community would persist even amidst the rapid change occurring in other parts of the district.

One of the first, and most prominent, estates in the Elmwood Historic District (East) was that of John J. Albright, a local entrepreneur and philanthropist whose name still exists in Buffalo today at the Albright Knox Art Gallery. After achieving great financial success in the coal industry, Albright purchased a large tract of land that stretched from Elmwood Avenue to Delaware Avenue between what was then an unpaved Cleveland Street (now Cleveland Avenue) and West Ferry Street. From 1885-1926, the Albright family established one of the most notable, and largest, estates in the district's history. Spanning a transformative period for the Elmwood Historic District (East), the Albright family occupied this property from 1885, the dawn of a period of rapid growth for the district, into the next era of automobile driven development for the region in the mid-1920s.

In the first twenty years of this property's history, Albright carved out a sizeable, valuable plot of land for his family estate, which he acquired through a series of purchases. From 1885 to 1905, he bought property from James and Catherine Adams, Frederick and Amelia Lautz, and the City of Buffalo in order to create a 15-acre estate that took up almost the entire block. During this time, the Elmwood district was quickly becoming a very desirable place for the upper and upper middle classes to live. Albright recognized this potential and made an excellent investment, carving out a luxurious amount of property for his family at a time when these kinds of large purchases were about to become much more rare in the decades of development to come.

Albright moved into the former Adams residence there at 730 West Ferry in 1885, accompanied by his wife Harriet and his three young children, Raymond, Ruth and Langdon. The property's preexisting residence had formerly served as the residence of Charles Wadsworth, followed by James and Catherine Adams in 1882, who moved in the same year that James had had formed the Buffalo General Electric Company.[130] The Gothic

[129] Holly, 27.
[130] *A History of the City of Buffalo: Its Men and Institutions; Biographical Sketches of Leading Citizens* (Buffalo, NY: Buffalo Evening News Press, 1908), 114.

Revival residence featured a crenellated tower, steeply pitched roof and ornamental bargeboards that were indicative of the style. Albright and his family lived in this mansion for several decades, from 1885-1901, during which time they also continued to acquire more surrounding acres of land. During his time in this house, Albright fulfilled many civic roles, including his new investments at Nichols School and the Lackawanna Steel Company, his position as President of the Pan American Exposition committee, and his founding of what would soon become the Albright Art Gallery (now Albright Knox Art Gallery). During his time at this Gothic Revival house at 730 West Ferry Street, Albright had also witnessed the death of his wife, and later married his second wife, Susan Gertrude Fuller, with whom he had five more children. By the turn of the century, just before the Pan-American Exposition, Albright had managed to acquire nearly the entire 15 acres that would henceforth be known as his estate, and created an indelible mark on the city through both his public pursuits and his private property holdings.

When his residence at 730 West Ferry Street was destroyed by a fire in 1901, Albright hired the renowned architect E.B. Green to design his new house.[131] By 1901, the surrounding Elmwood district was bustling with new development, much more than had characterized the neighborhood when Albright first established his property 15 years ago. Construction on E.B. Green's design was completed by 1903, and Albright was able to move into his new mansion. The large size of the residence can be glimpsed in the staff required to run it, which included five maids, two cooks, seven gardeners, one laundress and a chauffeur.[132] Positioned with a deeper front setback than the previous house, the two-and-a-half story stone mansion was built in the Tudor Revival style. E.B. Green's design was inspired by the sixteenth-century mansion at St. Catherine's Court in Bath, England, and the West Ferry façade similarly featured a centered entrance pavilion and two front gabled bays. Stone chimneys, a steeply pitched cross-gabled roof and elegant long windows distinguished the house as a high style example of Tudor Revival design. The mansion was accompanied by a number of smaller service buildings for maintaining the grounds, including a stable, chauffer's house, and gardener's house facing Cleveland Avenue towards the back of the estate. A carriage house, tennis court, large courtyard, three greenhouses and chicken coops were also located behind the central mansion, testifying to the grandeur and wealth of the Albright estate in its heyday.

The stateliness of the Albright estate was further demonstrated in the elegant landscape design applied throughout the massive grounds. Both before and after the construction of E.B. Green's mansion, Albright employed the Olmsted firm of Brookline, Massachusetts to design and maintain the grounds from 1890-1907. During this time the Olmsted firm generated approximately 148 landscape plans for Albright, reflecting the grand scope of this constantly evolving commission. Throughout the course of this job, the firm's name

[131] Much of the information regarding Albright's estate was initially encountered in the unpublished draft for *Albright Tract Historic District*, Report no. 10240018, State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination (never approved).
[132] Birge Albright, "John Joseph Albright-Part III," *Niagara Frontier* vol 8, no. 3 (Autumn, 1963), 97.

changed four times, due to the transition from Frederick Law Olmsted's earlier establishment of the practice to the increased involvement and later dominance of the firm by his descendants. During the course of the Albright commission, the firm's title changed from F.J. Olmsted & Co. to Olmsted, Olmsted and Elise (1893-1897), and then to the Olmsted Brothers (1898-1906) and finally to Olmsted Associates (1907).[133]

Much of the firm's correspondence concerning the job, which is on file at the Manuscripts Division of the Library of Congress in Washington D.C., shows the involvement of John Charles Olmsted on the project. As the son of Frederick Law Olmsted, John C. Olmsted received much of his training in landscape design from his father. When F.L. Olmsted retired in 1895, John C. Olmsted provided his excellent managerial skills to help the company transition when his brother Frederick Jr. also became a partner. The practice grew from 600 to 3500 commissions during this time, but John C. Olmsted still made sufficient time to make several trips to Buffalo to visit Albright's estate, particularly after the 1901 fire.[134]

The Olmsted firm's correspondence for the Albright project provides a glimpse of what the grounds looked like in the early 1900's, as well as how they evolved in the next decade. J.C. Olmsted provided a detailed description of the estate on September 21, 1902, indicating the detail involved in planning the estate grounds during the construction of the E.B. Green designed mansion and after the fire.

> *I examined the views as they would appear from various rooms of his house [Mr. Albright's, once built] and thought quite a bit of thinning would be desirable toward the N.W. but he [Albright] is very much averse to changing anything owing to associations with things as they were during the life of his first wife. His gardener said nothing would induce Mr. Albright to cut any apple or any other fruit trees...Principally any new planting will be confined to the immediate base of house and to the forecourt, rendered necessary by the setting back of the new house compared with the old one. He [Albright] intends to transplant in some big elms in a row East of the forecourt to balance the big ones on the West of it.*[135]

Correspondence from the following summer reported that these same elms were "doing very well, at about 30 to 40 feet high," and by August of 1905 J.C. Olmsted wrote the "place was looking very neat. Vegetable garden in full use. Big cross walk and small walk done. Old residences are gone."[136] During their extensive time working

[133] *Albright Tract Historic District* draft.
[134] *Albright Tract Historic District*, Report no. 10240018, State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination (never approved).
[135] Visit by J.C. Olmsted to John J Albright Estate, Sept 21, 1902
[136] Visit by J.C. Olmsted to John J Albright Estate, August 10, 1905

on the Albright estate, the Olmsted firm designed and oversaw the planting of trees, shrubs, flower beds and a vegetable garden, as well as providing a grading study of the entire property. Albright himself played an active role in the estate's landscape design as it developed, and his grandson Birge Albright later recalled that his grandfather "liked to take long walks in the gardens with his children, and, besides, catching and mounting butterflies...he went into raptures about trees of different kinds."[137] By the time the Olmsted firm finished the project in 1907, the grounds boasted a variety of trees including ash, buckeye, elm, horse chestnut, maple, pine, poplar, fruit trees and various other ornamental trees. Although the original estate has been divided and reconfigured since this era, today the park-like ambience of the former Albright tract remains due to the many mature, large deciduous trees near present day Queen Anne's Gate and 700 West Ferry Street.

The extensive, elegant grounds of the Albright estate reflected Albright's individual wealth and sophisticated taste, but also marked an important era in the history of the Elmwood East district overall. The choice to hire one of the nation's leading landscape architecture firms to design his private estate reflects the enormity of his wealth, as well as the transition of the neighborhood at this time. Ferry Street is one of the oldest streets in this portion of the Elmwood district, dating back to the early 1800's as one of the first major pathways carved out between Cold Spring to the east and the Black Rock ferry and Niagara River to the west. In roughly a century since its earliest incarnation, this portion of Ferry Street witnessed a remarkable transition in the neighborhood, from forest and farms to nurseries and estate parks. The establishment of the Albright Estate on Ferry Street by the early 1900's marked an important new era for this region, which had effectively inspired some of the wealthiest figures in the city to reside there on large estates. Landscape architects, in conjunction with profile architects like E.B. Green, thus played an essential role in this transition by negotiating the increasingly fluid boundaries between country and city, and between public parks and private estates.

At the Albright estate, the Olmsted firm did much more than solely provide new plantings and garden plans. Their influence on the estate also extended to architectural matters, where they consulted with E.B. Green on such issues as the siting and plans for the new greenhouse and automobile house, as well as designing the forecourt and carriage drive layout. Some of the most lasting elements of their work on the Albright estate are the brick privacy walls and formal wrought iron gates, which still exist along Ferry Street today. J.C. Olmsted played an important role in the selection of materials for the walls, as well as choosing the proper location for their layout. In a letter to J.J. Albright, he convinced his client that brick would be the most suitable material for the walls, stating that they were the most appropriate for formal settings due to their "color and joining, whereas stone or pebble dashed concrete walls were more appropriate for informal settings."[138] The resulting brick walls ran around the entire perimeter, topped with a stone capstone at chest height in order to provide privacy. The wall culminates in an entrance on West Ferry Street, marked by two square pillars on each side with ornamental

[137] Birge Albright, 101.

crowns. The wrought iron gate features elegant ornamentation, echoed in the iron lamps hung from the adjacent pillars. Even though the mansion and other estate buildings have long been demolished, a portion of these walls and gates remain today as contributing street furniture, attesting to the former grandeur of these grounds.

The later history of the Albright estate reflects a notable transition into the next era of development for the Elmwood East district. Albright faced many financial difficulties in the 1920's, and problems only worsened for the family in the 1930s. In order to ease the financial strain of maintaining a large mansion and grounds, Albright sold off nine parcels of his estate to the Niagara Finance Corporation in 1921.[139] Developers immediately began to build new residences on the former Albright property in 1921, marketing them to upper and upper-middle class citizens as an opportunity to purchase a more modest version of the Albrights' decadent estate. To facilitate these new houses, roads were soon laid out throughout the former grounds, creating present day Tudor Place and St. Catherine's Court in the northeastern portion of the estate as early as 1922.[140]

Albright managed to stay financially afloat for a few more years by downsizing his estate in this manner, but ultimately, he still lacked sufficient funds to maintain the basic operations that such a large estate required. In 1926, the Albright's sold their stone mansion, which they had lived in for just 23 years since it was built. The mansion stood vacant for several years, and after John J. Albright died in 1931, the building was demolished due to financial struggles and immense taxes. As just one more victim of the depression, the destruction of this once grand, opulent property marked the end of an era.

The Albright estate is was one of the earliest examples of this kind of property development, but several other prominent citizens also established large estates in the Elmwood Historic District (East), particularly at the turn of the twentieth century. One of the most notable families who constructed a sprawling estate in the Elmwood Historic District (East) was the Goodyear family. The Goodyear family's prominence in the city can be seen in the significant amount of real estate they owned in the district. For several generations, the Goodyear family owned and occupied several plots of land along the south side of Bryant Street, extending between Delaware Avenue and Oakland Place. The Goodyear family owned at least seven residential properties along Delaware Avenue, Bryant Street and Oakland Place, with many other property investments dotted throughout the city and region as well.

As one of the most influential families in the city's economic, cultural and social realms during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the Goodyear name was instantly recognizable as one of high status.

---

[138] J.C. Olmsted to J.J. Albright, letter, March 18, 1907.
[139] Buffalo Common Council, *Proceedings of the Council of the City of Buffalo from January 1, 1922 to December 31, 1922* (Buffalo: Union and Times Press, 1922), 891.
[140] For more on the development of St. Catherine's Court, see "Subdivisions and Land Use" and "Cul de Sacs"

With immense success in the lumber and railroad industries, the Goodyears were extremely wealthy. The family patriarch, Charles W. Goodyear (1846-1911), practiced as a lawyer for over fifteen years before joining his brother, Frank H. Goodyear (1849-1907), in the lumber business in 1887. In 1901, they acquired a large tract of land in Louisiana, where they established the town of Bogalusa. They built shops, offices, a bank and residences that were all oriented to better serve their sawmill operation there, the Great Southern Lumber Company.[141] There, they operated what was the world's largest sawmill at the time, and quickly became the largest manufacturer of hemlock in the world.[142] In 1902, the two brothers formed the Buffalo and Susquehanna Iron Company to operate blast furnaces south of Buffalo along Lake Erie, where they also built two freighters to transport ore from their company's mines in Michigan and Minnesota. In 1906, they built the Buffalo & Susquehanna Railroad to transport their own lumber. All of these enterprises were, in a sense, 'family businesses.' Not only were they established by two brothers, but they continued to provide opportunities for their descendants long after Charles and Frank Goodyear had passed. Charles W Goodyear's eldest son, Anson Conger Goodyear (1877-1964), served as vice president of the Buffalo Susquehanna Railroad (from 1907-1910), and also as president of the Great Southern Lumber Country after his father's death (from 1920-1938). With extensive holdings in the nation's natural resources, manufacturing plants and transportation system, Charles and Frank Goodyear, along with their wives and children, exerted considerable influence at the turn of the twentieth century.

In addition to their financial success, the Goodyear family was also known for their prominent involvement in several cultural institutions. Charles Goodyear and his wife Ella were personal friends of President Grover Cleveland. Charles was largely responsible for the nomination of Grover Cleveland for Governor of New York, and he and Ella were later the first guests invited to the White House by President Cleveland and his new bride, Frances. Their son, Anson Conger Goodyear, was a pioneering patron of modern arts. In addition to serving as a prominent figure in his family's companies, he also served as a Major General in the National Guard during World War II, had substantial investments in the lumber and rail companies in the American south and was a close personal friend of the famous actress, and Buffalo native, Katherine Cornell. An avid art collector throughout his life, Anson Conger succeeded his father Charles as the director of the Albright Art Gallery in 1911. His interest in the burgeoning modern art scene led to the divisive decision to eject him from the board a few years later, but not until after he had influenced Seymour Knox Jr.'s interest in the subject, which has undoubtedly played a large role in the museum's large contemporary collection today. After moving to New York City in the 1920s, Anson Conger Goodyear founded the Museum of Modern Art, and served as its president for a decade.[143]

---

[141] Edwin Adams Davis, *The Story of Louisiana*, volume 3 (New Orleans, LA: J.F. Hyer Publishing Company, 1960), 11.
[142] Chuck LaChiusa, "Charles W. Goodyear House, A History," Buffalo as an Architectural Museum, Accessed May 25, 2015. http://www.buffaloah.com/a/del/888/hist/
[143] Anson Conger Goodyear, *The Museum of Modern Art: The First Ten Years* (New York: MoMA Press, 1943), 11.

The prestige of the Elmwood Historic District (East), which was already established in the early 1900s by earlier estates like that of Albright and the nearby mansions along Delaware Avenue, suited the eminent Goodyear family well. From 1902-1924, they purchased several adjacent properties in order to create their family estate. In addition to their primary residence at 888 Delaware Avenue, Charles and Ella Goodyear also purchased many surrounding properties in the early 1900s. 'Clubbing' together with their extended family members, they managed to combine several individual lots into one continuous, substantial property. In doing so, they effectively carved out a large, patchwork estate at a time when this portion of the city was becoming denser in the wake of a growing population, the newly established park system and increased mobility due to the streetcar. Spanning across two historic districts, the Goodyear estate further linked the prestige of Delaware Avenue's Millionaires Row to the more recently established Elmwood Historic District (East). While a few of the Goodyear residences do not lie within the boundaries of the Elmwood district, their estate was designed so as to capitalize on the juncture between these two overlapping realms.

In 1902, Charles Goodyear and his wife Ella Conger Goodyear erected a grand mansion at 888 Delaware Avenue (NR district ref no. 74001232), to serve as the crowning focal point of their massive estate. Designed by Green and Wicks, the three-story mansion was built as a high style example of Beaux Arts Classicism, with French Renaissance Revival attributes that assured any visitor or onlooker of the importance of its residents. French details can be seen in its slate mansard roof, which features dormers with semicircular stone pediments, large keystones and curved pilasters, and its balconettes feature a guilloche décor that is predominantly seen in other French architectural examples. Included in the previously-National Register listed Delaware Avenue Historic District (NR ref. no 74001232), and known locally as 'Millionaire's Row,' 888 Delaware Avenue is today occupied by the Oracle Charter School, which makes excellent use of the extensive surrounding grounds and lawn to the rear of the property.

Other members of the Goodyear family lived adjacent to Charles and Ella, thereby creating a community of Goodyears within these few blocks of the city. Charles' brother and business partner, Frank Goodyear, lived in a mansion at 672 Delaware Avenue on the northwest corner of Summer Street, on a plot of land that is now occupied by the Red Cross parking lot. For their children, Charles and Ella Goodyear also purchased several plots of land on Bryant Street and Oakland Place that connected to the rear of their own land on Delaware. These acquisitions were particularly instrumental in creating connectivity between the Delaware Avenue Millionaires Row district and the Elmwood Historic District (East). Joined in the back of the lots, properties with Delaware Avenue frontage were made contiguous with properties facing Bryant Street. Their eldest son, A. Conger Goodyear, lived at 160 Bryant Street (c. 1908, contributing), a two-and-a-half story brick house built in the Colonial Revival style. Just down the street, A. Conger Goodyear's younger sister Esther lived with her

husband Arnold B. Watson at 180 Bryant Street (c.1912, contributing).[144] The two-and-a-half story brick house there served as their house for several years, adjacent to her parent's property and near her siblings and their families. These Bryant Street addresses are situated firmly within the Elmwood Historic District (East), yet they were also connected to the Goodyears' properties on Delaware Avenue through their extensive, manicured backyards, unified in the form of an estate.

In 1911, the Goodyears expanded the scope of their influence even further by purchasing the preexisting house at 178 Bryant Street, a two-and-a-half story Queen Anne style house originally built in 1892 for Edwin Hoag, an employee of the realtor L. F. W. Arend. Typical of Holly's 'clubbing' pattern, Ella Conger Goodyear purchased the house in the hopes of having all three of her children living in properties adjacent to her own backyard on Delaware Avenue. In order to achieve this effect, she had the house moved to its present location at 123 Oakland Place (c.1905, contributing) later that year on land that she also already owned. After it was lifted up, it was pushed backwards and rotated ninety degrees into its new lot. Her son Charles and his wife Grace Rumsey moved into the house in early 1912.

In 1924, they decided to move into a new property designed by architects Bley and Lyman at 190 Bryant Street (c.1912, contributing). Ella Goodyear then used 123 Oakland Place as a rental property until 1936, when she transferred the deed to her daughter Esther Watson. Her previous house at 180 Bryant Street was then occupied by her own daughter, Ellen Jr., who lived there with her new husband S.V.R. Spaulding Jr. Esther Watson's daughter, Esther Watson Crane (married to architect David Crane) continued to live on land that was her grandparent's former property, residing on St. George's Square until the 1970s. Thus, for several generations, the Goodyear family created an estate by piecing together several individual, adjacent properties. During this time, the southern portion of the Elmwood Historic District (East) became an increasingly dense settlement within close reach of the city's expanding industrial and commercial center. Although this portion of Bryant Street had once been outside the city lines prior to the 1850s, by the turn of the twentieth century it was only the southern portion of a much larger, rapidly developing Elmwood district.

The northern region of the district also attracted several prominent families, many of whom built lavish houses near the park system in the first decades of the twentieth century. Ellsworth Statler, the hotel magnate, was one of these prominent residents. In 1909, Statler purchased property at 154 Soldiers Place, a prominent, highly visible location with easy access to the greenery of Delaware Park as well as Bidwell, Lincoln and Chapin Parkways. Until this time, Statler had been living with his wife and his first adopted infant son (of four) on the top floor of his first hotel, on the corner of Washington and Swan streets downtown. Having achieved great

[144] LaChiusa, "Frank H. Goodyear Family in Buffalo."

financial success, Statler wanted a quieter, more spacious place for them to live, away from the bustle of the city.

Statler hired the locally-renowned architecture firm of Esenwein and Johnson to design a mansion for his family at Soldier's Place, which was completed in 1910. The architects, also known for their designs of the first Hotel Statler, the Calumet, the Buffalo Museum of Science and the Temple of Music at the Pan American Exposition, quickly got to work fulfilling their client's request for a "California-type bungalow." The result was a stunning example of an Arts and Crafts style bungalow, built on a massive scale and ornamented with Art Nouveau details. At the cost of $100,000, they erected a three-story mansion with the city's first outdoor swimming pool, a lagoon, gymnasium, greenhouse and a garage connected by an underground tunnel to the house. The house boasted six bedrooms and six bathrooms, two dining rooms, several sunrooms and parlors, a ballroom and a grand entrance hall with an organ, complete with an organist on staff for concerts. The exterior was a grand sight for the whole neighborhood, exhibiting not only extensive landscaped grounds and water features, but also an attractive façade. In order to convey a sense of the arts and crafts style and other art nouveau influences, Esenwein and Johnson employed some innovative building materials in the roof construction. Intended to look like a rustic thatched roof, the architects created a rolled edge roof by using brown 'creo-dipt' shingles made by a local Tonawanda company for this commission.[145] Arranged in a shingled, rolling pattern, these new materials enabled the architects to design a modern adaptation of a thatched roof on a massive scale. The resulting effect was the crowning achievement of an impressive mansion and estate.

The unique design of the Statler estate was instantly recognizable from its exterior boundaries on Soldier's Place, Bird Avenue and Windsor Avenue. Once the Statler family moved to Manhattan for other business pursuits in the 1920s, they rented the property to Harold Bickford until its eventual demise in 1938. A victim of the Depression and the changing settlement patterns of the Elmwood district, the demolition of this property represents a considerable loss for the neighborhood today. Although today this plot of land is occupied by a white ranch house built in the 1950s, some original elements of the former Statler estate still remain. Stone walls remain at the corner of Bird Avenue and Windsor Avenue, marking some of the estate's original property lines. These roughhewn stone walls echo the naturalistic elements of the former estate's Arts and Crafts influences, with square pillars placed at regular intervals and connected by decorative wrought iron. Erected at about waist height, they provide clear delineation of the property without obstructing views. Today, these walls are contributing elements to the Elmwood Historic District (East), attesting to the former grandeur of Statler's architectural legacy through Esenwein and Johnson's design.

[145] Susan Eck, "Ellsworth Statler in Buffalo," (Buffalo, NY: Western New York Heritage Press), 1.

Statler's estate was accompanied by many other notable properties in this portion of the district, as the northern streets such as Bidwell Parkway, Chapin Parkway and Lincoln Parkway were highly coveted due to their proximity to the park system. Across the street from Ellsworth Statler's residence, John D. Larkin Sr. was constructing his own massive estate contemporaneously to Statler. Having achieved great wealth from the Larkin Company he established downtown, Larkin purchased a large block of land near Delaware Park in 1909, in an area that had been part of Rumsey's Woods. There, he built five houses for his wife and four of his children. Bordering Rumsey Road, Forest Avenue, Windsor Avenue and Lincoln Parkway, Larkin's large estate came to be known as 'Larkland,' and served as the family's residence for several decades.

One of Larkin's first actions on this land occurred in 1909, when he built a low straight wall surrounding his entire property. Made of Onondaga limestone, this wall distinguished Larkland from nearby Delaware Park and the neighboring estates currently under construction in this area. The faced-off wall with vertical sides features square pillars at its ends, resulting in corner junctions. Capstones adorn the entire length of the wall, unifying the quarried blocks of limestone, in various sizes and shapes, joined with flush mortar. Lower than waist height, the wall delineates property lines without obstructing views, similar to a ha-ha wall. Today, this wall serves as a reminder of the original property lines, and is a contributing element to the Elmwood Historic District (East).

From 1910-1915, Larkin hired the architecture firm of McCreary, Wood and Bradney to construct five large houses on the estate. Perhaps best known for their design of the Sidway and Spaulding Building, located downtown at Main and Goodell Streets, Wood and Bradney were charged with designing not only all five houses, but also their adjoining stables and garages as well. Each house featured a matching carriage house, which housed a steam heating plant below and the chauffer's family on the second floor. Greenhouses and utility buildings were also dotted throughout the estate, indicating the truly massive scale of this land, which today consists of an entire block of houses across the street from Delaware Park.

Of the five residences, John D. Larkin Sr. and his wife Frances commissioned 107 Lincoln Parkway as their own house. Built in 1910-1912, this two-and-a-half story mansion was constructed of white brick and Georgia marble in the Neoclassical style. Set far back from the street amongst a cluster of trees, the house's temple front façade featured a grand portico, complete with a large pediment, two-story ionic columns and marble staircase entrance. The imposing exterior and large interior of this mansion conveyed a sense of classical grace and importance to both the estate and its owners. Larkin Sr. lived there with his wife until his death in 1926, and his daughter lived there from then on until its demolition in 1939. Despite the unfortunate demise of this building, the remaining four houses on the former Larkland estate still remain as evidence of this era.

The other four residences were all completed in 1915, and were deeded to Larkin Sr.'s children by 1917. His eldest son, John Larkin Jr., lived at 65 Lincoln Parkway, a Georgian revival style house with neoclassical

ornamentation details. After his death, the property was deeded to his daughter, Mary Frances Larkin Kellogg, who lived in the mansion until she donated it to the Buffalo Seminary in 1954. It was used for programming and events until 2007, when it once again became privately owned and occupied. On the eastern end of the Larkland estate, the other three children lived in mansions built along Windsor Avenue. Harry Larkin resided at 160 Windsor Avenue, a two and a half story, red brick, colonial revival style house with monumental ionic columns and a portico reminiscent of his father's house on Lincoln Parkway. Charlie Larkin lived at 175 Windsor Avenue, a Colonial Revival style house built of Onondaga Limestone to match the Larkland property walls. He lived there only two years before moving to California. The property was then transferred to Larkin's daughter Ruth and his son-in-law Walter Robb. Across the street, 176 Windsor was known as the 'Esty house,' where Larkin's daughter Daisy lived with her husband Harold. The two-and-a-half story, red brick mansion was built in the Colonial Revival style, with a symmetrical, five bay façade decorated with classical details including a small portico with Doric columns. Each of these five properties were designed with the common language of the Colonial Revival style and featured Neoclassical elements, but each are also distinct in their materials, siting and ornamental details. Together, they attest to the immense wealth of the Larkin estate and the high value of this land in the first decades of the twentieth century. Today, the former Larkland estate still represents this era of the Elmwood East district, when the city's aristocracy invested their money and time into this region in order to reside near the Park.

STREETCAR SUBURBS IN THE UNITED STATES (ca. 1880s – 1920s)[146]

The pattern of development that identifies the Elmwood district as a 'streetcar suburb' reflects a broader national movement occurring in the late nineteenth century. The new residential areas that were termed 'streetcar suburbs' developed in many American cities around the turn of the twentieth century, and the Elmwood district serves as just one instance of this settlement pattern. The existence of these communities attests to the dramatic impact that the introduction of streetcars in American cities had on the urban landscape in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

The introduction of streetcars in American cities in the 1870s and 1880s had a dramatic impact on the urban landscape, encouraging new types of suburban residential living remote from the urban center. While slower and less reliable horse-drawn cars were the earliest incarnation of these systems and proved an improvement in transportation, by the 1890s electric streetcars were widely being installed that provided quick and relatively affordable alternatives to pedestrian travel for many urban residents, allowing them to look beyond the dense

[146] Much of this discussion is drawn from United States of America, U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, *Historic Residential Suburbs*, by David L. Ames and Linda Flint McClelland, National Register Bulletin: (Washington D.C.: National Park Service, September 2002). Also, Alan Gowans, *The Comfortable House: North American Suburban Architecture, 1890-1930* (Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 1986).

city core for housing. As a result, new residential areas, known as streetcar suburbs, developed in many American cities around the turn of the twentieth century.

Throughout much of history, being financially well-to-do carried the benefit of living near the center of the city. This was considered a mark of prestige and wealth and also afforded proximity to businesses and commerce. The concept of suburban living implied the nobleman's villa or country estate, typically far beyond the city limits. Typically these estates, owned by only the wealthiest and most prestigious citizens, were refuges for outbreaks of disease or extreme city heat. Being on the outskirts of the city was relegated to the middle-class and even the working-class, who faced longer walks to the city center.

Several factors influenced the growth of suburban living in the second half of the nineteenth century. Population movement was occurring in the 1800s, partly in response to the growing commercial needs that dominated American city centers in the 1800s, pushing residential use increasingly away. City centers increasingly became associated with disease, crowded conditions, pollution from factories, and noise. Those who could afford it constructed their houses far from the city center, traveling by carriage, a phenomenon seen on Buffalo's Delaware Avenue. Increasing immigrant populations in cities, which saw immigrants often settling in dense communities that shared a common language and heritage, filled many of these now vacant inner city neighborhoods. Simultaneously, new advancements in public transportation in the second half of the nineteenth century dramatically shifted the relationship of the middle-class living in the city center, replacing foot travel with horse-drawn and later electric powered streetcars. By the 1890s, most of the wealthiest were gone from city centers and, thanks to improvements in affordable public transportation, the middle-class would soon follow.

Throughout the nineteenth century, idealized residential living was characterized by open space, natural landscapes with trees and plants, and single-family houses. These philosophies of ideal neighborhoods and communities were partially modeled on older notions of individual suburban mansions set on lush, manicured grounds as symbols of not only wealth and status but also of good health and tranquility. These notions contrasted with the housing stock in many American city centers in this era which consisted of crowded multi-story tenement buildings, with multiple families packed into small units with little light or air. This type of housing became widely associated with disease, as the density, poor ventilation and often unsanitary living conditions all contributed to the rapid spread of illness such as cholera and tuberculosis.

Streetcar suburbs generated tremendous growth in American cities beginning in the 1870s, helping to decentralize the dense urban core and providing an affordable option for a growing middle-class. Streetcars made frequent stops at short intervals along their route, creating continuous corridors of growth along the lines as they radiated out from the city core. Commercial businesses frequently developed either at key intersections along the streetcar line, or along the route of the line itself, as the streetcar brought visibility and accessibility to

the stores and shops. Apartment buildings also frequently occurred along these routes, providing a less expensive living option with good access to transportation, though closer proximity to the noise of the streetcar.

Beyond the streetcar route itself, developers took advantage of the cheaper land prices, lower building costs, and public transportation systems to create new middle-class residential development. In addition to the streetcar lines, public utilities played a significant role in shaping the development and character of these early suburban developments. As properties were dependent on connections to utilities such as water, sewer, gas and later electricity, it was common for developers to divide lots into rectangular parcels with a narrow frontage on the street. This allowed for more houses to be constructed along a street, maximizing access to utilities, and also maximizing profitability for the developer or builder. These long, narrow lots with houses sited at a regular setbacks also resulted in the creation of a "front yard" and a "backyard," drawing on the desire for surrounding oneself in the natural landscape; while these are now typical elements of suburban development, in the 1880s and '90s this was a new concept. Despite the relatively small lots and closely spaced buildings, residents in these new streetcar suburbs enjoyed more light, air, space, and better sanitary conditions than those in urban centers and older residential areas at this time.

As streetcar suburbs became more widely developed and settled, the desire to regulate and ensure the "quality" of these neighborhoods became common. In an era before true zoning regulations, the most common method for controlling the nature and character of the growth of the community was often accomplished through deed restrictions. Deed restrictions could stipulate the type, use and size of building that could be constructed on the land. In some instances deed restrictions even regulated the cost of the building or the architectural style.

The introduction of the automobile and its widespread popularity in the early decades of the twentieth century spelled the end of the streetcar suburb. Initially, automobiles were incorporated into the streetcar neighborhoods, spurring the conversions of barns or the construction of new buildings to serve as automobile garages. New driveways were installed on properties. However, automobiles and buses quickly began to dominate transportation by the 1920s, and as ridership declined, many streetcar lines were removed and replaced with buses to make routes more flexible. Like the streetcar of a half-century earlier, the increased speed of the automobile allowed for further growth and expansion away from city centers, creating new automobile suburbs even more remotely located. By the 1940s the majority of streetcar lines were removed, replaced by automobiles and buses, effectively ending the era of the streetcar suburb.

GROWTH OF THE ELMWOOD DISTRICT (1870s – 1910s)

In the 1860s, Frederick Law Olmsted had envisioned that his parks and parkways system would spur the growth of an area of Buffalo that, until the end of the nineteenth century, had no name and no identity. His vision for the

area around the parks was fulfilled, as a variety of influences converged in Buffalo in the 1880s and 1890s, including improved transportation and access, the completion of the attractive new parks and parkways, and also a rapid growth in the city's population and wealth. The Elmwood Historic District saw tremendous, rapid growth and development in the period between the 1870s and the early twentieth century. Like many streetcar suburbs around the nation, the Elmwood district experienced intense development in the period between the 1870s and the 1910s. These decades were marked by tremendous real estate speculation and investment in the area surrounding Elmwood Avenue, to both the East and the West.

Even during the construction of Olmsted's parks and parkways, the adjoining land in the 11th Ward began to rise in value. As soon as 1875, the park commissioners reported that the increase in land values in the areas adjacent to the parks system was enough to pay off the interest on the bonds issued by the city for its construction. Land values showed an impressive growth in only a few short years; the assessor indicated that in 1870 the value of taxable real property in the 11th Ward was recorded at $2,170,985. Only five years later, in 1875, values were at $2,752,640 – an increase of over $500, 000 in the short time. In the land where much of the park system was sited, primarily the 7th, 11th and 12th Wards, land values had increased more than $1 million dollars in this time. The park commissioners reported that if this trend continued for the next five years, the increase in the tax revenue alone would prove sufficient to cover the costs of creating the park system.[147]

While the park commissioners had hopes for the steady growth of real estate values, Buffalo, like the rest of the nation, suffered a setback to its financial and economic growth during the financial crisis of 1873. In the years surrounding this crisis, business showed a general decline between 1871 and 1876. In fact, the Common Council paid the parks commissioner's additional funds to put more unemployed men to work on the parks at this time. However, the industrial and manufacturing sectors in the city had been quite prosperous during the Civil War, and Buffalo fared better than other commercial centers during the financial crisis. Aided by its comparative economic health during this era, during these years the population of the city also grew rapidly from 117, 714 in 1870 to 134,557 in 1875.[148] This influx of an average of 9 people a day meant that the city needed to build two dwelling units per day at the then-rate of about 4.5 persons per household.

A combination of factors, including the continued growth in population, the success and intensification of Buffalo's economy and the development of the parks and parkways system, combined to make the vacant land in Buffalo's 11th Ward at the center of a real estate boom in the 1870s and 1880s. As historian J.N. Larned phrased it,

---

[147] *Sixth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1876* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Press of the Courier Company, 1876), 9-10.
[148] Larned, Vol 1, page 85.

> *There came now a time of remarkable stimulation in every department of activity…This led up to the only inflation of real estate values that Buffalo has ever given way to since the instruction experience of 1836-7.*[149] *A remarkable conservatism in the pricing of city ground had prevailed for fifty years; and it resisted for a long time the infection fevers of booming speculation that were running through the country in the eighties. At last, in about 1888, it succumbed, and real estate speculation rioted for the next four or five years. Buffalo was equipped in that period with street extensions and new streets, generally sewered, paved and gas-lighted in advance of settlement on them…*[150]

In the 1870s, the Buffalo Park Commissioners had recommended that the city begin surveying and laying out new roads in the areas surrounding the Olmsted parks and parkways system in order to manage the growth of the neighborhood. In order to protect its investment in the parks, the city obliged this request, expanding and laying out a new order of roads in the Elmwood Historic District area. Because Delaware Avenue was already well developed with large mansions, during the 1870s and 1880s Elmwood Avenue gradually developed into a north-south spine. Already established in small fragments between Bryant Street and Ferry Street beginning in the 1850s, a portion lying between Butler Street and Utica Street was opened in 1870, and Elmwood Avenue was extended between Ferry Street and North Street in 1873, creating a direct link to the more densely developed areas to the south. In 1883 Elmwood Avenue was extended from Bryant Street to Forest Street. A non-continuous northern portion of Elmwood Avenue was planned between Delavan Street and Amherst Street, adjacent to the Buffalo State Asylum, in 1869; however, this route was not opened until 1881, when Elmwood Avenue was declared a public highway, 99-feet wide, from Forest Avenue to the Scajaquada Creek.[151] These new roads changed the previous east-west, river to Main Street connection in the ward into a more north-south orientation, linking the city and the park.

In general, the introduction of roads in the Elmwood district area grew from the established population centers of Black Rock and especially downtown and continued northward to the parklands. Ashland Avenue was formally laid out from Summer Street to Ferry Street in 1874 and was expanded from Ferry Street to Auburn Avenue in 1884.[152] Howard Avenue (named for George R. Howard, renamed Norwood) was established in 1874.[153] Anderson Place was established from Rogers Street to Elmwood Avenue in 1870.[154] Bird Avenue, another street of Black Rock origin, was extended eastward from the Mile Strip Reservation Line to Delaware

[149] Here, Larned refers to the previous real estate boom that occurred in Buffalo, spurred by the rapid rise of Benjamin Rathbun who purchased, constructed and financed the construction of many buildings in early Buffalo. His financial collapse has been noted as being partially responsible for the national financial crisis of 1837.
[150] Larned, Vol 1, page 85-86.
[151] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 213-17.
[152] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 24-25.
[153] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 486.
[154] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 19.

Street in the 1850s, but was not noted as being an open, improved roadway until 1868.[155] Breckenridge Street was created in Black Rock in 1833 and was extended from the Mile Strip Reservation line east to Elmwood Avenue in 1868.[156]

Auburn Avenue provides a good example of the way that the gradual extension of roads from west to east provided a delayed joining of the eastern and western portion of the district. Originally established in Black Rock in the 1830s, the street was extended eastward from Rogers Street to Elmwood Avenue in 1873.[157] Eight years later, on October 3, 1881, a petition was made to extend the road between Elmwood and Delaware Avenues; however, this was met with a veto, issued by Mayor Brush, on October 17. The cautionary measures taken by Buffalo mayors in the 1880s seem to have slowed road construction east of Elmwood Avenue, creating longer blocks with fewer north-south streets. Auburn Avenue was not paved in its extension east from Elmwood Avenue to Delaware Avenue until 1892. Similarly, Cleveland Street (now Cleveland Avenue) was laid out in 1882, but not paved east of Elmwood until 1888, and then again with asphalt in 1903. Lancaster Avenue was not paved east of Elmwood Avenue until it was extended to Melbourne Court in 1891, and then again east to Delaware Avenue in 1893.

The improvement of roads in the developing Elmwood district fostered its development. While the Buffalo and Williamsville Macadam Road (Main Street) had been improved using macadam construction in the 1830s, many of the roads in the Elmwood district remained dirt paths for many decades. It was not until the 1870s that many of these streets were graded and smoothed, but still most remained unpaved. Even Olmsted's elegant parkways and The Avenue were only graded, drained and opened to the public as dirt roads in 1874.[158] One of the streets in the worst condition in the 1870s was The Avenue (Richmond Avenue). Low spots in this road had been filled roughly with debris from the construction of the parks and parkways. However, this fill, along with the increasingly heavy carriage traffic on the road, created a rough, muddy and often impassable route on one of Olmsted's key park approaches. Calls to pave The Avenue with gravel and stones were issued by the Buffalo Park Commissioners in 1874.[159] The Avenue/Richmond Avenue was finally stoned and graveled in 1879 between Bidwell Place and Forest Avenue at the expense of adjacent property owners; however, this did little to improve its overall condition.[160] The north end of the street, north of Bidwell Place (Colonial Circle), faced less traffic and was in decent condition after it was graveled. However, south of Bidwell Place, Richmond Avenue remained a rough dirt road, and in wet weather was impassable.[161] Plank sidewalks had been installed along

[155] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 45-46.
[156] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 55-56.
[157] Buffalo Bureau of Engineering, 28.
[158] *Third Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners,* 7.
[159] *Fourth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1874* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Warren, Johnson &, 1874), 17.
[160] *Tenth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1880* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1880), 46-47.
[161] *Eleventh Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1881* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1881), 67.

Richmond Avenue by this point, which helped to keep pedestrians out of the mud of the street. In 1881, the Buffalo Park Commissioners continued to lobby for improvements to Richmond Avenue, noting that the poor condition of the road was leading to deterioration to the adjacent grass, and the trees were subject to damage from horses and cows that roamed the area. During the winter of that year, the condition of the road was so poor that it was noted as being impassable for over three months.[162] Finally, Richmond Avenue was paved with Trinidad asphalt, a naturally occurring asphalt imported from the island of Trinidad, from North Street to Bouck Street (Lafayette Avenue) in 1885.[163]

Other roads in the Elmwood Historic District were also improved in the late 1870s and 1880s, making them attractive to development. While water-bound macadam surfaces had been the material of choice through much of the nineteenth century, used in the initial construction of the Buffalo and Williamsville Macadam Road (Main Street) in the 1830s, by the late 1800s the use of asphalt as a binder and sealer for a macadam road was proving to be more heard-wearing and durable. By the turn of the century, experiments with refined petroleum asphalt, rather than natural asphalt, were already proving successful, making asphalt production cheaper and more widely available.[164] Bryant Street was paved with asphalt in 1881-82. Butler Street (Lexington Avenue) and Ferry Street were asphalt paved in 1884. In 1885, Summer Street was also paved with asphalt. The following year, Bouck Street (Lafayette Avenue), was completed. The length of Elmwood Avenue was paved from North Street to Forest Avenue in 1887. In 1888, Howard Avenue (Norwood Avenue), Ashland Avenue, Highland Avenue and Breckenridge Street were all paved. Other streets in the area were paved in the 1890s and 1900s.[165]

In order to prepare the land in the area for development, one of the first measures taken was to drain it. Covering an area more than 2,100 acres in size in the valley of the Scajaquada Creek near Delaware Street and Main Street, the Bird Avenue sewer was first proposed in 1875. Construction of the Bird Avenue sewer system occurred in stages between 1883 and 1894, and drained land between Bird Avenue, north up Lincoln Parkway, south around Chapin Place (now Gates Circle), and south down Main Street and as far east as the present Bailey Avenue.[166] While the Bird Avenue sewer helped to drain a large area of the Elmwood district, opening it up for development, its construction did destroy the Cold Spring at Main and Ferry Streets, marking the loss of one of the city's oldest water sources.

---

[162] *Twelfth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1882* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Courier Company, Printers, 1882), 16-17.

[163] Hodge Bros., Agents, Statistical Story of Progressive Asphalt, ca. 1889, MS, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society, Buffalo, N.Y.

[164] "1823 - First American Macadam Road," Macadam - Road Building in America!, 2009, accessed May 23, 2012, http://curbstone.com/_macadam.htm.

[165] Hodge Bros., Agents, Statistical Story of Progressive Asphalt.

[166] "Map Showing the Territory to Be Drained by the Ferry and Bird Ave. Receiving Sewer, Buffalo NY," map, in *Annual Report of the City Engineer, Buffalo, NY for the Year 1875* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1876).

At around this same time, other sewer lines were also being installed in the Elmwood Avenue area. The construction of sewer lines on a street is a good indication of when the street was sufficiently developed to warrant the installation of sewers. Later dates for sewers in the 1890s and 1900s were typically noted for streets in the northern portion of the Elmwood Historic District (West), reinforcing the notion that the overall development in the district occurred from south to north. One of the earliest sewer mains run in the neighborhood was under Forest Avenue, which was installed beginning in 1874 as a part of the Buffalo State Asylum project. A sewer line in Ferry Street was laid in 1884. Anderson Place had a sewer line installed in 1885-86. Howard Avenue (Norwood Avenue) and Ashland Avenue were sewered in stages from south to north between 1883 and 1888. Bryant Street had sewer mains installed between 1882 and 1886, indicating a relatively early development period on this street. Ferry Street also had sewers added early in this era, in 1884, as a part of the Bird Avenue sewer project. Highland Avenue had sewers in 1889. Bidwell Parkway had a sewer line laid relatively late, between 1892 and 1898. Breckenridge Street in the Elmwood district was also sewered relatively late, between 1890 and 1894. Between 1890 and 1891, Delavan Avenue in the Elmwood Historic District (West) was sewered.[167]

The roads of the west side of Elmwood Avenue were constructed at a slightly earlier time than those on the east side of Elmwood Avenue, resulting in a slightly different appearance and character on either side of that street. As many of the east-west streets in this general region originated in Black Rock, it was easy to extend these from the west to the east, and the prominence of Elmwood created a natural stopping point for road projects in the 1870s. However, when extensions of many of these roads east of Elmwood Avenue were sought in the 1880s, many of these measures were vetoed by the city's mayors. While it would seem natural that a mayor would support the progress and development of his city, especially in the midst of such booming growth, Mayor Phillip Becker's 1877 address to the Common Council highlighted the situation:

> *(The Street Department) is always the subject of concern. No matter how faithfully the Street Commissioner may endeavor to perform his duty, he cannot escape criticism and daily complaints. We hear much about the bad condition of our streets, but when an attempt is made to clean them by laborers employed by the city, and tax expenses are assessed upon the property, many of the property owners protest against the system.*[168]

These sentiments were echoed only a few years later by Mayor Alexander P. Brush, whose motives stemmed from a growing wave of abuse, corruption and shoddy workmanship occurring in road construction in the 1870s

[167] For a complete list of sewer activity in the Elmwood district, please refer to: *Index of Paved Streets, Sewers, Water Mains: With Important Ordinances, Regulations and Permit Forms Relating to Work in Public Streets* (Buffalo: Bureau, 1912).

and 1880s. Also, the rapidly growing street system required the allocation of additional funds for their repair and maintenance, putting a strain on finances. The city spent over $92,000 in 1876 just for paving streets in stone and wood and an additional $30,000 plus for repaving and repairing.[169] By 1878, the city had spent over $196,000 on creating new streets, plus almost $10,000 for repairs on existing ones.[170] These costs were exacerbated as new services were installed in this area; many of the roads were torn up and the replacement roads were of deficient quality. Mayor Brush outlined his thoughts in his address to the Common Council on January 5, 1880:

> *The constant repairs required on our paved streets are rendered necessary largely by reason of the imperfect manner in which paving is replaced after making sewer, gas and water connections…(E)ffectual measures should be taken to secure a practical and perfect manner of doing such work that the streets may be left in a proper condition, and kept so by the parties doing our work. This end might be secured by requiring contractors in this line to take our licenses.*[171]

Thus, the mayor's hesitancy to extend roads east or north from Elmwood Avenue likely reflects, at least in part, the complex negotiations and poor qualities of the roads previously laid out on the west side of Elmwood. This resulted in a slightly later settlement period for the eastern portion of the district than in the west. Additionally, fewer north-south roads appear in the eastern portion of the district, due to a combination of factors. The persistent presence of large estates, as well as the city's political determination not to fund road construction, resulted in just a few smaller north-south streets than in the west. Rather than including streets that ran parallel of Elmwood Avenue for considerable lengths, as in Norwood Avenue or Ashland Avenue in the west, the Elmwood Historic District (East) instead features shorter north-south streets, often only a block long. Oakland Place serves as one such example, paved in 1888 and created by subdividing other parcels from the back of large Delaware estates and former farm lots.[172]

The reaction to the apparent bad practices in road construction during the early 1880s, coupled with the appearance of large estates during this same time, may be a primary reason for the development of what appeared as two different street patterns in the larger Elmwood Historic District area. Compared to the Elmwood Historic District (West), the Elmwood Historic District (East) experienced this streetcar- related development slightly later. New residences in the west characterized this new streetcar suburb style of settlement, with houses along Ashland Avenue and Norwood Avenue indicative of this development pattern.

---

[168] Michael F. Rizzo and Genevieve M. Kenyon, *Through the Mayors' Eyes: Buffalo, New York 1832-2005* ([Buffalo, N.Y.]: Old House History, 2005), 125.
[169] *Annual Report of the City Engineer, Buffalo, NY for the Year 1876* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1877), 60.
[170] *Annual Report of the City Engineer, Buffalo, NY for the Year 1881* (Buffalo, NY: Courier Company, Printers, 1882), 38.
[171] Rizzo, 114.
[172] Wachadlo, 8.

The eastern portion of the district was a bit more mixed, featuring both the older, larger estates of the 1880s and 1890s, but also the newer, denser development occurring along many of the east-west corridor streets around the turn of the twentieth century.

With improved transportation and access to the area, proper drainage, new roads being created and many local amenities emerging, by the end of the 1870s the Elmwood district area was poised for a rapid growth in population and construction. On the eve of such rapid growth in the area, information culled from the 1875 New York State Census indicates that the large 11th Ward had a population of 11,121 people and 2,280 houses built of brick, frame and stone. While this ward then encompassed the well-developed areas of the former Black Rock neighborhood to the west, this growth is impressive compared to the 3,314 residents and 596 buildings (of any sort) recorded in 1855.[173]

One of the earliest reports of the real estate boom in the Elmwood Historic District comes from 1888. The *Pictorial Yearbook & Calendar for 1888*, recording events and occurrences from 1887, was noted in June "great activity in building; over 500 dwellings in process of erection in the Eleventh Ward."[174] While this quote does not specify where exactly the construction activity was occurring, it is one of the earliest comments about the flurry of construction activity in this area. The growth in this ward was further enumerated; while the 11th Ward claimed 20,262 residents in 1885, only two years later it had a population of 25,463.[175] The addition of over 5,200 new residents marks an impressive growth of 125 percent, reflecting the popularity of the area. In September of 1889, *The Architectural Era* also noted the impressive growth and development taking place in the emerging Elmwood district:

> *Last week over one hundred applications were made to build frame residences. Very few architects ever hear of these buildings, on account of arrangements made with the planing-mills and contractors for the drawing of the plans for nothing.*[176]

This comment from a national architectural newspaper captures the nature of the development occurring in the up-and-coming Elmwood Historic District. Unlike the wealthier streets, such as Delaware Avenue, Linwood Avenue and others, many of the buildings being erected in the Elmwood district were designed and constructed largely by contractors and builders. Many were built speculatively, with real estate investors or builders purchasing a larger plot of land, subdividing it into several smaller lots, building a house on each lot, and

---

[173] Table No. 20, *Annual Report of the City Engineer, Buffalo, NY for the Year 1876* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1877), n.p.
[174] Quoted from *The Pictorial Year-book and Calendar for 1888 with Buffalo Events in 1887...* (Buffalo, NY: Matthews, Northup &, 1888), 30.
[175] *The Pictorial Year-book and Calendar for 1888…*, 62.
[176] H. S. Pickett, ed., "Buffalo," *The Architectural Era* 3 (September 1889): 195.

marketing them for sale. Because the area also attracted many upper-middle class residents as well, there are also several excellent examples of architect-designed residences among those builder designed.

As a clear attempt to market this new, valuable territory for development, the area was branded, apparently by developers, with the name "Elmwood District" or "Elmwood Avenue District" in the 1880s. It is difficult to ascertain exactly when this name was given to the neighborhood, or by whom, but it was widely in use in real estate advertisements by 1890, right after the opening of the streetcar line on Elmwood Avenue in 1889. Drawing its name from the longest and most prominent street in the area, the name appears also to reference the verdant landscape of the neighborhood as a means to entice development in the area. Buffalo was characterized by elm trees for over a century until the Dutch Elm disease devastated their numbers. Other street names in the area also appear to draw on this association, including Ashland Avenue (drawing its name from the Ash tree) and Norwood Avenue (an apparent play on the Norway maple tree). Oakland Avenue, while also drawing on associations with nature, was likely derived from the nearby Oakland's Nursery, which was prominent in the 1850s and 1860s. While its exact origin is elusive, by the 1890s the "Elmwood District" name was a widely used name for this area, giving it a sense of suburban character and identity that would help to shape and define its impending development.

This swath of undeveloped land was popular for new development in the late nineteenth century for several reasons. The first and perhaps most obvious reason is that it was available at a time when the city's population was rapidly growing. In 1870, Buffalo's population was recorded at 117,714, while in 1880 it grew more than 30 percent to 155,134. The trend continued, with the 1890 census recording a nearly 65 percent growth in only ten years to 255,664. The continuing growth of the population resulted in the need for new housing. Olmsted's parks and parkways system in the area offered an attractive alternative to the dirt and pollution of more industrialized areas of the city, making the Elmwood district a place considered fresh and healthy. In the nineteenth century, fresh water and parklands were seen as ways to help prevent the spread of diseases and illness. The wide open space also allowed for the construction of new, less-dense housing types rather than tenement houses, also seen as a healthy. The improved roads and streetcar systems in the area also encouraged growth in this area, providing better access to the land. These new roads were not just created as simple thoroughfares, but were broad and elegantly landscaped. This character created higher land values, and also encouraged the purchase of these lands by the city's growing middle- or upper-middle income classes.

The prominent role that the streetcar system played in opening up the new Elmwood district for growth and settlement also had a role in shaping its character. As urban historians Sam Bass Warner and Andrew H.

Whittemore phrased it, the horse car and its modest fare "sorted riders from pedestrians."[177] While access to this area was highly improved, the fact that this land was remote from the majority of jobs, shops and places of employment in Buffalo's downtown and East Side areas meant that in order to reside in the Elmwood district, a person had to be able to afford the fare for the daily commute. Those who could not afford the streetcar fare were forced to walk to their jobs, meaning they had to live in close proximity, which usually meant in downtown Buffalo or the East Side. At the other end of the spectrum, those folks who were wealthy enough to afford their own private carriages typically resided on larger properties more independent from the noise and commotion of the streetcar lines.[178] This left a middle- and upper-middle class population in Buffalo that could afford the daily fare but not a personal carriage, so a neighborhood like the Elmwood district would have been immensely appealing. This group of people could afford to build or purchase their own single family houses, mimicking the styles and open landscaped yards of the wealthy at a smaller scale.

SUBDIVISIONS & LAND USE

Another factor appears to have also aided in developing the character of the Elmwood Historic District. Particularly in the eastern portion of the district, the subdivision of previously established large estates gradually opened up new land for development, mostly in the 1910s-1930s. As the older generation of land owners in the Elmwood district area either sold their lands or died, they would either leave their holdings to their heirs, or sell their properties, or a portion of their properties. In some cases, particularly in the portion of the district directly adjacent to Delaware Avenue, wealthy residents would engage in a process called 'clubbing,' where they purchase several properties located next to each other in order to obtain a large piece of land on which to build their estates in the late nineteenth century. In the early twentieth century, this older generation of estates would change hands, and the family patriarch would typically leave these properties to his heirs. These heirs would often privately subdivide the estate into a series of smaller lots for their own personal use, as seen in the Goodyear family estate along Bryant Street and Delaware Avenue.[179] In other cases, however, the aging owners of large estates would sell their properties, or a portion of their property, to developers who were then able to open up areas for new construction where available. This occurrence helped to divide these large pioneer-era tracts and wealthy estates into smaller lots, broken down amongst a new generation consisting of both heirs and new residents.

During these subdivisions, stylistic restrictions were often placed on the kind of development that could occur on the newly purchased land. It was common at the time to include specific stylistic restrictions as a condition

[177] Sam Bass Warner and Andrew H. Whittemore, *American Urban Form: A Representative History* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2012), 50.
[178] Warner, 50-51.
[179] See "Large Estates" for more on this phenomenon.

of the sale, ensuring that new developments would merge harmoniously with more historic ones.[180] Developed under these design guidelines, these subdivisions frequently echoed the predominant style and character that had already been established by the large estates of the previous generation.

The subdivision of the Albright estate in the early 1920s provides one example of the kind of stylistic restrictions placed on these new developments, particularly St. Catherine's Court.[181] In 1921, John J Albright sold a portion of his property to the Niagara Finance Corporation to alleviate his family's financial stress, but still continued living on his (now smaller) estate adjacent to the new development. In order to maintain the historic standard and high quality of the adjacent estate, design standards were enforced as a condition of the sale. St. Catherine's Court could only contain single-family houses, placed with specific siting requirements and built with minimum cost requirements.[182] Applying these strict regulations on the sale can be understood as an effort to regulate what was constructed near his own house, to help maintain the appearance and character of the area just beyond his estate. Albright would not have wanted a factory building to spring up next to his stately house, a possibility in the years before zoning was adopted in the city.

Following these restrictions, most of the houses on St. Catherine's Court were designed to echo the Tudor Revival mansion of the Albright estate, thus retaining a relatively unified sense of character within this tract of land despite its recent subdivisions. Modest examples of the Tudor Revival style, at least more modest than Albright's mansion, were placed in smaller lots along this street. The street was even named in reference to Albright's estate, where E.B. Green designed Albright's mansion as a partial replica of St. Catherine's Court in Bath, England. Houses were built relatively quickly, with seven houses built on St. Catherine's Court in just two years, between 1922 and 1924. These residences were soon purchased and occupied, appealing in particular to modestly wealthy citizens who could afford a slightly bigger lot than those in the western portion of the district, but not the kind of grandeur and wealth formerly present on the Albright estate.

New theories and philosophies regarding real estate speculation were also becoming prominent in this era. Real estate business in the later nineteenth century was thought of as a "science." In the past real estate investors were typically millionaires who could invest in vast swaths of vacant land and wait years and sometimes decades for the natural growth to make their investment profitable. They made no improvements to it, and this land remained just open grounds. This older method required a great deal of already-established capital that could be

[180] For similar examples in the Elmwood Historic District (West) see: Jennifer Walkowski. *Elmwood Historic District (West)*, edited by Daniel McEneny. State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination (Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, October 2012).
[181] For more on the Albright estate, see "Large Estates."
[182] *Albright Tract Historic District* draft, 10.

tied up for unknown lengths of time. By the late nineteenth century, the new "modern" method for real estate speculation (as published in the *Real Estate and Building News* in 1891) was more complex:

> *It requires judgment in selection, push in overcoming obstacles, unity of purpose in the matter of improvements, an outlay to attract population, and last but not least, a liberal amount of advertising.*[183]

Under this new modern philosophy of investing in real estate of subdivide, parcel, and build, the idea was for multiple specialized businessmen to purchase large portions of cheap land which had possibilities, render it into market-palatable parcels, improve the parcels, which in 1890s Buffalo generally meant building houses or commercial buildings, and either collect rent on the buildings or sell them for a higher profit.

> *Now, suburbs way out, bought cheap and made presentable by made roads and grading, by elegant sidewalks, induce the homeseeker to pass the unimproved and neglected outskirts to the district which combine the air of the country, with the improvements of the cities, electricity and other rapid travel overcoming distances. The new plan is best, and under its beneficent influences, suburbs are becoming constructed which are beautiful, healthy, substantial and in every way superior to even the best city locations and buildings.*[184]

This new approach towards quickly and cheaply purchasing and developing property would have a significant impact on the development of the Elmwood district during this period. Many of the new houses in this area were the results of speculation on the part of real estate developers who purchased large plots of vacant land and builders who built a strip of houses and quickly looked to sell or rent the properties at a profit. This can be seen in the Elmwood Historic District (East) at St. Catherine's Court and Melbourne Place.

Also fueling speculation in land sales in the Elmwood district was a city law that went into effect in 1877 requiring a new appraisement of the city's real estate value. As a result, the total value jumped from just under $40 million to $88.8 million in 1878, more than double the previous assessed value. After 1878, however, the values of real estate still continued to climb, while tax rates in Buffalo were noted as being lower than other comparable American cities at the time.[185] This created an excellent environment for the boom in land sales and construction that would occur in the ensuing decades.

Urban historians Sam Bass Warner and Andrew H. Whittemore have studied the broad phenomenon of suburban real estate speculation during the late nineteenth century in America. Many of the broad patterns they

---

[183] "Old and New Real Estate Ideas," *Real Estate and Building News* III, no. 1 (July 1891).
[184] "Old and New Real Estate Ideas," *Real Estate and Building News* III, no. 1 (July 1891).
[185] George M. Bailey, "Sketch of Buffalo," in *Buffalo 1893: A Descriptive and Statistical Sketch of the City of Buffalo and Its Suburbs*, by George M. Bailey (Buffalo, N.Y.: Rowland &, 1893), 16-17.

describe were true for the development of the Elmwood district. Unlike some suburban developments shaped by a single developer or builder, the Elmwood Historic District was shaped by countless builders, carpenters, real estate dealers and other non-professional men, Warner and Whittemore's so-called "9,000 decision makers." Many of those involved in shaping the size, scale, architecture and layout of the neighborhood were small investors, building their own house or a small group of properties, sometimes scattered throughout the neighborhood. Warner and Whittemore's broad observations seem to parallel the story of the suburbanization of the Elmwood district, explaining the general uniformity of building type and character:

> *...Speculating landowners cut up their fields and woods to offer lots for sale…Carpenters and other craftsmen who built three to six houses a year took most of the lots for development; some families purchased a lot to build on their own account. Whether builder or homeowner, their financing rested on short-term, straight-line mortgages whose principal fell due in five to seven years. Many depended on paying a down payment and then no principal, hoping that the mortgage would be renewed at the end of its term. When depressions tightened the mortgage market, renewal ceased and uncounted numbers of mortgagors lost their property.*
>
> *In a city-building process of many small entrepreneurs, little innovation could be expected. Everyone sought market safety in repeating what was already known and proven popular. Thus, without legal regulations, custom and fear of failure directed the design of the vast new areas of streetcar suburbs.*
>
> *Freestanding wooden, stone and brick houses characterized the new neighborhoods of the well-to-do. Often here the subdividers added covenants against the building of livery stables, saloons, or manufacturing, and set requirements for lot lines and the control of fences.*[186]

Lacking a single guiding vision, no real legislation or regulation was in place to shape the character of the Elmwood Historic District. However, developers and builders were not truly free to create whatever they wanted. Construction was guided by existing factors such as street patterns, access to public utilities, land prices and other physical conditions. Also influential to the design of the area was a consideration for the type of people who could afford to live in the area and purchase houses, and many of the speculatively built houses were designed to appeal to the masses and attract quick sales. With these forces at play, shaping its growth and character, a description of the Elmwood District from 1894 notes the vast bounds of the neighborhood early in its development: "The 'Elmwood district' really comprises the territory bounded by Virginia Street, Delaware, Richmond, and Forest avenues…"[187]

LAND VALUE

[186] Quoted from Warner, 76.

The total value of construction occurring throughout the city was equally impressive. In 1890, it was estimated that between $5 million and $6 million worth of building had occurred in the city. While this figure included several large-scale projects, it also included dozens of houses in the Elmwood Avenue area. It was estimated that in 1891 that the total figures would range between $8 million to $10 million.[188]

What had previously been a undeveloped section of the city quickly became some of the most valuable real estate in the city at the end of the 1800s. The increase in land values and land prices was impressive. One source noted that property on Ashland Avenue in 1881 could be purchased at cost of $2,600 an acre, or $10 per foot frontage. By 1893 this same land had increased in value to $26,400 per acre, or $150 per foot frontage.[189] In 1894, newspaper articles reported that land on Summer Street and other streets nearby, which had sold for $10 or $15 per foot in the early 1880s was then selling for $300 to $400 a foot.[190] Real estate values were skyrocketing in Buffalo during the 1880s and 1890s, spurred largely by the rapid development of the Elmwood district, causing a bubble in land values. Some of the practices in real estate at the time were far more sinister, and there were false valuations, forced inflation, and illegitimate speculations that often worked against prospective homebuyers in the Elmwood Historic District.[191] One 1899 source summed up the real estate situation in the city at the time, stating, on the eve of the Pan-American Exposition:

> *The low cost of property, and the very low tax rate unite in giving to the investor in real estate, opportunities that cannot be had had in any city of similar size in the country.*[192]

This relationship of real estate value and population growth was summarized by George M. Bailey, a prominent journalist and real estate investor in 1893. Bailey points out that land sales were not enough to spur the success of a real estate investment. Only by erecting a building, especially a house, could an investment in land become profitable for the purchaser:

> *Population makes land value. If Buffalo is adding to her population every year a city as large as Lockport, while her limits remain the same (about 42 square miles), it stands to reason that there must be more people who wish to buy land than of those who have land for sale. Hence the increase in value, which is made permanent by new fixtures upon the land, in the way of houses and other buildings that produce rent, as against vacant land that usually bring no income, but is a tax-eater. The amount of*

[187] *Buffalo Courier*, "Where Houses Grow: Marvelous Growth of the Elmwood District," September 9, 1894.
[188] Real Estate and Financial News, March Supplement.
[189] Elias A. Long, *An Acre in the City. A Brief Treatise on Land, Millionaires, Fortunes in Real Estate, Buffalo, Niagara Power* (Buffalo, 1894), 3.
[190] *Buffalo Courier*, "Where Houses Grow: Marvelous Growth of the Elmwood District," September 9, 1894.
[191] *A History of the City of Buffalo: Its Men and Institutions: Biographical Sketches of Leading Citizens.* (Buffalo: Buffalo Evening News, 1908), 32.
[192] *Ins and Outs of Buffalo, the Queen City of the Lakes; a Thoroughly Authentic and Profusely Illustrated Guide.* (Buffalo: A.B. Floyd, 1899), 22.

> *substantial building in Buffalo during the past few years has been something tremendous, and it is to be regretted that there is no accurate method of getting at its value.*[193]

As an attempt to regulate and oversee the real estate speculation occurring in the city, the Buffalo Real Estate Exchange was organized on January 23, 1885. For many years much of the real estate business in Buffalo was conducted through this organization.[194]

This astonishing growth in Buffalo in the late nineteenth century is described in a publication issued by the Common Council in 1897, in the midst of the development of the Elmwood Historic District:

> [Buffalo] *had a healthy, but not a phenomenal growth, until about the year 1870, when it began to roll up cumulatively astonishing additions to its population, and to give evidence of becoming some day one of the greatest commercial and manufacturing cities in the civilized world. That expectation has already been realized. Its growth between 1880 and 1890 was like compounding interest on money, and was in every way phenomenal, and the development has continued until to-day, when it is generally conceded that Buffalo affords the best field for speculative enterprises and for manufacturing undertakings of any of the cities of its size in the world.*[195]

This rapid speculation and inflation was halted by the financial crash of 1893; yet after the mid-1890s, real estate development continued to grow, not only out of speculative investment but also out of sheer need based on the still-growing population, but it was of a more conservative nature.[196]

TURN OF THE TWENTIETH CENTURY / PAN AMERICAN EXPOSITION

By the mid-1890s, the Elmwood district was poised as Buffalo's most attractive, fashionable neighborhood. During 1898 and 1899, Buffalo issued around 2,000 building permits, nearly four per day, many of them for residential buildings and many to be built in the Elmwood district.[197]

In 1901 after the delay of the Spanish-American War, the Pan-American Exposition took place on grounds located just north of Delaware Park. While the development of the Elmwood district was already well underway by 1901, the Pan-American Exposition did help to encourage the further growth and development in the area. In

---

[193] George M. Bailey, "Sketch of Buffalo," in *Buffalo 1893: A Descriptive and Statistical Sketch of the City of Buffalo and Its Suburbs*, by George M. Bailey (Buffalo, N.Y.: Rowland &, 1893), 17.
[194] *A History of the City of Buffalo: Its Men and Institution*, 33.
[195] Quoted from Buffalo Common Council, *Manual Containing a Sketch of Buffalo, Facts and Figures on Various Subjects... and Full Data Relative to Public Affairs for the Year 1897.* (Buffalo, N.Y.: Wenborne-Sumner, Printers, 1897), 8.
[196] *A History of the City of Buffalo: Its Men and Institution*, 33.
[197] *Ins and Outs of Buffalo*, 22.

preparation for the fair, new streetcar lines were constructed in the area, further enhancing the transportation network in this area of the city. The streetcar line on Elmwood Avenue, electrified around 1892, brought travelers directly to one of the main gates for the Pan-American Exposition, further increasingly the popularity of this line. The Pan-American Exposition also attracted new attention to the "Elmwood district." Taking advantage of their proximity to the fair, many homeowners rented rooms and served as boarding houses as a way to earn some additional money. The Parkes at 759 Bird Avenue (1892, contributing) offered lodging and breakfast as well as maps to their guests. Mrs. Cleves at 383 Bryant Street advertised a "delightful location" ten minutes from the Pan-American grounds. Walter S. Jenkins offered guests a ground room floor and a private bathroom at his house at 805 West Ferry.[198] The fair was a daily presence throughout the city and the district. Houses along Lincoln Parkway experienced increased traffic as fairgoers made their way to the entrance for the Exposition at the end of that street, where it intersected with the park. So while the Pan-American Exposition may not have directly influenced the growth and development of the Elmwood district, the fair was clearly a part of life in the district around 1901.

In November of 1902, the development in the Elmwood district was quantified in the journal *Greater Buffalo*. An article devoted to "The New Elmwood District" noted that fifty-seven buildings were in the course of construction, all of them devoted to residential use with the exception of one store building at the corner of Elmwood and Auburn Avenues. The residential buildings ranged from stone mansions to four-family apartment buildings. The number of buildings under construction on several of the Elmwood district streets was provided:

> *Hoyt, 5; North Norwood, 2: North Ashland, 5; Elmwood, 5; Richmond, 2; Brantford Place, 2; Norwood, 3; Ashland, 1; Lincoln Parkway, 2; Bidwell Parkway, 5; Auburn 2; Lafayette, 4; West Delavan, 7; Potomac, 3; Bird, 2.*[199]

Besides this tally, more than two dozen houses were also noted as being recently completed. The article noted that the Elmwood district had seen at least 76 new residences constructed between May 1st and November in 1902.[200]

The growth and popularity of the Elmwood district continued into the first decade of the new century. By 1900, the population of the city had grown to over 350,000 residents. During this era, new buildings were constructed in the Elmwood district that helped to create a sense of place and desirability in the neighborhood. The only permanent building erected for the Pan-American Exposition, the Buffalo Historical Society (now the Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society, NR listed) added a touch of classical design to the Delaware Park area in

[198] "Advertisements," *The Outlook* 68, no. 18 (August 31, 1901): n.p.
[199] "The New Elmwood District," November 1902, 19.
[200] "The New Elmwood District," November 1902, 19.

1901. The elaborate Beaux Arts style Lafayette High School (NR listed), located just west of Richmond Avenue on Lafayette Avenue, was built to the design of local architects Esenwein and Johnson between 1901 and 1903 to serve as the city's third high school. The Albright Art Gallery (now Albright Knox Art Gallery, NR listed), was designed by noted Buffalo architects Green and Wicks. Located on Elmwood Avenue near Delaware Park, it was initially conceived as part of the Pan-American Exposition and construction began in 1890; however, delays postponed opening until 1905. These cultural and civic monuments not only continued the trend of high-style architecture in the largely residential Elmwood district, they also created additional attractive places to learn, study, visit, raise families and live. In October 1902, the journal *Greater Buffalo* noted:

> *Altogether the northern part of the Elmwood district has advantages which the southern has never had, and for that reason it is developing more rapidly than any district in Buffalo.*[201]

This article points out a key fact about the overall growth and development of the Elmwood district. After the turn of the twentieth century, these new cultural and educational institutions in the area encouraged residential development in a larger, more opulent manner. It is during this era of the early twentieth century that areas just south of the park begin to develop, notably along Lincoln Parkway.

FRANK LLOYD WRIGHT'S WILLIAM HEATH HOUSE, 1904-1905

The story of the Health House encapsulates many of the trends and influences common in the Elmwood Historic District (East) during the turn of the twentieth-century. The house is reflective of the common type of middle to upper-middle class business owner or manager who became wealthy enough to hire an architect to design a private residence in what was rapidly becoming Buffalo's most prominent neighborhood. In 1903, William R. Heath commissioned the celebrated architect Frank Lloyd Wright to build his own residence at 76 Soldier's Place (1904-1905, contributing), located in the northern portion of the Elmwood Historic District (East). The two-story brick residence features several architectural elements characteristic of Wright's signature Prairie style design, including art glass windows, cantilevered hipped roofs and an emphasis on horizontality. Situated at a unique juncture of several of Olmsted's parkways, the William R. Heath house represents a stunning example of Wright's work and provides an exceptional contribution to the Elmwood Historic District (East).

The mere presence of a Wright-designed house in the district attests to the sheer wealth and prestige of some of its residents at the turn of the twentieth century. William Heath was one such wealthy resident, who had made his fortune as Office Manager, and eventually the Vice President, of the Larkin Company located downtown in Buffalo's Hydraulics neighborhood. Several other residents in this portion of the district had connections to the Larkin Company, as the company's president and founder John D. Larkin built his large 'Larkland' estate just

[201] "The New Elmwood District," October 1902, 8.

down the street on Lincoln Parkway.[202] Both Larkin's wife, Frances, and Heath's wife, Mary, were sisters to Elbert Hubbard, who worked in sales and marketing at the Larkin Company before he left to establish the Roycroft community in 1895. Effectively brother-in-law to one another, Heath lived within visible sightline of what would become his employer's estate just a few years later in 1910. The conglomeration of wealth and power in this portion of the district was evident in the high quality of architecture and design that appeared along these streets in the early twentieth century.

The property's location in the Elmwood Historic District (East) played a substantial role in Wright's innovative design. Set upon a deep and narrow strip of land that faced a traffic circle and multiple street intersections, the physical position of the house on the lot became one of the primary determinants in Wright's vision for the residence. The lot on which Heath had commissioned Wright to build his residence was, in short, completely atypical of Wright's previous designs up this point. The horizontality, open plan, contiguous spaces and broad, sweeping views that were characteristic of many of his early Prairie style designs were seemingly at odds with this lot, which was narrow, angular, and very publicly oriented for a private residence.

Particularly in the context of the other residential commission that Wright was working on in Buffalo at the time, the Darwin D. Martin House and Complex, this lot required some innovative design solutions in order to work with this site. The Martin house was similarly situated within the context of one of Olmsted's plans, in Buffalo's Parkside district (NR ref. numbers 86002817 and 07000492) located just north of the Park. There, Wright reconciled the strong contrast between his characteristic rectilinear style and Olmsted's curvilinear roads by placing the complex at a deep setback from the street. In the Elmwood Historic District (East) he was presented with a similar relationship to the Olmstedian character of the curving traffic circle and radiating parkways, yet faced the additional challenge of building on a corner lot that was much closer, and more visible, to neighboring properties on several adjacent, intersecting streets.

For Wright, this unique plot of land provided stylistic inspiration rather than obstacles. Facing this challenge head on, the Heath commission became an opportunity for Wright to develop an innovative design approach that would work with this kind of narrow, somewhat urban site. Privacy was a central issue in siting the residence on this land. The corner lot was subject to more street exposure than usual because it was situated at the junction of not one, but four streets, including Lincoln Parkway, Chapin Parkway, Bidwell Parkway and Bird Avenue. Wright's solution was to set the house back from the circle, orienting the house along Bird Avenue instead. Although the official address is on Soldier's Place, the interior plan of the house is arranged in relation to Bird Avenue. Boldly pushing the exterior walls of the house virtually up to the sidewalk on Bird Avenue, Wright provided additional privacy by raising the house's main interior spaces above the pedestrian

[202] See "Large Estates" for more on this property.

sightline, thereby greatly limiting what passersby could see from the sidewalks. Rather than place a grand entrance at the front of the lot, Wright provided a small, modest entrance on the Bird Avenue side of the house. The small entrance, along with a wide chimney, and multiple casement windows designed with art glass, served as further screening devices that prevented onlooker curiosity despite the house's close proximity to the road. This orientation scheme had the effect of essentially hiding the residents in plain sight, enabling the house to command the prominent architectural presence befitting of Heath's commission, but also provided privacy for his family within.

Wright balanced this internal privacy with external prestige, seamlessly integrating the house into the surrounding landscape of the Elmwood Historic District (East). Unlike the sprawling lawn he was able to provide at the Darwin R. Martin house, the William Heath house was situated in much closer proximity to neighboring residents in the district. Because the property culminated in a public space, Wright could assume that the Heath residence would not be comprised by new buildings arising on the edge of the property line. In order to create a landscape befitting a residence of this stature, Wright set the house at the back of the lot, leaving substantial open space along the property where it faced Soldier's Place. This placement effectively doubled the 'front yard' of the Heath house, creating a contiguous green zone that joins the residence's lawn to the greenery of Olmsted's designs just beyond the property lines, in the adjacent circle and parkways.[203] In this way, Wright thoroughly integrated the Heath residence into the preexisting Olmsted landscape design that shapes the district. While the property lines clearly did not include the public spaces of the circle and parkways, Wright's orientation and placement of the house turned the surrounding Elmwood district into a virtual extension of the front yard. In this sense, the Heath residence directly participates with the surrounding community and landscape of the Elmwood Historic District (East).

Several architectural elements reinforce Wright's innovative approach to this lot and its relationship to the surrounding district. A substantial porch faces the front lawn, covered by a cantilevered roof with square pillar supports. The horizontal elements of the porch extend outward towards Soldier's Place, emphasizing the connectivity between Heath's property and the district beyond. Accessed only from within the house, the porch also provides a visible display of the house's residents, taking advantage of their prestigious location in a manner that is simultaneously private and public. Inside, the ground floor of the Heath residence features an open, contiguous plan, characteristic of many of Wright's designs. The living room, dining room and porch flow into one another, creating a space that connects the deep interior of the house to the district's green spaces beyond the property line.[204] Upstairs, the master bedroom is located above the porch, with windows on three sides in order to provide plenty of light and an elevated view of the Olmsted's naturalistic landscape outside.[205]

---

[203] Charles E. and Berdeana Aguar, *Wrightscapes: Frank Lloyd Wright's Landscape Designs* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2002), 51–56.
[204] William Allin Storrer, *The Architecture of Frank Lloyd Wright* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2002), 103.
[205] Brendan Gill, *Many Masks: A Life of Frank Lloyd Wright* (Chicago: Da Capo Press, 1998), 145-146.

Art glass adorns many of the windows in the seven bedroom house, providing a level of detail that is not only characteristic of Wright's style, but also attests to the opulence of the commission.

Heath's wealth is further evident in the back of the house, where Wright also included a single story stable for the family's horse and carriage. The ability to commute to work by private carriage was a privilege reserved for the wealthy at this time, and thus the presence of a stable further confirms the affluence of this family. Reflecting an early stage of the Elmwood district's transition into the automobile age, the stable was replaced by a two-story garage just a few years later in 1911.[206] Automobiles were still very expensive at this point, and thus were owned almost solely by the upper class. The early presence of a garage on this property confirms the elite status of the Heath family, and, by extension, the prestige of the Elmwood Historic District (East), where they chose to build their residence.

The William R. Heath house remains one of Frank Lloyd Wright's most influential contributions to global modernism that still exists in Buffalo today. Constructed five years before the Robie house (1910), the Heath house is considered to be an important precedent to his later work in Chicago.[207] Wright's solution to the unique size, shape and orientation of the lot in relation to the surrounding Elmwood district proved useful to his commission at the Robie house, which was similarly situated on a corner lot amidst the surrounding Hyde Park neighborhood and University of Chicago campus. His approach to providing privacy for the residents, as well as demonstrating public prestige in the context of the surrounding community, directly echoed his earlier work at the Heath house in Buffalo.

The Heath house proved to be nationally influential not only through Wright's work in Chicago, but also internationally influential through its inclusion in the renowned Wasmuth portfolio. Published in 1910-11 by the Berlin publisher Ernest Wasmuth, the portfolio compiled 100 lithographs of Wright's works in America, accompanied by a monograph written by Wright. The Wasmuth portfolio was the first publication of Wright's work to appear anywhere in the world, predating his own publications by several years. The publication was extremely important for Wright's career, and directly influenced many important architects across the Atlantic. Le Corbusier was known to have owned a copy of the portfolio, and it indelibly influenced his future designs.[208] Le Corbusier, Mies van der Rohe and Walter Gropius were all working for Peter Behrens at the time, and it is reported that "work stopped when the portfolio first arrived at the studio."[209] These architects, who would later be considered the 'fathers' of European modernism, were all deeply influenced by the images of Wright's work

[206] Thomas Heinz, *The Vision of Frank Lloyd Wright* (London: Chartwell Books, 2000), 115-117.
[207] Gill, 144.
[208] Stanislaus von Moos, *Le Corbusier: Elements of a Synthesis*, (Rotterdam: 010 Publishers, 2009), 42.
[209] Harold Platt, "Planning Modernism: Growing the Organic City in the 20th Century" in *Thick Space: Approaches to Modernism*, edited by Dorthee Brantz, Sasha Disko and Georg Wagner-Kyora (Berlin: Transcript Publishing, 2012), 167.

presented in the Wasmuth portfolio.[210] Included amongst these images were several views of the Heath house, and the portfolio contained exterior images of its Bird Avenue façade as well as the house's plan and a few interior views of the first floor.

The inclusion of the Heath house in the internationally-recognized Wasmuth portfolio testifies to its pivotal importance in the history of architecture, of Wright's career, and the Elmwood Historic District (East). The distribution of the portfolio, and images of the Heath house within it, to this powerful group of European architects demonstrates the cultural distinction, social prestige and economic wealth present in the Elmwood Historic District (East) during the first decade of the twentieth century. The portfolio focused on twelve major works by Wright, three of which were located in Buffalo- the Darwin R. Martin house, the Larkin Administration Building, and the Heath house.[211] Of those twelve works, two have been demolished and nine have been listed on the National Register as Historic Landmarks.[212][213] The William R. Heath house is the only building of those initial twelve featured in the Wasmuth portfolio that have not been listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The Heath house represents a profoundly important and influential contribution to both the local and global history of architecture and development of modernism. Many of its innovative attributes are rooted in Wright's architectural response to the preexisting landscape and character of the Elmwood Historic District (East). In this sense, Wright's design for the Heath house reflects the substantial prestige of the Elmwood district at the turn of the century, identifying this portion of the district as a seat of cultural power and wealth in the early twentieth century.

CHANGES IN THE ELMWOOD DISTRICT (1910s – ca. 1940s)

By the end of the 1910s, the Elmwood Historic District had emerged as Buffalo's most fashionable and desirable residential neighborhood. In one generation, this area of the city had rapidly transformed from vacant land to a densely built pedestrian suburb north of Buffalo's growing commercial center. Although limited construction in the Elmwood Historic District continued through the 1920s and 1930s, as early as 1902, the neighborhood was described as "well filled up" with the houses of the "well-to-do."[214]

---

[210] T. Benton, *Le Corbusier: Architect of the Century* (London: Arts Council of Great Britain, 1987), 39.
[211] Frank Lloyd Wright, *Studies and Executed Buildings by Frank Lloyd Wright: The Wasmuth Portfolio* (Chicago: AIA Press, 1919).
[212] These works include the Edwin Cheney House, the Coonley House, the Como Orchard Summer Colony, the Dana-Thomas House, the Thomas P. Hardy House, the Larkin Administration Building, the Darwin D. Martin House, the Park Inn Hotel, the Robie House, Unity Temple, the Westcott House, the Winslow House, and of course, the William R. Heath house.
[213] The Larkin Administration building was demolished in 1950; the Como Orchard Summer Colony, near Darby, Montana, was demolished gradually in several phases, mostly between 1930-1945. Two few small buildings remain on the property, but the majority of the complex is gone.
[214] "The New Elmwood District," October 1902, 8.

ELMWOOD AVENUE EXTENSION

In the early twentieth century a subtle shift in the character of the Elmwood Historic District, especially focused on its primary thoroughfare, Elmwood Avenue, began to take hold. By 1901 and the time of the Pan-American Exposition, Elmwood Avenue was a primary artery in the northern part of the city and in the Elmwood Historic District. The streetcar line, initially installed in 1889 and electrified around 1892, helped drive this connection between the urban core and the Elmwood Historic District via Elmwood Avenue. Elmwood Avenue had been gradually extended throughout the late nineteenth century, and, by 1901, ran from Virginia Street at the south and continued north into the growing community of Kenmore beyond the city line. By 1903, options for the extension of Elmwood Avenue were explored. The most popular plan was to unite Elmwood Avenue with Morgan Street, which ran parallel and just west of Delaware Avenue near Niagara Square. Many residents of the Elmwood district were unhappy and felt inconvenienced that the Elmwood streetcar line did not extend directly into downtown. Because of the narrowness of the street at its southern end, one train car would have to wait for another to pass. The road was too narrow for two parallel tracks.

The benefit of extending Elmwood Avenue to connect Buffalo's thriving suburb more directly to the downtown core was seen as an undertaking with little risk and high reward. The project was said to interfere with few valuable buildings along the new route. This section of Buffalo closest to downtown was seen as old, shabby and less fashionable with its small, outdated houses and cramped streets compared to the new residential growth in the Elmwood district. This area of the city, especially along Main Street and Delaware Avenue nearby, was transforming from a residential area into the city's commercial district by the turn of the twentieth century. Public sentiment favored the construction, and it was said that:

> *Surely there has never was an instance in a city of anything like the population of Buffalo where a public improvement of such magnitude in an old and valuable part of the city could be effected at so slight a cost as this will involve.*[215]

While the extension of Elmwood Avenue south to Morgan Street was costly and labor intensive, it also faced another obstacle. Occupying a large plot of land in the middle of the proposed route was the Rumsey estate. Known as "Rumsey Park," the palatial grounds of the Bronson Rumsey estate at 330 Delaware Street dated back to 1862 and stretched from Delaware to Whitney Place and Carolina Street. Rumsey Park was the center of Buffalo high society in the late 1800s, one of the city's landmark residences. Given Bronson Rumsey's

[215] *Buffalo Courier Express*, "How Easily Morgan Street Could Be Extended and Elmwood Avenue Widened," June 22, 1903.

prominent role in Buffalo at the time, it was not until after his death in 1902 that the road extension project through his property began to take shape.[216]

After much public discussion, the Elmwood Avenue extension project began in 1903. Many residents in the Elmwood district celebrated the road extension. "This will bring the city to our very doorstep," it was proclaimed.[217] Bisecting the old Rumsey estate, the road construction continued for nearly a decade. The widening part of the project, broadening Elmwood Avenue both north and south of Allen Street to allow for two tracks for the streetcar line, was completed in the fall of 1910, and the entire project was completed in 1911.[218] Elmwood Avenue then served as a primary north-south artery from downtown Buffalo through to the city line and beyond, a key role it plays to this day.

While it might have been expected that this newly extended roadway would encourage the further residential development along Elmwood Avenue, many residents shied away from living in such close proximity to the streetcar lines and their noisy activity. As a result of the increased streetcar traffic and the growing number of automobiles in the area, Elmwood Avenue began to transform into a commercial area. By the 1920s, Elmwood Avenue was described as a "street of spots," with residential pockets and commercial pockets.[219]

Real estate values on Elmwood Avenue appear to have played a role in shaping its development in the early decades of the twentieth century, as values fluctuated on an almost block by block basis. While commercial development on the street had been spurred by the Pan-American Exposition in 1901, it was actually residential demand that dictated higher land values on Elmwood Avenue through the early decades of the 1900s. The block between Summer and Bryant Streets was considered one of the most fashionable residential strips on Elmwood Avenue in the 1920s, with assessments of $110 per front foot. In comparison, blocks like that between Anderson and Lexington Avenues were assessed at only $47 per front foot. This lower cost allowed these blocks to be desirable and affordable for commercial ventures.[220] By the late 1920s, commercial development had occurred on the blocks between Bryant and Utica Streets, Breckenridge and Cleveland Streets, Delavan and Potomac Streets and Bird and Forest Streets.[221]

---

[216] "Rumsey Park," Western New York Heritage Press, 2005, accessed May 30, 2012, http://wnyheritagepress.org/photos_week_2005/rumsey_park/rumsey_park.htm. Also. *Buffalo Courier Express*, "How Easily Morgan Street Could Be Extended and Elmwood Avenue Widened," June 22, 1903.
[217] Quoted in Life on Elmwood, ca. 1983, TS, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society, Buffalo, NY.
[218] Larned, vol. I, 96.
[219] Bureau of Business and Social Research, Ralph C. Epstein, and Florence M. Clark, *Buffalo Real Estate Assessments 1905 - 1928*, University at Buffalo Studies in Business (Buffalo, N.Y., 1929), 27.
[220] Bureau of Business and Social Research, 30-31.
[221] Bureau of Business and Social Research, 28.

The commercial growth of Elmwood Avenue in the Elmwood Historic District took on a unique architectural character. Instead of replacing many of the houses on the street that had been constructed only a decade or so earlier with commercial blocks, one or two-story commercial additions were constructed to the front elevations of houses to accommodate shops and restaurants. While this type of converted building is not unique to Elmwood Avenue, it does occur at an unusually high frequency on the street, giving it a distinctive commercial appearance. The building at 746 Elmwood Avenue is an excellent example of this type of conversion, featuring a ca. 1916, two-story stone-clad Classical Revival commercial block in front of a ca. 1890s former house. Another good example is 736 Elmwood Avenue, featuring a two-story brick commercial front with a central entry flanked by showrooms and an elegant shaped pediment, set in front of a ca. 1890s frame Queen Anne style residential building. While some two or three story commercial blocks were constructed, notably the group of stately brick buildings on Elmwood Avenue near Bidwell Parkway, the scale of these buildings was still highly compatible with the surrounding residential neighborhood, never taking on the sort of mammoth scale of commercial development of downtown Buffalo.

AUTOMOBILES AND NEW STREET PATTERN DEVELOPMENTS, 1910s-1960s

The introduction of the automobile and its widespread popularity in the early decades of the twentieth century began the transition into new forms of development for the Elmwood Historic District (East). Marked in three stages -- the streetcar suburb, early median streets, and later cul de sacs -- this changing settlement pattern mirrors the broader history of transit preferences, reflecting an intertwined, constant evolution of both urban design and transportation methods during the first three decades of the twentieth century.[222] Although they coexisted in the district for several decades, the streetcar and the automobile inspired fundamentally different settlement patterns. Rather than the clusters of houses situated in relatively close proximity to commercial corridors, median streets and cul de sacs instead characterized this new era of automobile-driven development in the district. The 'automobile era' in fact occurred in two distinct patterns, with median streets appearing mostly from the 1910s to the 1920s, and then cul de sacs become more frequent from the 1920s to midcentury. Although these settlement patterns certainly overlapped, the urban designs and architectural styles employed in these methods reflect different approaches to automobile-oriented developments in Buffalo during the first half of the twentieth century.

The streetcar suburb style of development denotes the first phase of this migration away from the city center, and this pattern was indelibly linked to the evolution of this early transportation method. Furthermore, this new mobility directly impacted residents' relationship to work. With the ability to commute longer distances to the office, the disaggregation of home and work began to impact urban design. In the early twentieth century,

residential communities began to spring up further away from downtown Buffalo. The development of these planned streets and communities reflects the role of expansion from a dense, flourishing Buffalo, combined with the sentimentalized popular notion of a healthy, pastoral, and suburban lifestyle away from the central city. Utilizing both the streetcar and the automobile to commute to work downtown from beyond the central city, residential communities like University Park, Smallwood and Roycroft Boulevard emerged in the 1910s and 1920s. Located within easy access to the Main Street trolley line, these communities enabled residents to commute into the city to work and return home at the end of the day, to an area with green spaces and a quiet environment.[223] Like similar examples in the Elmwood district, such as Argyle Park and Penhurst Park, many of these enclaves were walled or even gated in order to imply both a separation from the city and a privileged, restricted entrance, similar to a large estate.[224] Access was encouraged only for those who were economically capable of purchasing a house, thus creating an upper or upper-middle class environment by pricing out any potential lower class residents. The separation of these private and public realms, between work and home, was made possible by increased mobility through the streetcar and then automobile.

By the 1920s, automobiles had become a prominent fixture in the daily lives of an increasing number of Buffalo residents.[225] The ease and affordability of automobile transportation encouraged new residential growth even further away from the urban core of Buffalo. New suburban neighborhoods developed north of the Scajaquada Creek within the city limits. The Parkside neighborhood (NR ref. numbers 86002817 and 07000492), which had been proposed by Frederick Law Olmsted in the 1870s, was developed primarily around the automobile, from the 1920s through the 1940s. The area north of Hertel Avenue also developed around this time. Outside of the city boundaries, the village of Kenmore flourished on both sides of Delaware Avenue as a developers' haven in the 1910s and 1920s. These new suburban neighborhoods were all made possible by the ease in transportation afforded by owning automobiles.

As ridership declined, many streetcar lines were removed and replaced with buses to make routes more flexible. Like the streetcar a half-century earlier, the increased speed of the automobile allowed for further growth and

---

[222] Sam Bass Warner, *Streetcar Suburbs: The Process of Growth in Boston, 1870-1900* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2009), 3. Also Paul Groth and Todd W. Bressi, *Understanding Ordinary Landscapes* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997).

[223] Annie Schentag, *University Park Historic District.* Edited by Daniel McEneny. NR ref no.11000273. State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination. (Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, May 2011).

[224] Clinton Brown Company Architecture, *Entranceways at Main Street at Lamarck Drive and Smallwood Drive,* edited by Daniel McEneny. NR ref no.05001379. State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination. (Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, December 2005).

[225] In just a few years, however, new technology and assembly line manufacturing methods, put forth by entrepreneurs like Henry Ford, made automobiles significantly less expensive. Placed within financial reach of the middle class, these standardized, affordable vehicles, like the Model T Ford, soon appeared in greater numbers. For more on this, see John Banskton, *Henry Ford and the Assembly Line* (Philadelphia: Mitchell Lane Publishers, 2003). Also David Nye, *America's Assembly Line* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2013).

expansion away from city centers, creating new automobile suburbs far more remote than the Elmwood district. By the 1940s, the majority of streetcar lines were removed, replaced by automobiles and buses, marking the official end of the era of the streetcar suburb. Developments in the Elmwood Historic District (East), such as St. George's Square and Lincoln Woods Lane, bring this vision of an automobile-centric settlement pattern to full fruition, confirming the dominance of car-oriented urban design by midcentury.

MEDIAN STREETS, 1910s-1920s

As citizens began the slow shift away from the streetcar and towards buses and automobiles, a new phase of settlement began to occur. Taking the form of tree-lined, semi-private residential streets sharing a common median, this typology began to emerge with the early introduction of the automobile in the first decade of the twentieth century. Available and accessible only to the significantly wealthy, these median streets began to appear as a transitional phase between two forms of urban design that reflected first the dominance of the streetcar and then the emergence of the automobile.

Argyle Park was one of the earliest enclaves of this kind in the Elmwood Historic District (East). Like Dorchester Road in the Elmwood Historic District (West), Argyle Park provides an excellent, intact example of this early phase of median-oriented street design.[226] Argyle Park was established in 1904 by Sylvanus Nye, the same developer responsible for Dorchester Road in the Elmwood Historic District (West), along with Ardmore Place. Nye was a prominent developer in Buffalo at the time, who developed these three communities in the district before turning the land once occupied by the Pan-American Exposition into a residential neighborhood known as Nye Park in the 1910s.[227] In keeping with his other developments, it seems likely that Nye drew on the proximity of Olmsted's parkways to Argyle Park in order commanded higher prices for this land, hoping to recreate the profitability of an "exclusive" street he had experienced on Dorchester Road just one year earlier. In 1904, Nye, along with the R. W. Goode & Co. Agency, spent $200,000 to develop Argyle Park, locating it on the former Y.M.C.A recreation grounds. The grounds had previously operated as an 'Outing Park' along Delavan Avenue, and included a club house with lockers and baths as well as an outdoor track, ball field and ten clay tennis courts. The Y.M.C.A. did not renew the lease after 1896, and by the early 1900s real estate developers worked to secure the land for the future Argyle Park.

This new development was bounded by Bidwell Parkway, Potomac Avenue, Elmwood and Delavan Avenue, with the street itself extending from Delavan to Potomac. The 70-foot wide tract bisected the residential properties, and featured a landscaped median 'park' in the center. Architect W. L. Schmolle designed all the

[226] See *Elmwood Historic District (West)* for more on Dorchester Road
[227] Mike Rizzo, "Turn-of-the-'previous'-century Splendor Abounds in City's Architecture" *The Buffalo News* (Buffalo, NY), March 29, 2003, Home Finder ed.

landscape and paving plans of the park, as well as the dwellings that were erected shortly thereafter. A real estate advertisement described his vision for the development as "combining a color scheme of rare beauty and embracing the chief characteristic ideal features of the domestic architecture of Italy, America, Holland, Germany, England and Spain. The wonderfully simple beauty of these designs make the project, through practical in all respects, seem almost Utopian."[228] These utopian aims echoed Olmsted's park system plan, in which the beauty of this tract would healthfully impact not only the bodies of residents, but also elevate their minds and spirits as well. Referencing several international revival styles and garden designs, the conception of Argyle Park was rooted in a pastoral, even somewhat nostalgic, approach to city living that resembled a park far more than an urban neighborhood.

From its inception, the development of Argyle Park was targeted towards attracting the upper class as its new residents. An article in the *Buffalo Courier* described the street during its construction, indicating it was "an exclusive, high-grade residence district, really a semi-private park." Similar to many suburbs today, Argyle Park allowed access only to the wealthy, and made sure to assure future residents that "the property will be efficiently restricted." Price was used as method of regulating the socioeconomic status of the residents, ensuring that only the wealthy could afford to purchase property in this new, desirable development. Landscape design and architectural style were used to attract this type of resident, and some even further suggested that communities like Argyle Park were not only opportunities for personal investment, but also represented an investment in the city at large. As the *Buffalo Courier* article commented,

> *It is difficult to estimate the immense advantage which accrues to a city through this class of development. These little beauty spots certainly become a matter of civic pride and general public benefit, besides enhancing the value of the land employed and that adjacent thereto. By this beautifying process and the employment of the high grade of art in landscape and architecture, all in harmony, yet individual in characteristic, a man's home becomes a solid asset, ever appreciating value.*[229]

Emphasizing the artistic qualities of the street's design, the sophisticated cultural values embedded in its inception, and the selective process of becoming a resident, articles like this one appealed to an elite, wealthy class of citizens.

Tucked away from the bustling corridor of Elmwood Avenue, Argyle Park distinguished itself from the neighboring streetcar commuters. A waist-high stone wall with concrete capstones at both ends of the street also created this distinction, literally separating this new development from the surrounding neighborhood. Octagonal pillars adorn the open entrances of these walls, topped with ornamental lamp and adjacent wrought

[228] "New Semi-Private Park to be Located on Site of Y.M.C.A Recreation Park" *Buffalo Courier* (Buffalo, NY), March 11, 904.
[229] "New Semi-Private Park to be Located on Site of Y.M.C.A Recreation Park", 12.

iron archways. The introduction of the car into mainstream society happened slowly, and in the early 1900's only the wealthiest citizens could afford this luxury.[230] In this sense, the automobile represented much more than a means of transportation at the time, but also served as an indicator of the upper class. The streetcar was still the dominant method of transportation at the turn of the century, but automobiles were also beginning to be purchased as luxury items for the very wealthy at this time. Although the earliest residents of Argyle Park likely used the streetcar for their commutes in the beginning, the development's design anticipated the impending dominance of the automobile just a few years later. By 1917, one neighborhood resident, Mrs. Daniel Stucki offered instructional lessons from her house at 32 Argyle Park. Using the street as her classroom, Mrs. Stucki taught "female autoists how to drive," indicating the presence of experienced car owners on the street at the time.[231] Garages were built during this time, often designed in stylistic accordance with the main building. The house built for Court T. Champeney at 55 Argyle Park (1909, contributing) features one such garage, which features a hipped roof and dormer providing stylistic unity with the hipped roof Prairie style frame house. The design of Argyle Park contains many elements that allude to the presence of the automobile, including ample space for driveways, a relatively wide street, and the graceful, curving median in the center.

Nearby, Penhurst Park also presents an example of the early role of the car in the Elmwood Historic District (East) streetscape. In 1909, the street was developed with similar aims to Argyle Park, by the R.W. Goode and Co. agency and George Sickels. Heading north from Forest Avenue, a long, grassy landscaped median runs down the center of the 100-foot wide avenue, creating a park-like atmosphere even amidst the encroaching city nearby. The landscape architecture firm of Townsend and Fleming designed this bucolic environment to echo the atmosphere of Olmsted's park system nearby. A promotional booklet for Penhurst Park emphasized the tract's proximity to the park system as an advantage, stating,

> *The elaborate park system, with its connecting boulevards almost engirdling the city, the magnificent parkways and park approaches, the broad avenues shaded by fine trees and lined by handsome homes, each with its own setting of lawn and shrubbery, make up a picture which delights the eye and lingers in the memory. Delaware Park, with its wealth of natural beauty...is the culmination of our park system and the natural center of beautiful Buffalo....This tract is practically the only vacant block south of the park.*[232]

Here, Olmsted's park system plan has come to fruition, not only in providing ample park space but also in guiding the future development of the Elmwood Historic District. His utopian notion of green space serving as an 'Eden' to cure both physical and social ills is present in the design for Penhurst Park. Explicitly taking

[230] Nye, 47.
[231] "Mrs. Daniel K Stucki to Instruct Women Autoists in Buffalo," *American Artisan*, vol 74. (July 14, 1917): 27.
[232] Sickels, George and R.W. Goode and Company, *Penhurst Park: A Choice Location for Handsome Homes* (Buffalo, NY: The Penhurst Park Company, 1909): 1.

advantage of its proximity to the park system itself, the developers at Penhurst Park, like at Argyle Park, mirrored some of its aims and methods on a small scale, providing a modest version of many of the park's benefits for its residents.

The real estate developers continued to promote the location of Penhurst Park, capitalizing on its proximity to streetcar lines as well as providing ample space for those wealthy enough to own automobiles. They emphasized the convenience of the location, stating "Nowhere else in the city is one so far removed from the noise of railroads, the dirt and smoke of factories, or the encroachments of business, and yet it is one of the most accessible locations in Buffalo."[233] Accessibility and mobility were key factors here, influencing not only the location of this tract but also the socioeconomic class of its potential residents. Situated far enough away from the bustle of the commercial strip but still close enough to the streetcar line, the location of Penhurst Park reflects this transitional moment between the popularity of the streetcar and the subsequent dominance of the automobile. The development's promotional booklet reflects this transition when describing the approach to the tract: "To reach Penhurst Park by driving or motoring one traverses the most attractive streets and finest parkways, while the Elmwood car line gives direct service through the residence district to the business center."[234] By promoting the accessibility of Penhurst Park to both autoists and streetcar commuters, the developers appealed to wealthy residents capable of owning automobiles as well as upper-middle class citizens who may not yet be quite so fortunate but were still able to make a significant purchase in close proximity to those who could. This dualistic appeal, to both streetcar commuters and automobile commuters, epitomizes the transitional character of this early phase of transportation-oriented settlement patterns.

From its inception, Penhurst Park was designed "to appeal to discriminating purchasers," evident in the large single-family houses that were subsequently built in the tract.[235] Residences fronting the median of Penhurst Park were clearly the most prestigious addresses, set on larger lots with ample room for a driveway and garage. For streetcar commuters, the tract also provided smaller lots fronting Elmwood Avenue, providing an opportunity for a slightly less wealthy class of residents to take advantage of this prime location. The developers described their offerings based on this scale of income: "Besides the choice lots in Penhurst Park, the Elmwood frontage of this tract affords a most desirable building site for more moderate priced homes."[236] Despite this more modest opportunity, Penhurst Park advertisements clearly focused predominantly on the 'choice lots' fronting the Penhurst Park median, providing illustrations of some of the houses as well as detailing the protective restrictions placed on these developments. Assuaging the wealthiest residents that their investments would be secure from encroaching figures or new buildings, the developers emphasized the

[233] Sickels, 3.
[234] Sickels, 3.
[235] Sickels, 2.
[236] Sickels, 7.

uniformity that would result from following these stylistic restrictions. Citizens purchasing a lot to build a new house must follow guidelines such as "the premises shall be used for first-class residence purposes only, and there shall be erected thereon not more than one single-family residence, which shall cost not less than $10,000 and which shall front on Penhurst Park."[237] Requirements like these were placed upon the usage of the lots and costs of new designs in order to "secure to the purchaser complete protection from objectionable features...thus guarding the tract from undesirable development."[238] Residents were also required to build within specific setback guidelines, placing their new houses at a thirty-five foot setback from the street, with their private stables or garages even further back on the lot, at least 110-feet from the street. Restrictions like these, along with an expensive required minimal construction cost of $10,000, ensured that the residents of Penhurst Park would be wealthy citizens. The houses themselves only confirmed this wealth, many of which were designed by architects such as Green and Wicks in the Colonial Revival style, often featuring elegant decorative details such as porticos or cornices.

Like Argyle Park, Penhurst Park distinguished itself from the surrounding district by means of a stone wall and distinguished entrance, signifying the values associated with this early-twentieth-century development style. The low terraced walls form a "C" shaped pattern, topped with ornamental details such as a concrete balustrade, stone arched side entrances and small lion figures resting atop the tall square pillars flanking the central entrance to the tract. Developers described the effect of these walls upon both residents and visitors, stating,

> *The entrance to Penhurst Park is through a beautiful stone gateway flanked by low terraced walls backed by flowering shrubs. The simple dignity of the entrance gateway, with its architectural details carefully worked out, gives an air of distinction to the surroundings and marks Penhurst Park at once as something out of the ordinary.*[239]

These walls served to enclose the tract into a unified, distinctive enclave. Dividing Penhurst Park from the surrounding bustle of Elmwood Avenue, the walls provided both a physical and social separation from other nearby residences and businesses. Lending an air of distinction and privacy to this street, these walls today continue to attest to the era of their construction, during a time when the automobile was beginning to divide the city along both physical and social lines.

EARLY CUL DE SACS, 1920s-1930s

[237] Sickels, 8.
[238] Sickels, 6.
[239] Sickels, 4.

Once the automobile became affordable to a broader population, the predominance of this transportation method made its mark on the Elmwood Historic District (East) during the next phase of development, in the 1920s and 30s. Settlement patterns at this time increasingly accommodated the presence of the car, with small cul de sacs, driveways and garages appearing more frequently. Many of these developments indicated a characteristically suburban environment through the use of planned traffic circles, which prioritize the automobile rather than the streetcar commuter. In the Elmwood Historic District (East), St. Catherine's Court, Tudor Place and Melbourne Court all illustrate this kind of auto-centric design.

Located in the northern section of the former Albright estate, St. Catherine's Court was developed once John J. Albright sold a portion of his property to the Niagara Finance Corporation in 1921.[240] From 1922-1924, St. Catherine's Court was developed as a small cul de sac street, emptying onto the south side of Cleveland Avenue.[241] Tudor Place was also developed at this time, as a one block street connecting Cleveland Avenue to West Ferry Street, and formerly part of Albright's estate as well.

Like the earlier developments at Argyle Park and Penhurst Park, property on St. Catherine's Court and Tudor Place was priced to attract the city's wealthy residents. The development was instantly popular, and by 1923 a real estate advertisement ran in the *Buffalo Courier*, stating "there is only one more lot in St. Catherine's Court obtainable. 68 x 173 feet, $4300 a [linear] foot. This beautiful location offers an exceptionally fine opportunity for the ideal house."[242] The cost of land, and then the subsequent cost of constructing a house, would have self-regulated the development, creating a more homogenous, privileged community of residents than would be seen in the central city. These guidelines also ensured that this new development would attract wealthy residents, distinguishing the area as slightly more upscale from the western portion of the Elmwood district.

The street orientation, plan and landscape design of St. Catherine's Court all attest to the growing dominance of the automobile at this time. Designed as a cul de sac, the street prioritizes the automobile rather than the pedestrian. The street can be accessed only by Cleveland Avenue, culminating in a circular return and landscaped 'park' that is more convenient for car transit than for pedestrians. This design also reflects the street's resident demographics, indicating that they were wealthy enough to arrive home by car rather than walking from a streetcar stop or bus line. The presence of driveways confirms this, indicating that the car has now become sufficiently popular, at least among this class, in order to demand accommodation through design.

The presence of the automobile can also be seen in the inclusion of garages on St. Catherine's Court, built at the same time as the houses. These garages reveal that not only were cars used as a method of transportation, but

[240] Refer to "Large Estates" for more information on this estate.
[241] For more on the subdivision of the Albright estate to develop St. Catherine's Court, see "Subdivisions and Land Use"
[242] "St. Catherine's Court," *Buffalo Courier* (Buffalo, NY) March 4, 1923.

also indicate the high socioeconomic class of the residents. At this time, it was relatively rare to include a plan for a garage in the design of a house, and the inclusion of many of the original garages in this district serves as a testament to the class of those who chose to move away from the central city. In that era, commuting by automobile was a privilege, an early predecessor to the continued expansion of the city outwards into the suburban regions that would develop later, in midcentury.

Melbourne Court similarly reflects another early example of this wave of suburban style development in the Elmwood Historic District (East) during the 1920s. Located between Lancaster Street and Auburn Street near Delaware Avenue, Melbourne Court was initially conceived of as a 'streetless street,' which would feature a cluster of small cottages in a cul de sac pattern.[243] Built in the same year as its upper class counterpart at Mayfair Lane off of North Street in the NR-listed Allentown Historic District, Melbourne Court appealed to a slightly more modest class of residents than those who could afford the opulent English cottage style townhomes with below ground garages at E.B. Green's development further downtown. An advertisement for Melbourne Court in 1928 depicts four cottages, reminiscent of Mayfair Lane but at a much smaller scale, described as "freestanding, 7-room cottages, with historic feel and modern conveniences."[244] The development company, Gurney, Overturf and Becker, designed these modest cottages to appeal to a slightly less privileged audience than Argyle Park or Mayfair Lane, emphasizing their small manageable size but convenient location in relation to the city. The presence of garages in this development also attested to the increased affordability of the automobile by this time, largely due to innovations in mass production techniques. Although the company originally planned to construct fourteen of these cottages, only four were ever built, which was likely the result of the Depression-era economy that followed just two years later. The remainder of Melbourne Court was developed in the 1950s, when a large 3-story brick apartment building was constructed on this land at 25 Melbourne Place (c.1938, contributing). Today, both this edifice and the earlier cottages are contributing buildings to the Elmwood Historic District (East), indicating several eras of construction in the neighborhood as it has evolved over time.

As described in the nomination for the Elmwood Historic District (West), the character of the district was subtly changing in the 1920s. In the 1890s and 1900s it was common and affordable to maintain several live-in servants and staff; by the 1920s only the wealthiest could afford such a cost. The heirs of the original owners and builders could not as well afford the costs of maintaining the large houses and mansions in the Elmwood district. As a result of a decline in their popularity and the costs of maintaining these properties, many of the

[243] "Melbourne Court," (Buffalo: Gurney, Overturf and Becker, 1928), advertisement.
[244] "Melbourne Court."

large single-family residences were subdivided into apartments beginning in the 1920s. This trend was further exacerbated by the Great Depression in the 1930s.[245]

Automobiles continued to play an ever-growing role in the Elmwood district, as they did throughout the city of Buffalo and the United States at the time, and the growing congestion on the city's streets was becoming a concern in the 1920s. Designed for horse-drawn wagons, pedestrian traffic and streetcar lines, the streets were now the subject of new plans to widen them to accommodate automobile traffic. In 1922, Boston architect and urban planner Edward H. Bennett proposed a radical redesign of the city, largely to accommodate automobiles. While he largely left the local-traffic streets of the Elmwood Historic District intact, he did propose extending Richmond Avenue south through The Circle (now Symphony Circle) forming a new route parallel to Elmwood Avenue connecting to the Terrace. A similar concept was proposed in 1935, with the extension of Richmond Avenue through Wadsworth Avenue to Edward Street, creating a new thoroughfare paralleling Elmwood Avenue before connecting to a proposed high-level bridge to the Hamburg Turnpike.[246] These proposals reflect the growing significance of the automobile in thinking about the Elmwood Historic District neighborhood. Had these extensions been completed, Richmond Avenue could have become a major highway through the city of Buffalo, potentially having a devastating effect on one of the city's most intact Olmsted-designed residential streets, akin to the demise of Olmsted's Humboldt Parkway in Buffalo's East Side.

Perhaps the most significantly transformative road project for the Elmwood Historic District was a road widening project undertaken in the late 1930s which underscored a significant shift in thinking about the Elmwood Avenue area. In the late nineteenth century, the Elmwood Historic District was desirable for its natural landscape and bucolic tree-lined streets. It was a neighborhood intentionally removed from the hustle and bustle of downtown business and industry. By the 1930s, the focus on these qualities in the Elmwood Historic District was replaced by the growing importance of the automobile. In 1935, a proposal was created to widen Elmwood Avenue from 42 feet to 49 feet from Niagara Square to Forest Avenue. The Works Progress Administration (WPA)-funded project was proposed to alleviate the automobile traffic congestion on this busy route. This road widening meant the loss of hundreds of Elmwood Avenue's stately elm trees, which provided this area of the city with its natural beauty. Many residents at the time argued against this loss, "Buffalo trees certainly are becoming victims of progress," commented Mr. Edward Hall of 58 Elmwood Avenue. "I suppose we can't have beauty and automobiles as well."[247] One of the concerns with the street-widening project was that residents on Elmwood Avenue would have four lanes of traffic practically in their front yard: "…(W)e're going to have the streets come up to the doorsteps; trees felled everywhere, and the sidewalks will be so close to the

[245] Life on Elmwood, n.p. Also, culled from information in Sanborn maps that reflects the change in notation for many of the houses in the neighborhood from "D" or dwellings to "F" for flats.
[246] "Map Outlines Proposed Richmond Avenue Extension" *The Buffalo News* (Buffalo, NY), August 10, 1935.
[247] Quoted in "Better Planning Asked as Street Loses Trees," *Buffalo Evening News* (Buffalo, NY), November 8, 1938.

street that a pedestrian won't have a chance to avoid motor vehicles."[248] Perhaps the most graphic depiction of the transformation of Elmwood Avenue from stately thoroughfare to modern artery is a photograph in the *Buffalo Evening News* newspaper from November 9, 1938, titled "Widening Program Robs Elmwood Avenue Block of Stately Elms." Construction continued for over a decade on Elmwood through the 1930s and into the 1940s. In 1948, 17 elm trees were removed from the block between Lexington and West Utica Streets; at least five of them were said to have been over a century old.[249]

This sense of the closing of a chapter in the history of the Elmwood Historic District is reinforced by the removal of the streetcar lines from Elmwood Avenue in 1941 to make way for automobiles and buses.[250] As historian Mark Goldman stated "While the streetcar helped to create the modern central business district, the automobile helped to destroy it."[251] A similar statement could be made for the Elmwood Historic District. This neighborhood was built in the 1880s and 1890s largely because of the access the streetcar lines afforded this swath of land. What made this neighborhood attractive was its trees and verdant landscape. With the rise of the automobile in American society in the early twentieth century, new growth was made possible in even more distant suburban areas, and the loss of its namesake trees on Elmwood Avenue also marked an end to the initial settlement and development period of the Elmwood Historic District. The automobile had supplanted the streetcar as the primary mode of transportation, as the streetcar had succeeded pedestrian travel in the late nineteenth century. The Elmwood Historic District's overarching development character as a streetcar suburb had ended, and a new auto-centric existence lie ahead.

MIDCENTURY DEVELOPMENTS (1940s-1965)

Although the era of the streetcar had ended by the 1940s, the Elmwood Historic District (East) continued to evolve into the 1960s, as properties became available in this popular and fashionable neighborhood from the sale and subdivision of what were once large estates. As the former generation of wealthy families passed away, their heirs either could not or did not wish to maintain such large properties in the district, and beginning in the 1920s and continuing into midcentury, they often subdivided or sold their properties to real estate developers, much as Albright had done decades earlier. As a result, this period witnessed the completion of the district's formerly patchwork pattern, with developers constructing new properties on land that had previously been off limits.

[248] "Better Planning Asked as Street Loses Trees," *Buffalo Evening News* (Buffalo, NY), November 8, 1938.
[249] "Making Way for Progress," *Buffalo Courier Express* (Buffalo, NY), April 6, 1948.
[250] Natalie Green Tessier, "The Old Photo Album: Elmwood Avenue" (Buffalo: Western New York Heritage, Summer 2002), 14.
[251] Goldman, 192.

By this time, the automobile had fully replaced the streetcar as the dominant mode of transportation, leaving its mark on the urban landscape in Buffalo as well as nationwide. After the streetcars had opened up access to the area for growth and development in the late nineteenth century, the automobile and improved roads allowed the flight out of the city beginning in the early twentieth century. A new form of suburb began to appear across the country, now located far outside the city lines at distances made possible only by the automobile. The ease and affordability of automobile transportation encouraged new residential growth even further away from the urban core of Buffalo. New suburban neighborhoods developed north of the Scajaquada Creek within the city limits. The Parkside neighborhood (NR listed), which had been proposed by Frederick Law Olmsted in the 1870s, was oriented primarily towards automobile access. The area north of Hertel Avenue also developed around this time. Outside of the city boundaries, the village of Kenmore flourished on both sides of Delaware Avenue as a developers' haven beginning in the 1910s and 1920s. These new suburban neighborhoods were all made possible by the ease in transportation afforded by owning automobiles, allowing residents to commute to work in the city from greater distances.

Urban design began to give way to the demands of a new population of drivers, and the automobile became a core component of settlement patterns at this time. Efforts were made to move massive amounts of automobiles in new traffic patterns by widening streets, paving highways, integrating speed, and providing more parking lots. These road improvements led to more efficient traffic circulation and new settlement patterns in the outer ring suburbs, marking the last stage of design in the transition from streetcar to automobile-oriented settlement patterns. The construction of the Scajaquada Expressway (NY route 198) from 1959-1965 illustrates this midcentury transition in design priorities, reflecting a shift in emphasis from urban density to suburban traffic circulation. Built in order to connect Interstate 190 in the west to the NY 33/Kensington Expresway in the east, the Scajaquada Expressway provided more direct access to many of the new suburbs emerging beyond the city line at this time, generally bypassing much of the city itself. Following the old Scajaquada Creek waterway, the expressway also effectively destroyed a large portion of Olmsted's original park system plan, marking new design values during this era of development. Bisecting Humboldt Parkway and separating Delaware Park from Martin Luther King Park, the four lane expressway enabled suburban commuters to go from their houses to downtown without stopping anywhere else in the city along the way. The expressway, along with the NY 33/Kensington Expressway that it connected to the city, was completed by 1965, effectively marking the end of this transitional automobile era and thus the district's period of significance.

Amidst these changes, the Elmwood Historic District (East) managed to maintain its historic integrity, even more so than many other neighborhoods at this time. Despite the changes occurring nearby, the district remained a stable enclave of mostly upper and upper middle class residents well into midcentury. The Elmwood district was already established as a desirable community of residences and commercial offerings by this time, and thus comparatively little was destroyed there during this time. The new developments that did

occur in the district, however, were indicative of the midcentury architectural and urban design approaches occurring nationwide, but were constructed at a smaller, unobtrusive scale that did not disrupt the preexisting historic fabric of the neighborhood. Instead, these new development patterns were pocketed throughout the eastern portion of the district in a beneficial manner, fitting into the newly available land from former estates as it became available in pieces. In this way, these developments serve as microcosmic examples of similar developments occurring in the suburbs that were emerging further away from the city, in places like Kenmore. In the district, however, these new developments were incorporated without greatly disturbing the rich, historic, and comparatively dense preexisting context of the neighborhood. Instead, these midcentury developments contribute to the history of the neighborhood's transition over time, thus marking the final phase in the district's period of significance.

MIDCENTURY CUL DE SACS

This last phase of automobile-oriented development was marked by the appearance of several more cul de sacs in the Elmwood Historic District (East), designed in a somewhat similar manner to some of the earlier manifestations of this pattern that first emerged twenty years prior. The design principles of these examples are much the same as their predecessors, but their appearance in the district around midcentury warrant a separate treatment of their developments. While cul de sac streets that were developed in the 1920s indicate the early presence of the automobile among wealthy residents, later examples such as Lincoln Woods Lane, St. George's Square, St. Andrew's Walk and Rumsey Lane express the uncontested dominance of the automobile that characterized urban design in Buffalo from midcentury onwards.

Lincoln Woods Lane appeared in the Elmwood Historic District (East) in the late 1940s, extending northwest from Bidwell Parkway. The small street forms a cul de sac, populated with houses that confirm the dominance of automobiles with attached garages and driveways. One building in particular reflects the evolution of the district during this time, as wealthy residents began to reside in cul de sac streets rather than in denser neighborhoods. The Coatsworth House at 16 Lincoln Woods Lane (1897; moved 1954, contributing) represents an extreme example of this transition, where the residence was literally moved to its present location from its prior site at 66 Soldier's Place. Designed by architect Williams Lansing as a nearly exact replica of H.H. Richardson's famous Stoughton house in Cambridge, the Shingle style house was moved to Lincoln Woods Lane in 1954.[252] Its large size required that the building be split in two for the move, and it was divided on the right side of the engaged conical tower and then reassembled at the new site. The original site was then developed with several small new houses, and the house today remains at Lincoln Woods Lane as a testament to the shifting settlement patterns that occurred in the district during midcentury.

Three more examples of midcentury development patterns exist within the Elmwood Historic District (East), each constructed by the same design team. The creation of St. George's Square, St. Andrew's Walk, and Rumsey Lane can all be attributed to the real estate developer Hugh Perry and the architect Gordon Hayes. Both of these figures made a remarkable impact on the Elmwood district and the city at large. Both as a team and individually, Perry and Hayes designed, constructed and remodeled a number of streets and buildings throughout the neighborhood as it transitioned into a completely automobile-oriented neighborhood during the 1950s and early 1960s. Each of these three streets resemble cul de sacs, a dominant aspect of many of the larger suburban communities beginning to develop in communities such as Amherst, Lancaster and Williamsville. In the Elmwood Historic District (East), Perry and Hayes developed St. Andrew's Walk, St. George's Square and Rumsey Lane roughly simultaneously, as each were constructed in the early 1960s just a few blocks from each other. Perry and Hayes were both also residents of the Elmwood Historic District (East), demonstrating their extensive commitment to the area. Perry lived in a house of his own design at 756 West Ferry Street (1953, contributing), a small Neocolonial frame house set far back from the street, on the site of the former Albright estate.

St. George's Square provides an excellent, intact example of this type of midcentury cul de sac development, exhibiting many of the same stylistic features that are also present in St. Andrew's Walk and Rumsey Lane. Once the backyard of the Arnold Watson and Esther Goodyear residence, St. George's Square was laid out in 1956, extending south from Bryant Street, parallel to Oakland Place.[253] St. Andrew's Walk and Rumsey Lane similarly provide a small street extension tucked behind a larger thoroughfare, although the former does not feature a full cul de sac such as at St. George's Square. Although termed a 'square,' the street actually resembles a small cul de sac, with large trees shading the street until it culminates in a small, communal park-like island in the center of the circle. This form closely mimics the popular suburban cul de sacs emerging the Buffalo's outer ring suburbs at the time, although here is constructed on a much smaller scale.

St. George's Square contains seven houses, each constructed by 1962 in the Colonial Revival style. The architectural consistency of these houses reflects the developer's desire to construct a street that was stylistically unified, aiming to create a homogeneous, coherent community that was socially desirable at the time. Ensuring that he attracted a particular type of resident for this new development, Perry "decried the lack of homogenous architecture in Buffalo and stipulated that anyone buying a lot in St. George's Square must construct a Williamsburg type home."[254] Capitalizing on the popularity of Colonial Williamsburg as a historic tourist

[252] Charles Beveridge, "Buffalo's Park and Parkway System," in *Buffalo Architecture: A Guide* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1981), 165. Also "House is Halved for Move to New Site" *Buffalo Courier Express* (Buffalo, NY) May 12, 1958.
[253] For more on Arnold Watson and Esther Goodyear, see "Large Estates"
[254] Margaret Fess, "Williamsburg Influences New Homes on Buffalo Street," *Buffalo Courier Express* (Buffalo, NY), April 29, 1962.

destination for the middle and upper classes in the 1950s, Perry and Hayes modeled the houses at St. George's Square on the earlier colonial styles present there.

Typical of midcentury revival styles, the houses exhibited an eclectic combination drawn from both historically inspired decorative elements and modern additions, appliances and other features. A 1962 article in the *Buffalo Courier Express* marveled at these new houses, providing a glimpse into the residence of Mrs. Alfred Hammer at 42 St. George's Square (c.1963, contributing) as an example of their many amenities. The clapboard, shingle and brick house features an L-shaped plan filled with Colonial Revival elements. Assuring readers that it was "more spacious inside than it appears from the modest façade," the article boasts that the house "combines the latest in modern conveniences with the charm of Colonial design." The developer advertised the house's "gleaming kitchen replete with the latest of appliances, [which] would have amazed an original Williamsburg housewife." [255] Aimed towards a relatively well-to-do, upper middle class white family, the house included a children's den, built in cabinets, and a new stove and clothes dryer. As if to emphasize the suburban qualities of the street, the house included "an inviting entrance hall with a gracious open stairway, and a window that overlooks the backyard." This backyard was quite small in comparison to the larger lots being developed in suburban districts like Amherst or Orchard Park, but the developer and architect still echoed the setting, insisting "The yard is not large, but... it provides a park-like view."[256] Olmsted's notion of an 'Eden' is still present here, demonstrating the lasting influence of this utopian ideal in the Elmwood Historic District over time. The urge to have a 'park-like view' was by now thoroughly embedded into the construction of new streets and enclaves, attempting to provide a restful, healthy environment for residents.

As the continuation of the designs set by earlier park-like developments on median streets such as Argyle Park and Penhurst Park, St. George's Square represents the last stage in the complete conversion of the district's streetcar style development to an automobile oriented neighborhood, now fully incorporated into the city itself. For the first time in the district, attached garages were notably designed in accordance with the houses. The presence of attached garages, which also appear on St. Andrew's Walk, confirms the complete transition to automobiles by midcentury, when automobiles became prioritized as a primary component of the house itself. Designed alongside the house, these attached garages confirm the completion of this evolution, from streetcar to driveways to garages and then attached garages.

By the mid-1960s, the Elmwood Historic District (East) had completed its transition through a number of development stages, from its early-nineteenth-century pastoral character and late-nineteenth-century streetcar suburb style development, into its early-twentieth-century accommodation of the automobile and finally the dominance of automobile-oriented development in the mid twentieth century. By 1965, the district had fully

[255] Fess, 35.

transitioned into the era of automobile-centric design and architecture, thus culminating its period of significance. With this rich and lengthy history still intact in the district's architecture and urban design today, the Elmwood Historic District (East) resembles an outdoor museum of these historically significant styles as they gracefully evolved from the mid-nineteenth century to the mid-twentieth century.

NOTABLE RESIDENTS OF THE ELMWOOD DISTRICT (EAST)

A contemporary depiction of the residents of the Elmwood district described the neighborhood as "consisting of a smattering of wealth mingled with people who might be classified as in moderately comfortable circumstances," an apt characterization of the social and economic status of residents.[257] The Elmwood district attracted scores of Buffalo's growing middle and upper-middle class from a wide range of political, business and cultural backgrounds. Many of the residents who purchased or built houses in the Elmwood district had made their wealth through Buffalo's growing industrial economy. In general, many of the early homeowners here were managers, upper level staff and even owners of some of Buffalo's thriving companies. Unlike Buffalo's more working-class neighborhoods closer to downtown or in the East Side, the Elmwood district developed a character associated with wealth and leisure time. The neighborhood was composed of a large group of people of growing financial wealth and social standing, and they enjoyed recreations that demonstrated both.

The Elmwood Historic District (East) exhibited this wealth even more prominently than the western portion of the district, due to the presence of large estates owned by some of the city's most prominent businessmen. The list of these estate owners in the eastern portion of the Elmwood Historic District reads like a blue book social register of Buffalo's most historic and prominent names. Summer Street included some of the oldest wealth in the district, with several properties owned by the Goodyear family occupying the block running eastward from Delaware Avenue, as well as portions of Bryant Street and Oakland Place. After earning his initial income in the lumber industry, Charles W. Goodyear became a highly influential figure in Buffalo's industrial, financial and cultural sectors, and his family name still carries much weight in Buffalo today. Nearby, Seymour Knox Jr. received 57 Oakland Place (c.1901, contributing) as a wedding present for his marriage to Grace Millard Knox, and the backyard was landscaped in a single contiguous unit to the Knox mansion at 800 (now 806) Delaware Avenue. Families like the Knoxs and the Goodyears clustered in this portion of the district, and their large estates not only attested to their grandiose wealth but also the longevity of their presence there, before these streets were even within the city boundaries.

In just the single block of West Ferry Street from Delaware Avenue to Elmwood Avenue, historic residents such

[256] Fess, 35.

as John J. Albright, Elbridge G. Spaulding, William Gratwick, and Darwin R. Martin lived in lavish houses, many of which still exist today. Elbridge G. Spaulding resided at 688 West Ferry upon completing his run as Mayor of Buffalo and New York State Congressman, and then sold the property to Albright as he expanded his estate. Also on the site of the former Albright estate, John R. Oishei lived at 14 Queen Anne's Gate. Oishei founded the Trico Products Company, manufacturer of windshield wipers, in 1917, thus beginning a legacy of his name that continues today in the Oishei foundation.

Once Olmsted had graced the Elmwood district with his elegant park system plan, several notable residents purchased estates along the parkways in the northern portion of the Elmwood Historic District (East). The hotel magnate Ellsworth Statler located his large Esenwein and Johnson mansion at 154 Soldier's Place, just across the circle from William Heath's house, designed by Frank Lloyd Wright in 1904-1905.[258] Heath's employer, John D. Larkin was located just down the street at 107 Lincoln Parkway. Occupying the block along Lincoln Parkway from Forest Avenue to Delaware Park, his 'Larkland' estate housed his wife and children in five mansions that attest to the immense wealth he achieved at his soap company downtown. Across the street, Spencer Kellogg, Jr. hired E.B. Green to design a three story Onondaga limestone mansion at 128 Lincoln Parkway in 1912. The son of Spencer Kellogg, who made his fortune in the linseed oil and grain industries along the waterfront, Spencer Kellogg Jr. not only continued in his father's footsteps but also served as Director of the Buffalo Fine Arts Academy. A few doors away, Henry W. Wendt resided at 120 Lincoln Parkway in a Jacobean Revival style mansion. Along with his brother William, Henry was the founder of the Buffalo Forge Company, where Willis Carrier invented modern air conditioning. Nearly every address on Lincoln Parkway was associated with a prominent innovator, businessman or cultural figure in the early twentieth century, attesting to the immense wealth and elite social status that was exhibited in the district in the early twentieth century.

Oakland Place has similarly included a plethora of notable residents over the course of its history. Since it was paved and developed in 1888, several lawyers, industrialists, merchants and politicians have resided on Oakland Place. The small street could have been nicknamed "Attorney's Alley" by the early twentieth century, serving as home to six lawyers during that time, including Lyman Bass, Robert Pomeroy and Henry Ware Sprague. One of the district's real estate developers also lived on Oakland Place, William Gurney of Gurney, Overturf & Becker, who was also the uncle of noted playwright A.R. Gurney. The street also contained partners in three of Buffalo's largest department stores: James N. Adam of J.N. Adam & Co.; William Anderson of Adam, Meldrum & Anderson (AM&A's); and Herbert Meldrum of H.A. Meldrum & Co. Adam's career was not limited to retail, as he also served as Mayor of Buffalo for three terms while residing at 60 Oakland Place (1953,

[257] "Larkin's "Self-Serve" Store Winning Out," *Printer's Ink* (Buffalo, NY), April 18, 1918.
[258] For more on this residence, see "Frank Lloyd Wright's William R. Heath House"

contributing).[259] Another Oakland Place resident, Seymour Knox Jr., left a profound legacy in the city by helping to establish one of the foremost collections of modern and contemporary art in the nation at the Albright Knox Art Gallery, which also bears his name.

The Elmwood Historic District (East) also included several artists and architects as its residents, confirming its essential role in Buffalo's blossoming cultural sector in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Perhaps the most internationally famous artist who resided in the district is F. Scott Fitzgerald, who lived at 71 Highland Avenue from 1905-1908. Fitzgerald was a youth during his time in Buffalo. He had previously lived in the Allentown Historic District at both the Lenox Apartments (now Lenox Hotel) at 140 North Street and 29 Irving Place before moving to Highland Avenue at the age of nine. While on Irving Place, he reportedly spent time across the street at the Powell's house with other youngsters, and liked to swing in the attic of his own house. According to his biographer, Andrew Turnbull, the hooks for the swing still remain in the attic ceiling at 71 Highland Avenue.[260] Fitzgerald also attended Nardin Academy (1890, contributing) while living there, and remained enrolled there until March 1908, when his father lost the job at Proctor and Gamble that had brought them to Buffalo. They returned to Fitzgerald's birthplace, St. Paul, Minnesota, shortly thereafter.

Just down the street, Charles Rohlfs (1853-1936) and Anna Katherine Green (1846-1935) lived at 26 Highland Avenue (c. 1880, now demolished) in 1888 before they later moved to the Allentown district. Rohlfs was a successful furniture designer aligned with the American Arts and Crafts movement. Straying from the simple lines of his rival Gustav Stickley, Rolhfs employed a style rich in carvings, ornament and eclectic influences including from Chinese, medieval English and Art nouveau. Rohlfs' prowess as a designer is well known within the Arts and Crafts community, but his wife achieved more popular acclaim for her work as a novelist. Anna Katherine Green was one of the first writers of detective fiction in America and is still often regarded today as one of the founders of the genre in this country. Her novel *The Leavenworth Case* became a bestseller a decade before Arthur Conan Doyle published his series on Sherlock Holmes. Green wrote many of her novels when living in Buffalo, and her time at 26 Highland Avenue with Rohlfs enriched the artistic legacy of the Elmwood Historic District (East).

Several photographers also lived and worked in the area, lending an artistic presence to the Elmwood Historic District. Arnold Simson, one of the city's first professional photographers, also resided nearby at 148 St. James Place (c.1899, contributing).[261] Perhaps less well known today is that female photographer Clara Sipprell also worked out of a studio and shop at 795 Elmwood Avenue. Sipprell was an accomplished portrait photographer

[259] Wachadlo and LaChiusa, 7.
[260] Mary Kunz, "F. Scott Fitzgerald: The Buffalo Years," *Buffalo Evening News* (Buffalo, NY), February 20, 1994; Also, Charles LaChiusa "F. Scott Fitzgerald in Buffalo, NY" accessed June 10, 2015, http://www.buffaloah.com/a/fitzbflo/fitzbflo.html
[261] "Oldest Photographer in City Laid to Rest," *Buffalo Courier* (Buffalo, NY), January 24, 1922.

who won many prizes at Buffalo Camera Club exhibitions, even though her gender prevented her from becoming a member. Before she moved to Manhattan and would come to photograph the portraits of Alfred Steiglitz, Albert Einstein, and Eleanor Roosevelt, her career gained speed as she catered to her clients on Elmwood Avenue, having moved uptown from the previous studio where she worked with her brother at 487 Delaware Avenue. The presence of these many artists and amenities within just a few blocks of each other indicated the diversity of this commercial strip as well as its many cultural offerings for nearby residents.

In addition to designing houses for the wealthiest residents of the Elmwood Historic District (East), distinguished architects also chose to reside there as well. One of Buffalo's best known architects, E.B. Green of the Green and Wicks firm, lived in a house of his own design at 180 Summer Street (c. 1900, contributing). Green lived there for only a year before moving a few blocks south into his residence at Mayfair Lane, but his presence in the Elmwood district was undeniable. He designed over 25 buildings in the neighborhood alone, many of them grand mansions or institutions. His house on Summer Street was later owned by other prominent residents, including Josiah Letchworth of the Pratt and Letchworth iron works and real estate developer Darwin R. Martin.

Another notable architect, James A. Johnson, also resided in the Elmwood Historic District (East), providing significant competition for clients in the district. Johnson, of the locally prominent Esenwein and Johnson firm, lived at 731 West Delavan Street until his death in 1939. The firm designed nearly twenty buildings within the district alone, nearly all of which were in the eastern portion. Working contemporaneously to Green and Wicks, Esenwein and Johnson offered an alternative approach to clients looking to commission something slightly more innovative than E.B. Green's mastery of revival styles. Although their designs were markedly different, together these architecture firms left a considerable body of work behind, providing a thorough and diverse peek into a variety of building styles that were employed in the district at the turn of the twentieth century. Despite their differences, it is no coincidence that both Green and Johnson resided in the Elmwood Historic District (East), in the wealthiest portion of the district. Not only did this provide convenient access to many of the building sites they worked on in the district, but it also aligned their architecture firms at the same upper class level as many of their elite clients.

By midcentury, a new generation of architects resided in the Elmwood Historic District (East), continuing this tradition of living and working in this prestigious zip code. Duane Lyman, of the Bley and Lyman firm, lived at 78 Oakland Place for almost twenty years, in a Colonial Revival style house he designed for himself in 1948. Lyman not only designed several commissions throughout the district, but he also was an active member of the Saturn Club, also located in a building of his own design. Gordon Hayes also lived in the district at 541 Lafayette Avenue, just a few blocks away from his business partner, real estate developer Hugh Perry. Perry lived in a small residence of his own design at 20 Queen Anne's Gate, tucked away from the street at a deep

setback on the site of the former Albright Estate. The continual presence of architects not only building in the district, but also living there, attests to the continued historic longevity of the neighborhood as a primary destination for many of the best residences in the city.

The 1960s gave rise to another new generation of notable residents, known for their involvement in the city's historic preservation movement. By 1961, Buffalo had experienced such massive growth that some of its earliest buildings were being demolished in order to make way for new buildings downtown. At the edge of downtown, in an area that had once been a bucolic residential environment on the outskirts of the city, the Coit house at 414 Virginia Street, a contributing resource to the Allentown Historic District (Ref No 90NR01220), was particularly threatened by these developments. As a result, a group of concerned citizens living in the Elmwood Historic District (East) took action, catalyzing the birth of the modern preservation movement that is so fundamental to its revitalization today. Although they advocated for the Coit House, located outside the district, the residential presence of several members of this group in the Elmwood Historic District (East) testifies to the distinguished, influential citizenry that characterized the neighborhood during this time.

As in many cases, the historic preservation movement in Buffalo began with a small informal group of concerned citizens and grew to become a substantial, official organization over time. At this time there were not yet any local, state or federal laws to protect historic sites in Buffalo, and thus this group of architects, preservationists, artists and historians decided to band together in their efforts. When the Coit house was threatened with demolition, an Allentown resident named Olive Williams invited five men and women to discuss the matter informally over tea. Of these five figures -- Appleton 'Tony' Fryer, Gertrude Notman, Mary Josephine Broquedis and Olaf 'Bill' Shelgren Jr. -- nearly all of them lived in what is now the Elmwood Historic District (East).[262] Similarly, one of Buffalo's most recognized historians and educators, Austin M. Fox, lived at 118 Lexington Avenue (c. 1892, contributing). In doing so, they connected with seven other likeminded individuals in order to establish the Landmark Society of the Niagara Frontier. Of these seven individuals, Bill Magavern, Peter Clement, Walter Dunn, Rosey Esty, Bob Meech, Virginia Tillou, and Crawford Wettlaufer, many of them lived in the Elmwood Historic District (East). For instance, Tony Fryer lived at 85 Windsor Avenue (c.1890, contributing), Bill Magavern at 80 Cleveland Avenue (1922, contributing), and Douglas Walter at 60 Lexington Avenue (c.1890, contributing), representing just three of the many influential residents that populated the district while they contributed to the birth of the modern preservation movement in Buffalo.

Each of these citizens left a profound legacy behind, both individually and collectively, and set the city on the path of preservation that it continues to make strides in today. With the support of this new organization, Tony Fryer was able to halt demolition on the Coit house by purchasing it with his own money and then sell it to the

Priebe family under strict covenants regarding any use and alteration plans for the building. Not only was the house saved, but these actions were just the first of many that would lead to the eventual establishment of a booming preservation movement in the city today, organized by Preservation Buffalo Niagara, the child of this original group. In hindsight, another member and resident, Bill Shelgren Jr., has been identified as one of the most important figures in establishing this preservation legacy. In an article in Buffalo Spree, journalist Linda Levine reflected that he was:

> *Buffalo's first preservationist, in a true, modern, complete sense...He was there when historic preservation was a refined activity among a few...He represents a full thirty years in the growth of the preservation movement, a man of quiet power and of staying power who remained passionately on the scene long enough to tell the tale of how preservation came to Buffalo and how it evolved.*[263]

While Shelgren's contributions have been perhaps the most notable or the most diverse, these citizens have all made fundamental contributions to the history of Buffalo, as well as the history of its preservation movement. Even though their efforts began in Allentown, the majority of them were residents of the Elmwood Historic District (East), indicating the continued presence of prestigious, influential and community-minded citizens in the district as it marched towards the twenty first century.

ARCHITECTURE OF THE ELMWOOD DISTRICT (EAST)

The growth of the Elmwood Historic District occurred very rapidly, with the bulk of buildings being constructed between the 1880s and the 1920s. Given this relatively short development period, there is a great deal of cohesiveness in the vocabulary of architectural styles, materials, sizes and features present in the district. Whether architect-designed or built by a local builder or developer, the vast majority of buildings reflect common American architectural trends around the turn of the century. While a few excellent examples of earlier vernacular houses still remain, the bulk of the residential building stock in the district is composed of Queen Anne, Colonial Revival, Shingle Style, Tudor Revival, and Craftsman styles. Common to most houses in the district regardless of architectural style is a basic, comfortable box-like massing, contrasting to earlier buildings in the Allentown neighborhood whose very small, compact urban lots dictated typically elongated rectangular massing. Onto this box-like mass a variety of other elements such as gables, towers, dormers, porches etc. could be grafted. Common elements shared by these styles are front porches, regular fenestration, typically in the form

[262] Tony Fryer, "Founding of Landmark Society Inextricably Linked to Saving Coit House" Buffalo as an Architecture Museum, Accessed June 4, 2015, http://buffaloah.com/a/va/414/fryer.html.
[263] Linda Levine, "The Coit House: Prelude to Preservation," *Buffalo Spree Magazine* (November/December 2002), accessed June 12, 2015, http://www.buffalospree.com/buffalospreemagazine/archives/2002_1112/111202coit.html

of double-hung wood-frame windows, chimneys and other features. Residential architecture types include individual freestanding houses (now sometimes divided internally into apartments) and multiple family dwellings, which include duplexes and flats. There are also a handful of excellent examples of larger apartment buildings present in the Elmwood Historic District (East). Most residential examples are of frame construction, given the region's thriving lumber trade, although a few brick or stone examples are also present. Frame houses could be constructed quickly and inexpensively to keep up with the incredible demand for housing.

VERNACULAR HOUSES

The earliest extant architecture in the Elmwood Historic District is a small collection of vernacular houses, and they are significant as rare remaining examples of early residential architecture in the area. Many of the smaller, early houses and cottages from the 1850s-1870s, notable on maps, were removed or demolished to make way for larger, more stylish houses in the later nineteenth century, but a few survive intact. Some of the earliest houses built in the area would have predated the construction of good, traversable roads in the area, which began to appear in earnest in the 1870s and 1880s. While some of these houses appear to have been part of small farms, others appear to have served as housing for those lower or lower-middle class workers and tradespeople who were employed in the area, then the outskirts of the city. City directories indicate that many of the early residents of this period were carpenters, gardeners who worked in the large nurseries, or servants and coachmen for the larger houses on Delaware Avenue or North Street. Based on their architectural appearance and information from maps, these houses appear to have been constructed primarily in the 1860s and 1870s, just prior to the more widespread development in the Elmwood Historic District. Vernacular houses from this early period are primarily located at the south end of the nominated district, and along the earliest established west-east thoroughfares through the district area.

In general, these houses are of relatively smaller size and scale compared to their late nineteenth century neighbors. They are one-and-one-half stories or two stories in height and many are front gabled houses, generally three bays wide. Also common among the early vernacular houses is the L-plan variant, sometimes with a side porch. They are simply or plainly ornamented. Some examples may feature interpretations or modest elements derived from contemporary Italianate and Queen Anne styles. As many of these early houses predated the construction of neighboring properties, in many instances what distinguishes these buildings is that they are set back far from the street and don't align with the more standardized setbacks of houses constructed later. Construction is of frame, with simple wood clapboard sheathing, set on a fieldstone foundation.

There are several examples of the front gabled type of vernacular residential architecture in the Elmwood Historic District (East), recalling one of the earliest phases of its development. The house at 639 Lafayette Avenue (c.1905, contributing), a wood frame L-plan vernacular house, is one-and-one-half stories in height,

features paired entry doors with a transom, and has a porch with simple Italianate columns that wraps around the front and side elevation. Notably, this house is set far back from the street, and its lot is more generous in width, making it stand out amongst its turn-of-the-twentieth century neighbors. Likewise, 700 West Delavan Avenue (c.1892, contributing) also stands out on its street as an excellent example of this type of vernacular housing. This two-story frame, L-plan house features wood clapboard sheathing, round headed windows on the upper story and a wrap-around porch. The porch is elaborated with a turned balustrade and frieze and carved brackets, suggestive of Eastlake or Queen Anne style ornamentation. Like the house at 639 Lafayette Avenue, 700 West Delavan Avenue is set far back from the street on a more generous lot. These houses are significant as rare remaining early examples of housing that date to the era just after Olmsted's parks and parkways began to attract attention to Buffalo's 11th Ward but were built prior to the widespread real estate and development boom that replaced many existing buildings with larger Victorian-era houses.

QUEEN ANNE AND SHINGLE STYLE HOUSES

Two of the most prominent architectural styles in the Elmwood Historic District are the Queen Anne style and the Shingle Style. Both of these styles were popular in Buffalo during the late decades of the nineteenth century and into the early decade of the twentieth century, corresponding to the era when most of the construction of houses occurred in the nominated district. These two-story or two-and-a-half-story buildings contribute much of the size, scale and architectural character of the historic district. Because many were constructed on narrow urban lots, these types of buildings almost entirely feature their elaboration and detailing facing towards the street. Side elevations are much more simplified, as they were hidden from view by neighboring buildings.

These architectural styles were employed both by architects and by builders and contractors. Architects working in the Queen Anne and Shingle styles typically designed one-of-a-kind buildings for their clients, sometimes creating complex examples of Queen Anne and Shingle Style buildings with turrets, varied decorative shingles, elaborate surfaces and other features common to the style adhered to the basic box-like mass. Architect-designed buildings are typically more sophisticated, skillfully balancing the wide variety of ornamentation and design elements utilized in these styles. Builders and contractors employed the popular style in a more simplified manner, working from pattern books and plans, and often duplicated houses on multiple lots throughout the nominated district. Often built speculatively, these builder-designed houses were intentionally crafted to be fashionable but also to appeal to the greatest number of potential buyers, so they were of a more conventional design. Queen Anne and Shingle Style buildings predominate in the Elmwood Historic District (East), with their variety of peaks, gables, towers, porches, carved details and ornamental shingle work. These houses form the character of this area, where each individual building is distinctive but taken together they create a unified, harmonious architectural composition.

Architect-designed examples of the Queen Anne and Shingle Styles include works by some of Buffalo's best known and most prolific architects. Buffalo's most prominent architectural firm of the era, Green and Wicks, contributed several excellent Queen Anne examples to the nominated district, including a house built for Josephine Looney at 36 Brantford Place (1892, contributing), a two-and-a-half-story frame house with a steep side gable roof. The Looney house includes an offset entry with glazed wood door, gabled open entryway with shingled balustrade, squared wood supports, and half-timber detailing in the gable. Twin, close set, steep closed-gable dormers feature diamond shingles and flared eaves, and the house is finished with a combination of wood shingles above clapboard siding, topped with a slate roof.

The George L. Lewis house at 197 Summer Street (1890-91, contributing) also exhibits several characteristics typical of the Queen Anne style. Designed by architect C.D. Swan, the two-and-a-half story residence features an asymmetrical façade and engaged tower with hexagonal roof, typical of the style. Also characteristic of the Queen Anne style, the house includes a corbel supported turret, a partial width porch ornamented with Tuscan columns, dentils and fish scale frieze, and a porte cochere. The differing wall material contributes to the textured appeal of the Queen Anne design, with Potsdam sandstone anchoring the first floor and shingles covering the surfaces above.

Two examples of contractor or builder constructed Queen Anne buildings are located at 815 Auburn Avenue (c. 1905, contributing) and 706 Auburn Avenue (c. 1900, contributing). The basic design and form of these buildings is also common throughout the nominated district, with some slight modifications to detail, ornament and elaboration. These examples on Auburn Avenue are of frame construction, front-gabled, two-and-one-half stories in height, and feature a full-width front porch with offset entry. The front porch contains spindle balustrade and columns on wood piers. The pedimented front gable features attic windows, and in other examples this window may be paired, or even tripled, and some are set in decorative frames. This basic typology for many Queen Anne houses in the Elmwood Historic District (East) could be elaborated with decorative porch details, carved pediments above the entry stairs, decorative carved panels in the front gable, stained-glass windows, and other features selected from a builder's catalog of building elements.

The Shingle Style is sometimes grouped as a variant of the Queen Anne style while other scholars characterize it as a style in its own right. Here, the Shingle Style examples share many similarities with the Queen Anne style. Often, these houses appear with similar asymmetrical forms as Queen Anne style residences, but their façade surfaces are wrapped in wooden shingles in an attempt to unify, rather than distinguish, their separate shapes. The house at 215 Lancaster Avenue (1893, contributing) is a good representative of the style. The two-and-a-half story, cross-gabled residence features a skin of wood shingles that wraps the building. The irregular roofline is typical of the style, featuring a Dutch gambrel roof on the front façade and a two story rounded tower is pulled into the building under a continuous roofline, rather than separately emphasized as in the Queen Anne

style. Rather than creating several distinctive textured surfaces, this house typifies the Shingle style in its use of shingles to unify the building's irregular massing. The Elmwood Historic District retains numerous excellent, highly intact examples of the Queen Anne and Shingle styles, giving a good sense for the variety or shapes, details, features and designs common to these diverse architectural styles.

COLONIAL REVIVAL HOUSES

Particularly in the Elmwood Historic District (East), the Colonial Revival style is just as prominent and common as the roughly contemporary Queen Anne and Shingle styles in the Elmwood Historic District. The Colonial Revival style became popular in the country following the 1876 centennial and regained popularity slightly after the Queen Anne style in the 1890s and 1900s. The Colonial Revival, with elements derived from classical architecture, gained further interest during the many world fairs and expositions, including the influential 1893 World's Columbian Exposition in Chicago. The style broadly interpreted forms from America's colonial past such as simple massing, symmetrical facades, often with three or five bays, gambrel roofs, and mixed in classical elements such as columns, balusters, dentils and other elements.

Like the Queen Anne and Shingle styles, the Colonial Revival style examples in the nominated district are also typically two or two-and-a-half-story buildings, of frame construction, and feature much of their elaboration and detailing on the front-facing façade. Here, the massing is typically more simplified than in the Queen Anne style. Although the Colonial Revival style is scattered throughout the nominated district, many of the buildings in the style can be found in the northern area of the Elmwood Historic District (East), as this area developed slightly later than the southern area, with widespread construction occurring in the 1900s when the Colonial Revival style was at the pinnacle of its popularity. Some buildings reflect a mixed influence from the Colonial Revival and the Queen Anne style, reflective of the similarities and eclecticism between the styles and also the overlapping periods when these styles were popular. Like the Shingle Style and Queen Anne examples in the nominated district, the Colonial Revival features many contractor or builder-constructed works and several more high-style, architect designed examples.

Designed by Esenwein and Johnson for Walter P. Trible, the house at 25 Lincoln Parkway (1905, contributing) is one example of this type, featuring a three-bay façade with a hipped roof and broken pedimented dormers. Stone lintels and sills adorn eight-over-eight lights on the first floor windows, and the brick house is built in the Flemish bond pattern. The centrally placed entrance indicates the symmetry typical of the style, emphasized by a portico with broken pediment supported by fluted shaft columns that are topped with triglyphs and mutules with drops. The elegant ornamentation is echoed in the dormers, indicating the sophistication present in this high style example.

The Dutch Colonial subtype of this Colonial Revival style is also present in the Elmwood Historic District (East), as seen at 20 Berkeley Place (c.1916, contributing). This two-and-a-half story frame residence exhibits a front gambrel roof, the most common architectural element of the Dutch Colonial style. The house's front facing elevation also features a full width sun porch with multi-light windows, bisected by a prominent brick chimney and half round windows at gable end. Although the Dutch variation of this style is rarer in the district, a few examples exist at 22 St. George's Square (c.1963, contributing) and 44 St. George's Square (c.1963, contributing), easily identified by the presence of a gambrel roof.

Also found in the Elmwood Historic District (East) is a side-gabled Colonial Revival building type, drawing on many early American influences. Designed by Lansing and Beierl, 109 Chapin Parkway (1913, contributing) exhibits a side gabled roof and many other elements typical of the Georgian Revival style. The two-and-a-half story brick residence features five bays and a central entrance with side lights and a fanlight over the door. Exemplifying the style, the entrance features an ionic columned portico supporting entablature, adorned with egg and dart molding and modillions under the cornice.

Many examples of the Colonial Revival share similarities in form, massing and overall design as houses designed in the Queen Anne style, with a hipped roof with dormer or side gable design, full-width front porch, and polygonal or projecting bay on the second story. By applying classical or colonial details to this basic form, rather than Queen Anne elements, this basic house form could be translated into the various styles by builders or developers. The house at 204 Lancaster Avenue (1896, contributing) is such an example. The house has a side gabled roof, full-width front porch, and centrally placed second story porch. Three front gabled dormers with pediments project from the roof, and the largest, central dormer features a tripartite window with fanlight and decorative pilasters. On this house, corner pilasters, Doric and ionic columns and fanlights indicate the Colonial Revival style. A Palladian-motif front dormer also suggests the use of classical elements common in Colonial Revival styles.

Nationally, the Colonial Revival style remained popular, in an increasingly simplified way, through the 1950s and 1960s. In the nominated district, there are some examples of the Colonial Revival style that date from these decades, indicating the style was still in fashion in Buffalo. 39 St. George's Square (c.1959, contributing) exemplifies this later adaptation of the Colonial Revival style. Built by Hugh Perry and Gordon Hayes, the two story cross gable with hipped roof residence was directly inspired by houses at Colonial Williamsburg, where the designers traveled for inspiration. The L-shape frame residence is built on a brick foundation with wood siding, and features a single bay covered entry with wood supports. The house features a denticulated cornice typical of the style, as well as an attached one-story garage (c. 1959, contributing) that speaks to the modern adaptations of the style to suit contemporary uses. The inclusion of a garage, also inspired by the Colonial Revival style, indicates the continual evolution of these elements in order to satisfy shifting needs as the district

transitioned into the era of the automobile.

TUDOR REVIVAL HOUSES

The Tudor Revival style grew in popularity in Buffalo around the turn of the twentieth century and remained popular for several decades. Influenced by the medieval architecture of England, the style is commonly identified by its stucco and faux half-timbered surfaces and occasional use of brick or stone to add texture and character. Often, projecting bays, oriels, or entire second stories were common elements. There are several good examples of the Tudor Revival style located in the Elmwood Historic District, with significantly more present in the eastern portion of the district than in the west.

In the Elmwood Historic District (East), there are many examples of the Tudor Revival style, displaying a wide variety of interpretations of the style within a relatively small geographic area. In the former Albright tract, which stretches from Elmwood to Delaware and Cleveland Avenue to West Ferry Street, there are fourteen houses built in the style alone. While each house is unique, as a group the houses are stylistically linked in their use of Tudor-inspired elements, including steeply-pitched gabled roofs with cross gables, slate roof shingles, stucco wall cladding, decorative half timbering, asymmetrical massing with bay and oriel windows, prominent chimneys. The houses vary in scale and character ranging from the cottage-like dwelling at 64 Tudor Place (1926, contributing) to the large scale residence at 690 West Ferry Street which more closely resembles a manor house.

The Charles P. Penney house at 58 Tudor Place (1926, contributing) provides an excellent example of some of the features typical of the style, which gave the street its name. Designed by architect (and district resident) Duane Lyman, this two-and-one-half story house features a cross-gabled slate roof and stucco finished walls. The front elevation is three bays wide with window openings on the first floor, arrange in groups of four multi-light leaded casements with transoms over the end casements. The large rustic-inspired lintels over these windows are decorated with a delicate bird and branch motif.

The Louis Greenstein house at 64 Tudor Place (1926, contributing) also exhibits several characteristics indicative of the style. Greenstein, a prominent architect in Buffalo, designed his own residence on Tudor Place, attesting to the prestigious appeal of the district. The two-and-a-half story residence features an asymmetrical plan and a polychrome slate clad roof. The front entrance porch is located at the west elevation of the side gabled north wing, where the roof slopes down to include the porch and features a small copper hood. Located above the front porch is a front –gabled dormer finished in irregular courses of diagonally laid brick and decorative half-timbering. The exterior walls of this frame house also feature a variety of building materials and treatments including brick, stucco, decorative half timbering and rustic –looking wood clapboard. This

asymmetrical plan, roofline and variety of wall textures are all typical of the style, elegantly incorporated into this example.

Architect E.B. Green demonstrated his take on the Tudor Revival style in the Adams-Archbald house at 17 Tudor Place (c.1882, contributing). The house's design received much acclaim, appearing in an architectural book entitled *Artistic Country Seats*, published by the D. Appleton & Company in 1886-87 (reprinted by Dover Publications in 1982 as *American Country Houses of the Gilded Age*). The photograph that appears in this publication indicates that the house was originally built as a Shingle Style residence with Queen Anne style massing. Typical of that style, the exterior walls were sheathed in wood shingles. The house was remodeled in the 1920s, transforming it into a Tudor Revival style residence, more popular at that time. Wood shingles were replaced by decorative half timbering, making it indicative of the style. The original Queen Anne style massing of E.B. Green's design still remains intact.

CRAFTSMAN HOUSES

Craftsman (or Arts and Crafts) architecture was popular in the early twentieth century in Western New York, and the style was especially popular in Buffalo thanks to the Prairie style influences of Frank Lloyd Wright, furniture designer (and district resident) Charles Rohlfs, and Elbert Hubbard and the Roycroft arts and crafts community in nearby East Aurora. The Craftsman style was simpler and easier to build in comparison to the earlier Queen Anne and Colonial Revival styles. Its design and plan also reflected the new ways of living of the early twentieth century, as it was no longer affordable for most families to maintain a large live-in staff. Houses were built smaller and more economically for purchasers of more modest means.

Architecturally, the Craftsman style in the Elmwood Historic District is present in two basic forms: the Craftsman Bungalow and the American Foursquare. The bungalow, typically a one or two-story side gable building with a prominent front porch that is deeply recessed, is less common in the nominated district than in other areas of the city. The American Foursquare, characterized by a two or two-and-a-half story form, square or rectangular massing, generally with a hipped roof and front dormer, is the more common interpretation of the Craftsman style in the Elmwood Historic District (East). Many examples were constructed in stone, brick or wood shingle and feature elements such as exposed rafter tails and simple, battered square columns or posts on porches. Developed in the first decade of the twentieth century, Argyle Park and Clarendon Pace both feature many examples of Craftsman style houses from the 1910s and 1920s.

The house built for Court T. Champeney at 55 Argyle Park (1909, contributing) is a good example of a Craftsman style residence. This two story hipped roof frame house features an offset entrance with leaded lights and a shallow front gable with stylized vergeboard, in an adjoining full width hipped roof porch with shingle

balustrade. A low central hipped dormer features ribbon windows typical of the style. The main building, porch and dormer all have flared overhanging eaves with exposed rafters, characteristic of the style. The two-and-a-half story house at 35 Clarendon Place (c.1910, contributing) features a side gable variation of this style, with a large central front gable dormer with tripartite windows and stylized vergeboard. Like many Craftsman houses, this one also features exposed rafter tails and decorative braces.

Foursquare examples are more common in the district, especially in those areas that developed slightly later, in the early twentieth century, primarily north of West Ferry Street. The basic massing of an American Foursquare, or 'Prairie Box,' house can be seen at 19 Granger Place (c.1910, contributing), where the two-and-a-half story frame house is symmetrically oriented under a hipped roof with hipped dormers. 81 Cleveland Avenue (c.1910, contributing) displays this basic form adorned with Craftsman details. The two-and-one-half story hipped roof frame house exemplifies the Foursquare massing, complete with wood clapboard siding and a hipped dormer with paired window. The majority-width hipped roof porch features a spindle balustrade and paired tapered square supports with triglyphs. The house's overhanging roof features open flared eaves and exposed rafter tails, indicative of the style. 66 Clarendon Place (ca. 1905, contributing) also features flared eaves and exposed rafter tails, under the hipped roof of this two-and-a-half-story foursquare frame house. 24 Argyle Park (c.1916, contributing) offers another variation of the style, this time in brick rather than clapboard. The two story hipped roof house features a central wooden door with large sidelights, and a majority width hipped roof porch with large Tuscan column supports and iron balustrade. Like many Craftsman style buildings, the main roof, porch and dormer all have overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails.

Some Craftsman style houses utilize a stone or pebble finish on their exterior, drawing on associations with natural, hand-made architecture. The one and one-half story cross-gable roof house at 32 Clarendon Place (1913, contributing) provides one example of this. Pebbledash stucco siding appears on the exterior walls, with sandstone pillars supporting the partial width porch with lower pitched front gable roof. 42 Clarendon Place (ca. 1905, contributing) also features pebbledash stucco siding on this two and one-half story flared hipped roof foursquare frame house. The use of these various stone and stucco textures lends these buildings a natural, handmade appearance that aligns with the Craftsman style aesthetic and values.

OTHER RESIDENTIAL STYLES

While many of the houses in the Elmwood Historic District exemplify one of the above described stylistic categories, there are several houses that utilize less common architectural styles in their design. Some of these examples are from the district's early development in the 1860s and 1870s, prior to the widespread formulaic construction of houses. Still others were constructed by individual owners, often wealthier clients working to their own individual tastes and desires. Many other examples are an eclectic mix, combining elements and

influences from the popular styles of the day.

Although usually associated with the Allentown district to the south, the Italianate style appears in a few houses in the Elmwood Historic District (East), mostly in the southern portion due to its earlier settlement period. The Charles Miller House at 172 Summer Street (1887, contributing) provides an excellent example of the Italian Villa variation of this style. The two-and-a-half story brick house forms an L-shaped plan typical of this stylistic variation. The low pitched gable roofs feature overhanging eaves with paired Italianate scroll pendant brackets, and tall, narrow windows appear in stylistic fashion. A two-story pedimented bay window is featured on the north façade, with paired and triple windows appearing throughout the front facing exterior. The most prominent element of the building is the three-story square tower, centered at the intersection where the wing meets the L-plan of the house. A distinctive feature of the Italian Villa style, this tower features tall rounded windows topped with diamond shaped leaded glass lights in the upper sashes, tucked underneath the tower's overhanging eave adorned with paired Italianate brackets.

The Second Empire style is represented by a few extant houses in the Elmwood Historic District (East), but by the time the nominated district was reaching the boom era of construction in the late nineteenth century, the Second Empire style had faded from popularity. This style is generally associated with some of Buffalo's older residential areas, such as Delaware Avenue and the Allentown area. Located on the fringes of the nominated district close to settled areas along Delaware Avenue (Millionaire's Row) and Allentown, these houses were likely built in the 1860s or 1870s. The house at 107 Highland Avenue (ca. 1875, contributing) is a wood frame, two-and-a-half-story example, with a bracketed cornice below the signature Mansard roof. The Mansard roof is concave with two shed dormers, with a slight overhang and block modillions at the cornice. The entry is offset in a projecting tower, and the 1/1 wood windows are accompanied by multi-light casement windows with balconettes. This modest example was likely inspired by the large scale Second Empire style mansions on nearby Delaware Avenue, and examples like this one are rare in the Elmwood Historic District (East).

The Stick style also appears in the district, perhaps most prominently at 619 Lafayette Avenue (1898, contributing). The two-and-a-half-story cross gable frame residence features several qualities indicative of the style, including wood shingle siding with half timbering, a steep gabled dormer with stick styling, and flared eaves throughout the house's roofline. The house was built for Herbert H. Hewitt, the founder of the Hewitt Rubber company and Buffalo Brass. Hewitt was an accomplished industrial inventor at the turn of the century, and he filed over 20 patents that revolutionized railroad and truck transportation during his lifetime.[264] The house features several carefully crafted architectural details that attest to Hewitt's prestige and wealth. In addition to its Stick Style exterior façade, the house included 22-karat gold leaf ceilings, a grand wooden

[264] Chuck LaChiusa, "Hewitt House" http://www.buffaloah.com/a/lafay/619/stair.html

staircase and balustrade, elaborate stained glass windows, and eleven gas fireplaces, which were far more rare than wood burning fireplaces at the time.[265] Today, the Hewitt house remains largely intact, and is open to the public for overnight stays as a guest hotel, Inn Buffalo.

Cleveland Avenue also contains some examples of the Stick style. The Richard Osborne house at 194 Cleveland Avenue (1894, contributing) is one of the rare examples of the style in this district. The two-and-a-half story front gable frame house features a full width porch with Tuscan supports on clapboard piers and a plain balustrade. One over one double hung wood windows appear in the two-story offset semi hexagonal bay. The Stick style is most clearly expressed here in the overhanging shingle gable with tripartite window, where half-timber styling and vergeboard exhibit typical elements of the style. Similar decorative motifs appear at the two-and-a-half story frame house at 159 Cleveland Avenue (ca.1892, contributing). The front gable house is adorned with half-timber styling and flared vergeboard with circular cutouts, characteristic of the Stick style.

Buffalo includes several notable Prairie style buildings designed by master architect Frank Lloyd Wright, including the Darwin D. Martin House (NHL, NR Ref. No. 86000160). One of Wright's buildings can be seen within the boundaries of the Elmwood Historic District (East) is the William Heath House at 76 Soldier's Place (1904-5, contributing) where the low pitched hipped roofs extend outwards towards the street through overhanging eaves, characteristic of Wright's design.[266] This style was frequently mimicked by other builders and contractors, although they lacked Wright's genius and used more conservative forms. In many instances, including examples in the Elmwood Historic District (East), the Craftsman style was infused with elements of the Prairie style, such as ribbon windows, broadly overhanging eaves, side entries and other elements. A rare example of a house that has a strong Prairie style influence, with some Foursquare elements, is the house built for Herbert W. Turk at 94 Windsor Avenue (c.1907, contributing). The two-and-a-half story hipped roof house features an overall Foursquare massing rather than the low-slung profile common to Wright's examples, but has a partial-width first level porch that features a low pitched hipped roof with broadly overhanging eaves. While the porch roof is typical of the Prairie style, the exposed rafter tails are a distinguishing feature of the Craftsman style.

Several examples of the Prairie style exist in the Elmwood Historic District (East), prominently in the northern portion of the district due to age. The house at 794 Auburn Avenue (ca.1905, contributing) represents another adaptation of the Prairie style, featuring Foursquare massing with a hipped roof and wide overhanging eaves. The two and a half story hipped roof frame house next door at 790 Auburn Avenue (ca. 1916, contributing) exhibits a slightly later adaptation of the style. The front facade features a stacked stone foundation and

[265] Colleen Bishop and Nation Benson, "Historic Buffalo Mansion Reopening to the Public" *WGRZ News (*Buffalo, NY*)*, Feb 19, 2015.
[266] For more on this residence, see "Frank Lloyd Wright's William R Heath House"

chimney as well as stucco siding, characteristic of the Prairie style. The two-story hipped roof house at 604 Bird Avenue (ca. 1916, contributing) similarly features a stone foundation and stucco siding with Prairie elements. A prominent stone chimney is exposed and centrally placed on the façade, emphasizing the naturally appearing stonework that culminates in a first floor partial width hipped roof sun porch. An offset recessed entryway is placed in a shed roof extension from the main building, further emphasizing the natural qualities and textural detailing of the façade's stucco and stone exterior.

The majority of houses in the Elmwood Historic (East) can be described as drawing elements from one or more of the typical nineteenth century styles. Builders and contractors who constructed houses speculatively tried to appeal to the greatest number of potential buyers and intentionally designed modest, more conservative houses in the popular styles of the day. Individual homeowners may have contracted to have more elaborate examples built for them, showcasing their wealth and status; however, the vast majority do not deviate very far from the norm. Overall, there is a sense of unity and harmony that distinguishes the Elmwood Historic District.

MULTIPLE-FAMILY DWELLINGS, DUPLEXES AND FLATS

While individual single-family houses dominate the residential architectural of the Elmwood Historic District, the widespread popularity of the area led to the development of many two-family or multiple-family dwellings. These buildings were meant to cater to the middle-class residents who could not afford to purchase a house outright and often were financed or rented directly from real estate developers. Some of these two-family buildings were marketed to buyers who could live on one level and rent out the other to help finance the purchase. These houses indicated new ways of living that were becoming prominent in the country after the turn of the twentieth century, offering an attractive option between living in a tenement house and owning a single-family residence. Architecturally, these multiple-family dwellings were designed to fit into the surrounding neighborhood and are often difficult at first glance to discern. Their appearance was generally due to two factors; deed restrictions and zoning that governed the type and size of building that could be constructed and the aspiration of individual home ownership. They utilize the same architectural styles as previously described for individual residences and were generally of the same height (ranging between two and three-stories in height) and materials as the surrounding buildings. Many of these buildings were built around the turn of the twentieth century or in the early decades of the twentieth century. As a result, many of these buildings were constructed in the northern area of the nominated district, which developed slightly. There are three broad categories of multiple-family dwellings in the district: small apartment buildings, duplexes (also called twin units), and flats. These latter two types strongly resemble the individual, single-family house in size, scale, materials and architectural design.

Another type of multiple-family building found in the Elmwood Historic District (East) is the duplex, which

indicates two individual residential units, each featuring its own separate entry, that share a common party-wall and typically share common features or architectural elements. The overall effect emphasizes the appearance of two similar parts combined as a whole, rather than mimicking the appearance of the individual single family house. Sometimes, these duplex buildings are created as mirror-image buildings. The buildings at 28 and 33 Oakland Place (1898, contributing) provide one of the more elegant variations of this type. Maximizing the use of this narrow lot, the buildings occupy separate addresses but actually share a thick party wall.[267] Together, 29 and 33 Oakland Place present a balanced and unified façade, serving as mirror images of one another. Both of these two-and a half story houses feature a hipped roof with flared eaves and front gabled dormers. The windows are nine-over-nine sash, and a Palladian window on each side highlights the main staircases. The original porch remains at 29 Oakland Place, supported by smooth Tuscan columns.

Another type of duplex is frequently symmetrical in plan, featuring a double-loaded corridor with mirror-image apartments on either side. The building at 32 and 34 Granger Place (ca. 1910, contributing) operates as a duplex that occupies two separate addresses within a single building. The two-and-a-half story brick house was built by architect Charles Jekel as a side-by-side duplex. The house features Craftsman details such as exposed rafter tails under its hipped roof and central dormer, and mimics the appearance of a single family house with a unified mirror-image facade. The symmetrical plan includes a separate entrance for each apartment, set back from the full width porch on either end of the house.

The third type of multiple-family dwelling in the Elmwood Historic District (East) divides its residential units vertically, typically with one unit stacked on the other. This type of building is known as a flat. Flats are common in the city, especially in neighborhoods that developed in the 1910s and into the pre-war era. These types of buildings, as advertised by local developers such as Harry E. Phillips, offered homeowners the chance to rent out one unit and apply that rent towards their own mortgage or house payment. These buildings were also popularized in the pattern books of the era. Streets lined with these types of houses characterize the Hertel Avenue/North Buffalo area and the East Side of the city and not the Elmwood Historic District. However, there are a few examples located in the nominated district, primarily constructed in the early decades of the twentieth century. Like the other types of multiple-family residential buildings noted, this type was also built in the same architectural styles as single-family residential houses.

Flats are generally two-and-a-half stories in height, frequently are of brick (generally brick veneer over wood frame) on the lower story with wood clapboard or shingle above. They often have a hipped roof with front dormer window, although sometimes they have a front-gable profile. One of the most definable features of a flat is the dual level full-width front porch, allowing access to the outdoors for both the upper and lower level flats.

[267] Wachadlo and LaChiusa, 36.

Sometimes the lower level porch is partially or fully enclosed, with an open porch on the second story. In some instances, both the upper and lower porches were enclosed. As this type of housing was popular in the early decades of the twentieth century, the majority are decorated with modest Craftsman or Colonial Revival influenced elements, although there are examples that feature late Queen Anne forms such as front-gable massing, shaped shingles and polygonal bays.

Flats became popular during the later development period of the Elmwood Historic District, and therefore they are more common in the eastern and northern areas of the nominated district. The two-and-a-half story front gable frame house at 776 Auburn Avenue (c.1900, contributing) is one example of the style. The full width front porch with tapered square supports features a plain wood balustrade and a roof deck on the second floor, providing porch space for the second-story apartment. The two-and-a-half story cross gabled house at 812 Auburn Avenue (ca. 1895, contributing) similarly features a dual level full width porch, complete with a simple wood balustrade on both levels. The house at 615 Bird Avenue (ca. 1905, contributing) provides another example of this building type. The two-and-a-half story front gable house features modest Queen Anne styling, including a pediment crown with sunburst detailing. The full width flat roof porch features a plain wood balustrade and square supports on piers, complete with a roof deck for the second-story apartment.

APARTMENT BUILDINGS

While apartment buildings are also multiple-family dwellings, they differ from the previously discussed category in that they are larger buildings, usually several stories in height, and feature numerous apartment units that would be rented from a single landlord or owner. In some instances, they combine commercial space on the ground level with residential floors above. In the Elmwood Historic District they are generally of masonry or steel-frame construction, rather than the more common wood-frame construction of individual single-family or multiple-family houses. Practically, this provided better fire protection for the multi-story, multi-unit buildings, but it also added a level of prestige and elegance to the design and appearance of the building. Most are three to four stories in height, indicating they may be walk-up type apartments without an elevator originally installed. Some apartment buildings were constructed mid-block, surrounded by houses, while other, typically larger, examples were constructed at street corners and intersections, allowing for two sides of the building to face the street and maximizing light in the building. Many apartment buildings were located at or near streetcar stops. Whatever their construction method and materials, apartment buildings were given an architectural treatment in keeping with the popular architectural styles of the day. They are present in the nominated district in a wide range of styles, including Tudor Revival, Classical Revival, Spanish Renaissance style, Neogothic Revival and others common throughout the area.

Apartment building living became increasingly popular for all types and social classes of people in the late

nineteenth and early twentieth century. For those of more modest means, renting an apartment was often a cost effective alternative to individual home ownership at a time when obtaining a mortgage was a difficult process. Apartment living also became popular for the upper-middle class, especially with younger or unmarried people. This type of living did not require the high cost of upkeep or employing a large staff, like owning a large individual house required. The building at 385 Elmwood Avenue (ca. 1905, contributing) provides one example of this building type. Located directly on Elmwood Avenue, these apartments would have been more affordable than some of luxury high rises tucked away from the commercial district. The three-story flat roof apartment building features a shard central entry with sidelights and a shallow leaded elliptical transom. The building features Colonial Revival styling, including a water table course, brick quoins, and wide cornice trim. A pyramid cupola adorns the roof, and a partial width open landing porch occupies the entrance. The house at 415 Elmwood Avenue (ca. 1910, contributing), now the site of the Community Music School, exhibits another example of this building type. The three story flat roof apartment building there similarly features Colonial Revival style elements such as a water table course and belt course above the second story.

The Elmwood Historic District (East) also contains examples of a later form of apartment building, which catered to both the upper and upper middle classes. Architecturally, they embody a broader cultural change in lifestyles that occurred in the early twentieth century, both in Buffalo and the nation overall. During this time, a significant portion of the wealthy elite abandoned their large residential estates for these newly fashionable luxury apartments- trading in a more pastoral way of life for a more dense, urban one. Particularly in the 1920s, this kind of elegant, amenity-rich apartment living was immensely popular in major cities like New York, San Francisco and Chicago, and Buffalo was no exception to this trend. Mansions and landscaped grounds had by this time become extremely laborious and pricy to maintain, requiring space for a live in staff on real estate that had become in higher demand as the city's population grew. By offering competitive, seductive packages to prospective wealthy tenants, many of these new apartment buildings were successful in persuading wealthy district residents to sell their large landscaped grounds in favor of the benefits and bonuses of high rise living. Some of the amenities that they included would today make even some of the best hotels blush, including private maids on hand twenty four hours a day, a kitchen staff for each apartment, technologically sophisticated elevators, large apartments filled with light, gymnasiums and pools, a concierge, valet parking and rooftop terraces.[268] For those who could afford them, these distinguished high rise apartment buildings provided a luxury experience for wealthy residents looking to "discard some of their domestic cake yet keep the flavor."[269] Furthermore, economic changes and advancements in transportation methods demanded a new form of urban living after the First World War, when many cities were on the cusp of a great financial boom. Combined with

[268] Claire Ross, *Parke Apartments*, NR. Ref. No. 07000492. National Register of Historic Places. (Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, January 2007), 12.

[269] Ellen Taussig, *Your Host, Peter Gust of the Park Lane Restaurant: His Story (*Boston: Herman Publications ,1979), excerpt accessed May 22, 2015, http://wnyheritagepress.org/photos_week_2011/norton_park_lane/norton_park_lane_2.htm.

these factors, the free spirited ambience of 1920s further promoted the success of these apartment buildings, which offered a stylish new vision of wealth without the burden of all its caretaking responsibilities.[270]

The transition to high rise apartment living made a particularly pronounced impact on the Elmwood Historic District (East), where many of these older mansions and large estates were formerly located. As properties belonging to the Albrights were sold off in pieces to developers, these areas were developed with rows of modest single-family houses on new streets such as Tudor Street and St. Catherine's Court, or median streets like Argyle Park and Penhurst Park. Occurring contemporaneously to this next wave of streetcar-suburb style expansion, multistory apartment buildings were beginning to rise higher than ever before, in vertical compounds surrounded by small landscaped courtyards. Historian Ellen Taussig asserts, "By 1924, the exodus from the great Delaware mansions had begun."[271] This decade marked an important transitional time in the Elmwood Historic District (East), as larger estates were minimized or sold entirely, and a wave of newer, high-rise style construction began.

Advancements in building technology and architectural design also contributed to the emergence of the tall, multi-story apartment building. Many of these apartment towers were constructed with a skeleton of steel reinforced concrete. While this construction system had been widely used for factory and commercial building construction, by the 1910s and 1920s its use became more widespread in other building types. Reinforced concrete construction provided benefits such as being relatively inexpensive to build, generally fire resistant, and the internal cage-like steel skeleton allowed for interior partitions to be located in the building with great freedom. The non-structural exterior walls allowed for large windows, perfect for illuminating apartment spaces. They allowed for plenty of light, good ventilation and excellent views of the city, appealing to a new class of apartment residents that was now no longer associated solely with crowded tenements.

Furthermore, these high rises were typically placed on carefully landscaped grounds or courtyards, once again reflecting the broader historical context of architectural design values at this time. In 1922, the renowned European architect Le Corbusier presented his vision for a contemporary city, which he called "Ville Contemporaine," to great acclaim. The design scheme was centered on a group of sixty story, cruciform shaped towers, surrounded by ample green space and landscaping. There, residents would live and work in glass high rises, using the circulation system below, which segregated pedestrian paths from buses and glorified the automobile. When they were in need of fresh air and greenery, residents of this ideal city could utilize the large, rectangular blocks of open ground surrounding the towers. This idea, often termed "the tower in the park," quickly gained speed in the 1920s, and continued to influence modernist design well into the 1960s and

[270] Elizabeth Hawes, *New York, New York: How the Apartment House Transformed the Life of the City (1869-1930)* (New York: Random House Publishing, 1996), 37.
[271] Taussig, part 3.

1970s.[272] In Buffalo, the early seeds of this revolutionary idea were planted in the new high rise apartment buildings like 800 West Ferry Street, which resembled a small scale version of a tower in the park and thus ushered in a new era of modern design in the district.

The Elmwood Historic District (East) contains a few examples of luxury high rise buildings, of which there are none in the western portion of the district. Like the Campanile and the Park Lane apartment building, 800 West Ferry Street was aimed to attract some of the wealthiest and most prominent residents in the city. Built by real estate developer Darwin R. Martin and designed by architect Duane Lyman at the Bley and Lyman firm, the building was completed in 1929, just a few months before the onset of the Great Depression. At the cost of approximately one million dollars, Lyman designed this luxury high rise apartment building in conjunction with Martin, son of the Larkin company executive and patron of Frank Lloyd Wright. Together, Lyman and Martin Jr. developed the property on the former site of the William Gratwick residence. The conversion of the large Gratwick estate in order to construct this high rise was certainly indicative of this new era. Formerly part of the Albright estate, the Gratwick residence was demolished in 1929 during the construction of 800 West Ferry Street, marking a significant transition between large estate land ownership to a more densely developed, urban style of accommodation.

The real estate developer and architect designed 800 West Ferry Street to attract a wealthy clientele, aimed towards potential residents who might be a younger generation of their parent's older wealth, or simply those who were looking to shed the many responsibilities of owning a large estate within the city. Built of brick and stone in the Gothic Revival style, the building was placed at a significant setback from the street to accommodate the surrounding landscaped grounds. Tudor Revival elements are also incorporated into the exterior ornamentation, which features a Venetian gothic revival style entrance, multifoil tracery in ogee arches, and other Tudor style arches and quoins. One of the most unique decorative forms exhibits the face of Martin himself, which adorns the stone gargoyles projecting from the uppermost floor.

Inside, the building originally contained twenty-one duplex units and four single units, although today the latter are the only units that remain in their original form, on the first floor. An advertisement for a two-floor duplex unit at 800 West Ferry appeared in 1932, describing "6 bedrooms, 5 baths, living room, dining room, library, large kitchen, separate pantry, 2 dressing rooms, lavatory, light, heat, gas, refrigeration, garage space for $450 per month - 40% less than regular rate."[273] Today, that cost would be equivalent to about $7000 per month. Accommodations of this size and cost were clearly aimed towards the city's wealthiest citizens, who would

[272] Von Moos, 10. For more on the 'Tower in the Park' concept, see Florian Urban, *Tower and Slab: Histories of Global Mass Housing* (New York: Routledge, 2013).

[273] Erlanger Theatre program, December 1932, advertisement. Accessed May 23, 2015, http://buffaloah.com/a/wferry/800/af.html.

likely be more comfortable transitioning from a mansion to these opulent quarters. Additionally, the inclusion of garage space reflects the growing impact of automobiles on architectural design in the 1920s, and by this time many wealthy citizens owned cars.[274]

The building has included many notable residents, including Darwin R. Martin himself. Although he initially intended the building to be a real estate investment, a stroke of poor timing resulted in the adjustment of his finances at the onset of the Great Depression. Martin and his wife moved into the top two floors of the building, and also provided adjacent accommodations for his sister and brother and law, as well as his mother Isabelle R. Martin for a few brief years towards the end of the Depression. The tenth floor off the elevator still provides a glimpse into the original Martin entrance hall today, and unit 11a was subdivided out of his original bedroom suite and bathroom. The building was subdivided in 1940 to accommodate more tenants, and in 1980 the building became a condo association. Today, 800 West Ferry Street still towers over many of the buildings in the Elmwood Historic District (East), providing luxurious apartments to some of neighborhood's wealthiest residents.

For those that could not afford such opulent accommodations, a few other apartment buildings arose contemporaneously in the Elmwood Historic District (East) to serve the middle or upper-middle class residents in the neighborhood. Priced more affordably than the luxury units at 800 West Ferry, the Campanile or the Parke Lane, apartment buildings such as the Windsor and the Stuyvesant offered mid-range accommodations that were stylistically inspired by these grander examples. Several of these more modest apartment buildings in the Elmwood Historic District (East) were built in a remarkably similar U-shaped plan, reflecting the predominance of this building type and architectural style in the 1920s through their roughly contemporaneous designs. The Windsor at 702 West Ferry Street (1924, contributing) and the Stuyvesant at 245 Elmwood Avenue (1926, contributing) both exhibit similar plans and motivations in housing a middle class population of residents. Rather than constructing a high tower surrounded by a small park, these buildings instead feature U-shaped plans that accommodate a small courtyard tucked away from the street. In doing so, these buildings provide a combination of city living and landscaped grounds on a modest scale.

Both the Windsor and the Stuyvesant serve as examples of this architectural typology, the U-shaped courtyard apartment building. Popular throughout the United States in the 1920s, the courtyard apartment building is typically a medium density housing type comprised of apartment units wrapped around a decorative, small-scale courtyard. In its U-shaped variation, the building mass wraps around the lot by creating a central court, which functions as a shared public green space. Protected from wind and traffic on three sides by the building itself,

[274] Wolfgang Sachs, *For Love of the Automobile: Looking Back into the History of our Desires* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996), 115.

yet open to the street on the fourth side, these green spaces provided a semi-private, quiet atmosphere for the apartment building, yet was still visible to the public and traffic beyond.

Courtyard apartments evolved from a much earlier form of the courtyard house, dating back to ancient Rome. The Roman house, or domus, of antiquity was an edifice that wrapped around one or two central interior courts. These courts usually took form as an atrium, wrapping around a central pool to catch and harvest rainwater, or a peristylium, which typically featured a central garden watered by the rain and open to the elements. This exposure to the elements, providing light, air and greenery to the heart of the building, remains a central component of this typology today.

The courtyard apartment evolved more recently in the United States as a multi-family housing type, usually for middle class residents. Frank Lloyd Wright's Mecca Flats (1891) was one of the earliest example of a courtyard building in Chicago, featuring a multi-entry walk-up apartment building with a courtyard open to the street.[275] On the way into the main entrance of the Mecca Flats, much like the Stuyvesant Building over twenty years later, tenants traversed what historian Daniel Bluestone has described as, "the apartment equivalent of a suburban lawn, a 'miniature park."[276] In contrast to an apartment building whose façade faced only the street, a U-shaped apartment building was able to expose a greater percentage of rooms to the elements of light and air that flooded the internal courtyard. In 1907, Herbert Croly published an article in Architectural Record entitled "Some Apartment Houses in Chicago," which described and illustrated several early South Side Chicago courtyard apartment buildings.[277] This article was one of the first to introduce this type of building to the rest of the country. By the 1920s, the courtyard apartment typology had become prevalent across the country, and was adapted by cities that, like Buffalo, were seeking new housing solutions for their growing populations.

One example of this building type can be seen in the Elmwood Historic District (East) in the Stuyvesant at 245 Elmwood Avenue (1921, contributing). This seven-story apartment building executes the U-shaped plan at a slightly larger scale than the Windsor. Similarly constructed in brick, the Stuyvesant towers higher than the Windsor, and is atypically tall for this typology. Windows adorned with brick lintels, as well as decorative balconettes, let light from the courtyard into the apartment interiors. The U-shaped plan ensures that much of the building retreats into the solace of this courtyard, yet the portions of the building that are directly adjacent the street provide commercial space on the first floor along its bustling Elmwood Avenue frontage. A two-story rounded projection with a roof balustrade appears at street level in the north wing, providing commercial space currently occupied by an art gallery.

---

[275] Daniel Bluestone, "Chicago's Mecca Flat Blues" in *Giving Preservation a History*, edited by Max Page and Randall Mason (New York: Psychology Press, 2004), 153.
[276] Bluestone, 152.
[277] Herbert Croly, "Some Apartment Houses in Chicago," *Architectural Record* 21(February 1907), 119-130.

The Stuyvesant is also associated with several prominent historical figures. The building was developed by Darwin R. Martin, son to the Darwin D. Martin who commissioned Frank Lloyd Wright to build his massive house north of Delaware Park, and it was one of his first endeavors as a real estate developer, in 1921. This building, along with the Stuyvesant Plaza he also owned across the street, was eventually so profitable for Martin that he was able to construct the luxury high rise building at 800 West Ferry Street just a few years later in 1929. Martin and his first wife, Margaret Wende, even lived on the top floor of the Stuyvesant after their wedding in 1926, before they moved to 800 West Ferry Street.

The building's name, the 'Stuyvesant,' also evoked some historical associations, and likely had multiple meanings for Martin. His mother, Isabelle Reidpath Martin, was allegedly a distant relation to Margaret Stuyvesant, sister to Peter Stuyvesant, the Dutch seventeenth century Director-General of Manhattan. His name figures prominently in the early history of New York City, and thus lent an air of aristocratic distinction to Martin's family line and to the building itself. The name also recalls a grander historic example of an upper-class apartment building named after the same figure- the original Stuyvesant building in New York City. Designed in 1869 by Richard Morris Hunt, the Stuyvesant was one the first American examples of a Parisian-style luxury apartment building, and its elegant design helped to debunk some of the previous assumptions that urban apartments were solely the realm of the lower classes.[278] By invoking the name and associations of the 'Stuyvesant,' both in terms of the historical figure and the renowned New York building, the developer Darwin R. Martin was likely trying to lend an air of grace and inspiration to these more modest accommodations. In doing so, he effectively attracted an upwardly mobile middle class to this building when they could not afford the more expensive options at his other location.

Martin owned this building for most of his life, operating the Stuyvesant as both an apartment complex and a hotel until the early 1970s. Guests could stay for one or two nights as in a hotel, or, if they desired, could rent an apartment for a more extended stay in the city. The building offered a diversity of rooms, ranging from the lavish Governor's suite, which featured a fireplace and elegantly furnished parlor, to the more affordable, basic bedroom, which included a simple, tasteful bed, nightstand and dresser. Those looking to rent an apartment could find dependable, modest accommodations at the Stuyvesant. A classified advertisement from 1969 described some of the modern amenities present in every room, regardless of size: "all General Electric appliances, stove, refrigerator, dishwasher, disposal units, central air-conditioning and carpets." The rates for these apartment rentals, the advertisement states, begin at $158 per month. This rate, equivalent to about $1000 today, indicates the target resident for the Stuyvesant was likely middle or upper-middle class, perhaps even upwardly mobile in stature. The price, when adjusted for historical inflation, would have still been 1/7 of the

[278] Christopher Gray, "Apartment Buildings, the Latest in French Ideas" *New York Times* (New York, NY), July 11, 2013.

cost of renting an apartment in Martin's other building at 800 West Ferry Street. Although priced too high to be considered truly 'affordable' to the average citizen, the Stuyvesant apartments, and hotel, were aimed at a middle and upper-middle class audience.

One of the most notable guests to stay at the Stuyvesant was the renowned jazz guitarist Herb Ellis, who stayed at the for six months in 1947. During that time, Ellis, along with pianist Lou Carter and bassist John Frigo, formed the Soft Winds trio, modeled after the Nat King Cole trio. Ellis told a reporter in 1996 about his time at the Stuyvesant, labeling it as a transformative moment in his career. He stated, "The three of us had played together some with the big band. John Frigo...knew the owner of the Stuyvesant Hotel in Buffalo. We went in there and stayed six months. And that's how the group the Soft Winds were born."[279] During their stay, they played frequently, sometimes even nightly, in the Peter Stuyvesant Room on the ground floor of the building.

Known more commonly as the 'Stuyvesant Room,' this lounge and adjacent restaurant feature lively jazz music, dancing and cocktails for about four decades, from the 1920s-1960s. Serving both hotel guests, apartment residents and nearby locals, the Stuyvesant Room was celebrated for its tasteful décor, delicious food and upscale atmosphere. Although it no longer operates today (and the space is occupied instead by the Stuyvesant Art Gallery), some Buffalo citizens still remember the Stuyvesant Room fondly. In a recent newspaper article, Zona Shreves remembers it as an excellent place to go for a special occasion, stating "My sister's wedding reception was held at the Hotel Stuyvesant in 1953. It was so glamorous, to my young mind, with a curving staircase leading from the banquet room down to the bar, recessed lighting, a grand piano – and my first taste of caviar!"[280] Today, the Stuyvesant no longer operates a hotel, and instead was sold to New York State shortly after Martin's death in 1969 (after the period of significance). It still functions as an apartment building, however, providing graceful accommodations for senior citizens in the same, intact, U-shaped plan.

The Windsor, a five-and-a-half story apartment complex located at 703 West Ferry Street (1924, contributing), provides a slightly more modest example of this type of courtyard apartment building. This brick building illustrates a U-shaped plan, featuring a small, manicured courtyard in the center of the complex that is surrounded by the building on three sides. On each floor, paired double hung wood windows, adorned with stone sills, flat brick lintels and scrolled terra cotta keystones, let plenty of light from the courtyard into the apartments. Several terra cotta details lend a sense of elegance to this brick building, including elaborate cornice details with rosettes, dentils and modillions. While this economically designed building would have targeted the middle-class resident of more modest means, located on the busy streetcar and automobile thoroughfare in the 1920s, these decorative motifs lend an air of distinction and modest dignity to the building,

[279] Robert Dupuis, "Interview with Lou Carter and Herb Ellis." *Blew Notes* (Chicago, IL), 1996.
[280] Zona Shreves, "Readers share memories of their favorite restaurants" *Buffalo News* (Buffalo, NY), January 23, 2013.

more subtly rendered than in the elaborate gargoyles of the more luxurious accommodations at 800 West Ferry Street (1929, contributing), erected a few years later down the street.

The broad range of apartment buildings available in the 1920s demonstrates an important cultural, socioeconomic shift in the Elmwood Historic District's upper and middle classes during this time. Particularly in the Elmwood Historic District (East), the abandonment of large estates in favor of high rise towers or apartment buildings with courtyards made a dramatic impact on the character of the neighborhood. As some of this older land became available, developments began to arise in the form of both newer, small streets filled with single family houses as well as the simultaneous construction of a new form of urban living, manifested in the apartment building. Even throughout the Great Depression, residents continued to migrate towards these two new development types in the eastern portion of the district, occupying apartment buildings as well as small individual houses. All of these shifting patterns were guided by the growing dominance of the automobile, which continued to impact the neighborhood's settlement pattern into the 1940's.

After World War II, apartment buildings continued to appear in the district, reflecting a new design consciousness and shifting urban pattern by midcentury. High rises continued to appear, but their styles no longer reflected the revival designs of the 1920s and buildings instead utilized the modernist and international styles that were popular during the 1950s and 60s. The building at 1217 Delaware Avenue (1963, contributing) exemplifies this type of building, towering high above the Elmwood district and instantly recognizable for its blue façade. Erected in 1963, this apartment complex boasted the latest modern amenities inside, complete with new kitchen appliances and adjacent parking space. The high rise features cantilevered balconies for each apartment, exhibiting the sophisticated technological advancements that building construction underwent during this decade. The modernist architectural style of this building clearly demonstrate its inception in the 1960's, but many of its main features recall the notion of a 'tower in the park,' thus effectively marking a later phase in this longer legacy of apartment living in the Elmwood district.

Apartment buildings continued to appeal to residents of the Elmwood Historic District (East), evident the construction of several more, even after the period of significance. 666 West Ferry Village (1980, non-contributing), 680 West Ferry Street (2002, non-contributing), 770 West Ferry Street (1973, non-contributing) and 673-675 Potomac Avenue (2007, non-contributing) all offer apartment accommodations for Elmwood district residents who are unable or uninterested in purchasing an individual house. While all of these apartment complexes are non-contributing to the Elmwood Historic District (East) due to their later construction dates, their presence attests to the continued desirability of living in the Elmwood district today.

COMMERCIAL ARCHITECTURE

While the nominated district is largely composed of residential architecture, Elmwood Avenue is a primary commercial corridor in the city. This corridor largely developed beginning in the early decades of the nineteenth century along the Elmwood Avenue streetcar route, which later became a prominent automobile thoroughfare. Commercial architecture in the Elmwood Historic District broadly takes two forms. One form is the converted residential building, and the other is those buildings that were originally built as commercial buildings. Some examples of both types of commercial buildings also incorporate residential apartments. There are examples where a residential building has been converted to commercial functions but is otherwise architecturally and visually intact. Architecturally, both types of commercial building were generally designed utilizing the common architectural vocabulary and styles of the day. Queen Anne, Colonial Revival, Tudor Revival and Craftsman style commercial buildings are all present in the nominated district.

An early example of an overtly commercial building in the Elmwood Historic District (East) is the building at 771 Elmwood Avenue (1915, contributing). The building's original storefront is still intact, attesting to the continued commercial function of this building for one hundered years. The building at 423-425 Elmwood Avenue (1917, contributing) provides another example, where the first floor features a commercial storefront with multi-light transom windows. The building also features decorative vertical brickwork evocative of the later Art Deco style.

Another early commercial building that was constructed during the development of the Elmwood Historic District is the building located at 743 Elmwood Avenue (1894, contributing), at the corner of Cleveland Avenue. The two-and-a-half story front gable Queen Anne frame house features a single story storefront addition with glass ribbon windows, an offset glass door, and a red curved projecting awning-style roof. This building is a good example of the attempt to blend the commercial architecture into the residential areas of the nominated district.

There are also examples of larger scale mixed-use commercial buildings, with a handful located in the residential area but others located on Elmwood Avenue. One of the most elegant examples in the nominated district is The Lexington, located at 220 Lexington Avenue (ca. 1905, contributing). The Lexington is a three-story mixed-use building, with ground floor commercial spaces and residential apartments on the upper two levels. The building is of yellow brick construction, with a brick and Medina sandstone ground level, and features elegant Queen Anne ornamentation. The four storefronts are historic and feature paneled bulkheads, recessed entry doors and a large transom spanning each space. Two-story projecting polygonal bays on the two primary facades feature carved panels, and windows feature shaped sandstone headers with voussoirs. In the Elmwood Historic District (East), 715-721 Elmwood Avenue (ca. 1905, contributing) exemplifies this type of mixed-use commercial building. The three-story brick building features sheet glass storefront windows and recessed glass doors with arched hoods on the first floor, providing commercial space to several businesses.

The second and third floors provide office and residential space, some with two-story bay windows with fluted mullions. Colonial Revival styling is evident throughout the exterior façade, uniting the mixed-use building with a consistent design motif.

As the historically residential Elmwood Avenue continued to develop into a commercial strip serving the growing Elmwood residential neighborhood, commercial buildings designed during the early twentieth century continued to utilize popular designs and styles from that era. One of the best examples of a commercial building is located at 431 Elmwood Avenue (1926, contributing), where the building's design confirms its original commercial use. The two-story Italian Renaissance style brick building features two offset doors with decorative surrounds, designed to appear inviting to potential customers. Along with the second story arcaded windows with decorative hoods, the first-story storefront windows feature a gothic arch, and similarly provide an element of public display for this commercial property. Like many commercial buildings along Elmwood Avenue, this example is two stories in height, with commercial space at the street level and residential or office spaces above.

While there are a handful of these designed commercial buildings constructed in the Elmwood Historic District (West), most of the buildings that serve a commercial function are former residential buildings that have been converted through additions into commercial buildings.

CONVERTED COMMERCIAL BUILDINGS

While the residential converted to commercial building type is not unique to the Elmwood Avenue corridor in the Elmwood Historic District, and examples of it can be found scattered throughout Buffalo, it is the high prevalence of this type in the nominated district that makes it noteworthy and gives Elmwood Avenue its individual character. Individual residences had been constructed along Elmwood Avenue beginning in the late nineteenth century, and examples of Queen Anne, Colonial Revival and others were built along the street, as can still be seen in the 300-block of Elmwood Avenue. Within a decade, many of these houses elsewhere on Elmwood Avenue were converted to serve commercial purposes. While some of the older residential buildings were demolished for purpose built commercial buildings, many of the old houses were adapted to commercial use through the addition of a one or two-story front addition. These additions were sited in what was once the residence's front yard and adhere to the sidewalk edge. These additions may conceal only a portion of the original house or nearly the entire front elevation, with the original house only visible from the side or from a distance and only a tower or roof peak visible above the commercial block. In some instances, the front commercial block addition does obscure the house behind, and it is only visible using aerial maps or from the rear of the building. This type of addition and conversion is considered significant if it occurred during the period of significance and tells the story of Elmwood Avenue's transition into an increasingly prominent commercial artery for the district.

While there is great variety in this category of building type, there are several excellent examples. A good example of a converted commercial building is located at 831 Elmwood Avenue (ca. 1902, contributing), where a one story commercial building was added to a two-and-a-half story residence. The brick storefront space occupies the former front lawn of the house, stretching out to the sidewalk in order to take advantage of pedestrian and street traffic. The front gabled wood framed house remains intact behind the storefront, built around the turn of the twentieth century, a few decades prior to the commercial addition. The house at 571 Elmwood Avenue (ca. 1910, contributing) offers another example of a commercial conversion. The two-and-a-half story front gable house features Queen Anne styling, including a modillioned gable end with stylized rake and vergeboard. The one story commercial addition includes a flattened hipped roof, central door and storefront windows.

These numerous examples of early adaptive use from the first decades of the twentieth century tells the story of the development of the commercial strip quickly shifting from residential street to a thriving shopping and retailing street, dominated by individual family owned and operated establishments. Unlike other commercial areas of Buffalo, such as Main Street or the southern end of Delaware Avenue, this area of Elmwood Avenue is dominated by two or three-story commercial buildings, scaled appropriately to the original houses they were grafted onto. The architectural character that was established in the 1910s and 1920s remains intact.

INSTITUTIONAL ARCHITECTURE AND SERVICE BUILDINGS

While the commercial corridor of Elmwood Avenue was easily accessed by both the eastern and western portions of the Elmwood Historic District, service buildings such as schools, libraries, and fire stations are more common in the Elmwood Historic District (East). The Elmwood Historic District (West) was generally served by utilities coming from east of Elmwood Avenue or further west of Richmond Avenue, such as Lafayette High School, and thus other schools and service buildings do not appear in that portion of the district. However the areas east of Elmwood Avenue, contain a number of schools, suggesting the availability of substantial land plots on which to erect these institutions as needed. Institutional buildings began to appear as the district developed at the turn of the twentieth century, as a variety of schools, clubs, and libraries were established to aid the educational and social development of this district. With the opening of these new service buildings, the Elmwood district quickly became a microcosmic community of residents and workers living in an independent community from the one downtown, although the two were indelibly linked as well. These schools, both public and privately funded, established a desirable educational system in the district, which continues to set the standard for much of the city today.

INSTITUTIONAL BUILDINGS

The Elmwood Historic District (East) has contained a number of other schools, both public and private. The Buffalo Seminary (NR listed) serves as prestigious example of a girls' college preparatory high school in the neighborhood. The three-story, Collegiate Gothic style school is located at 205 Bidwell Parkway, occupying a triangular-shaped lot that overlooks the parkway near Soldier's Place. Built in 1909, Buffalo Seminary was founded further south in downtown Buffalo in the 1850s, and relocated to the Elmwood district in the early twentieth century as the population migrated away from downtown. Other educational institutions populated the district further south, including the former International Institute at 836 Auburn Avenue (ca. 1910, contributing) and the Community Music School at 415 Elmwood Avenue (1910, contributing). The International Institute, an organization outstanding in its service and educational programs for international refugees. Providing services for international refugees, particularly women, since 1918, the International Institute occupied the corner of Delaware Avenue and Auburn Street before moving to its present location at 864 Delaware Avenue in 1973.

One of the oldest and most prominent schools in the Elmwood district is the Nardin Academy, a private Roman Catholic school located at 135 Cleveland Avenue (ca. 1898, contributing). Originally founded as "Miss Nardin's School," the school relocated from its former location at Franklin and Church Streets to its current address on Cleveland Avenue in 1890. Thirty-five students attended in the school's first year on Cleveland Avenue, some of whom were boarders. The new location in the Elmwood East Historic District proved to be much more suitable for a private school, as it was situated on a quieter street and larger plot of land than its previous address in the midst of bustling downtown Buffalo. The sprawling 3 story, white brick building was built in the Neogothic style with Tudor Revival features, including a copper cupola and an entrance flanked by turret bays with crenellated towers, and provided ample space for plenty of classrooms, a cafeteria, gymnasium and boarding facilities. Several notable students have attended Nardin Academy during its long and rich history, including F. Scott Fitzgerald and Diane English. Today the school operates in two parts, providing a college preparatory high school education for girls at the original location on Cleveland Avenue as well as a co-educational elementary school in Nardin Montessori at 700-702 West Ferry Street (1927, contributing). The property there was donated by the Oishei Foundation, and the brick mansion there occupies the land that once contained John J. Albright's residence. The school's original building still stands in excellent condition, and the school recently built the Koessler Family Library Media Center in order to accommodate the growing school, in 2003.

The Community Music School at 415 Elmwood Avenue (ca. 1910, contributing) illustrates just one of the many opportunities for education in the Elmwood Historic District (East). Founded in 1924, the Community Music School was initially called the First Settlement Music School. It was originally housed in South Buffalo at 232 Myrtle Street, and later moved to two other locations in the Elmwood district before settling at its current

location. The School was located at 346 Elmwood Avenue from 1935-1952, and then a block south at 325 Summer Street from 1952-1959. It moved to the three-story brick Italianate building at 415 Elmwood Avenue in 1959, where today it continues to provide excellent lessons to a diversity of students from throughout the district and beyond.

The Elmwood Historic District (East) also included two public schools in order to address the growing population of children in the neighborhood in the early 1900s. Public School 30 and Public School 56 were both established by the City of Buffalo Public School system in order to provide primary and secondary education to the residents of the district. From 1895-1911, School 56 operated at 709 Elmwood Avenue in a three story neoclassical building with ornate columned entrance.[281] In 1912, it became School 30, where it continued to operate until its demolition in 1976, and subsequent replacement by the current M&T Bank building on the site (noncontributing).[282] Also in 1912, School 56 transitioned into its new building at 716 West Delavan Avenue (1910-11, contributing).[283] Designed by Howard L. Beck in 1909-1911, this three-story, red brick-and-masonry building is partially steel framed, and features ample space for classrooms in the heart of the district, with decorative details such as a cornice with dentils. Today, School 56 no longer operates as a school, but is undergoing renovations for future use.

In addition to this diversity of educational institutions, the Elmwood Historic District (East) also contained a number of other community-oriented institutions, including several private clubs and a library. Two clubs in particular catered to the wealthier residents of the district, creating an elite, members-only environment that attested to the opulence possible in this neighborhood. The Garrett Club (NR Ref. No. 6001212) has a long and rich history, housed in a French Vernacular style clubhouse designed by E.B. Green at 91 Cleveland Avenue (1916, contributing). Originally founded as a women's club in 1902, the private, elite, members-only Garrett Club moved to the current property in 1929. Previously National Register listed, the building was designed to fit in with the surrounding residential neighborhood. Set back from the street and situated behind a walled garden, the understated façade recalls a French country house rather than an opulent club. The club's history attests to its private, elite social activities, with members such as famed actress Katherine Cornell contributing to its elite status, which continues to be upheld today.

PUBLIC SERVICES

For those without access to the lush amenities at these private clubs, several other institutional buildings emerged in the Elmwood Historic District (East) to serve this growing population. In order to provide public

[281] "Children Crowded out of School 56," *Buffalo Courier,* December 3, 1908, 6.
[282] Gene Warner, "Spirit of School 30 Outlasts Building," *Buffalo Evening News*, May 28, 1981, 29.
[283] "Object to Transfer of School 56 to New Building," *Buffalo Courier*, April 21, 1912, 7.

access to books and other reference material, the Crane library was built at 633 Elmwood Avenue (contributing) in 1955.[284] Part of the Buffalo and Erie County Library system, the Crane library commemorates James L. Crane, a prominent Buffalo lawyer, banker and politician who was delegate to the Republican National Convention in the 1930s, and who also acquire the site of the library during that time. His son, David Brooks Crane, was a notable local architect, who began designing the library shortly before his death. A Graduate of Nichols School and Princeton University, David Brooks Crane married Esther Watson, the granddaughter of Charles and Ellen Goodyear, in 1938. Crane used to work in E.B. Green's office until he transferred to the office of Frederick Backus in 1940, where he became partner two years later. The firm of Backus, Crane and Love built many midcentury buildings in Buffalo, with a portfolio that included both public housing and sleek office buildings. The Marine Drive Apartments at Buffalo's waterfront (originally Dante Place public housing complex, 1951, extant), Willert Park Court (1939, extant) and the National Gypsum Company Building at 325 Delaware Avenue (1942, extant) are some of their most notable achievements. Today, the Crane library provides services to the Elmwood neighborhood as a testament to the historic importance of that family.

One of Buffalo's most exceptional historic public service buildings exists in the Elmwood Historic District (East) at 166 Cleveland Avenue (1894, contributing), at the corner of St. Catherine's Court. Built as a firehouse in 1894, the building occupied land at the northern edge of John J. Albright's estate. Designed by notable architect Edward Austin Kent, who also designed the Unitarian Universalist Church around the corner on West Ferry Street, this is a rare, stunning example of a late nineteenth century firehouse with Art Nouveau detailing such as foliated corbels and curled tie rods. The high, steeply pitched gabled roof created plenty of space for firehouses to hang while drying. During a time when firefighters still relied on horses, this building accommodated stables on the ground floor and space for the firefighting crew, as well as hay and feed, on the second floor. A crane used to raise hay to the second floor can still be seen on the exterior of the building, indicating this early system of fighting fires.

The words 'Chemical No. 5' adorn the brick arched center bay, which accommodated for the size of horse drawn fire equipment, indicates the unit's special function in the first decades of the turn of the twentieth century. During this time, the Buffalo Fire Department had six chemical companies in service, of which this was the fifth, and is the last remaining remnant of this unit in the city today. Chemical units were charged with creating a special mixture of chemicals with baking soda, designed to increase water pressure in the hoses. As pressurized hose systems advanced, Chemical No. 5 was disbanded in 1920, and became Engine No. 37 until 1966, when it moved to the West Side at Chenango Street and Rhode Island Street. In 1989, the former firehouse was converted it into an elegant, unique residence and studio. Today it exhibits Kent's architectural prowess in excellent condition, and serves as the only remaining firehouse in the Elmwood district.

[284] "Library Dedicated in Honor of Cranes," *Buffalo Courier Express*, June 18, 1955, 4.

The Elmwood Historic District (East) also contains institutions aimed towards protecting and maintaining the health of its residents. One of the well-respected hospitals in the city, The Women and Children's Hospital, has been located at 219 Bryant Street since 1892 (contributing). During its lengthy history, the hospital has undergone multiple expansions and technological evolutions, mirroring the population growth of the district over time. Located primarily at 219 Bryant Street between Elmwood Avenue and Delaware Avenue, the campus today contains over eleven buildings, seven of which form the central hospital operations. The majority of these buildings were constructed before 1965, and thus fit within the period of significance for the district. The current building, which occupies almost half the block between Elmwood and Delaware Avenues on the north side of Bryant Street, stands as a testament to this rich past.

Beginning in the 1890s, during the streetcar-suburb period of development, the hospital continually evolved to service and accommodate the needs of the district's growing population. For over a century, this complex has remained integral to the community of the Elmwood Historic District, demonstrating a rich history of high quality buildings that attest to the longevity of the institution amidst many periods of urban change. Many stages of institutional growth, scientific advancements, and technological improvements can be seen in the hospital's lengthy architectural history, which includes multiple acquisitions and new constructions over time. From its humble beginnings in a single Italianate residence to its contemporary manifestation in a multi-building complex, the evolution of Women and Children's Hospital campus attests to the continued growth of the hospital program and the Elmwood Historic District at large. The hospital's humble origins are firmly rooted in the streetcar suburb era of the district's history, but it grew alongside the district, expanding to accommodate the district's growth during multiple stages of development.

The architectural history of these institutional buildings reveals the gradual advancements made to the hospital program and the district over time. In 1891, Dr. Mahlon Bainbridge Falwell convinced Mrs. Gibson T. Williams and her daughter Martha Tenney Williams of his innovative idea: that children should receive different medical treatment than adult men, in separate facilities. The Williams' then purchased a vacant house at 219 Bryant Street (ca. 1925, contributing), a two-and-a-half story red brick Italianate building. After renovating the house for hospital use with their own money, the Williams' and Dr. Falwell opened the hospital in September 1892, accommodating twelve hospital beds. The immense population growth of the district, due to the streetcar-suburb style of development occurring contemporaneously on neighboring streets, created instant demand for a bigger hospital. Within just one year, the Williams' purchased and converted additional properties and buildings on Bryant Street in order to expand their accommodations to forty beds. Although the original brick Italianate building no longer remains on the site, the Women and Children's Hospital has since acquired the adjacent property at 187 Bryant Street (1892, contributing), a 2.5-story front gable frame residence with modest Colonial Revival styling, as well as an affiliated 2-story carriage house dating from 1914. These

contributing buildings attest to this first period of the hospital's development, as well as to the high quality of residential buildings that characterize the Elmwood Historic District.

As the neighborhood continued to grow, several other buildings were constructed to further expand and improve the hospital to suit the increasing needs of the district's population in the early twentieth century. Of the seven primary hospital buildings existing today, five were built during the Elmwood Historic District's period of significance. The C Building and the Annex were both completed in 1917, during one of the earliest phases of the hospital's expansion. The 3-story Annex building is stylistically indicative of its era, with quoins and simplified detailing along the cornice adorning its U-shaped plan. The hospital underwent further expansions in 1927, adding the western portion of the Annex as well as the MH Building and D Building, each of which were built in similar styles and materials. Throughout the 1910s-1930's, as the district began to transition into an early phase of automobile-oriented development, several more additions and alterations were made to these properties, some of which were conducted by the notable architecture firm of Lansing and Beierl. Significant advances in medical technology and treatment procedures occurred nationwide during these decades, and these new buildings enabled the Women and Children's Hospital to accommodate more patients, install new equipment, and provide distinctive spaces for the increasing amounts of procedures offered at the complex.[285]

Taken as a cohesive unit, the Women and Children's Hospital constitutes a significant contribution to the Elmwood Historic District (East) for the quality of its architecture and its deep connection to the broader history of this district. From its very inception, this historic institution was rooted in the cultural community and built environment of the neighborhood. Occupying prominent, visible real estate at the heart of the district, the Women and Children's Hospital evolved, in terms of both spatial capacity and medical technology, to better suit the needs of a growing population for over a century. The diversity of building materials and architectural styles

[285] By the 1950s, the hospital boasted a capacity of 200 pediatric patients and 75 maternity beds. While the original brick house no longer exists, the hospital today is world renowned for its innovative procedures and reliable treatments, admitting approximately 28,000 patients a year. Another wave of improvements and additions were made to the complex during the 1950s, which were represented most prominently in the construction of the Tanner Building. Completed in 1954, the 9-story building was erected during a nationwide boom in hospital construction during the post-war era. The steel frame building represented the latest advancements in building technology as well as modern hospital facilities. With the construction of the Tanner Building, the hospital was able to accommodate a capacity of 200 pediatric patients and 75 maternity beds. By this point, the institution had come a long way from its original 12-bed capacity, expanding alongside the Elmwood Historic District in order to accommodate the increasing needs of the surrounding community and patients citywide.
Although the majority of these primary buildings attest to the earliest phases of the hospital's growth, the institution has continued to acquire a few other buildings that date outside the District's period of significance. At the Bryant Street location, the 10-story Variety Tower was completed in 1972, and the Alfiero addition was initially constructed in 1996. These buildings, along with those owned by the hospital at 125 and 135 Hodge, and 188 and 204 West Utica, may be considered non-contributing solely due to their later construction dates.

contained within this urban campus distinguishes this property as an intact example of several decades of the district's most significant eras of development.

ECCLESIASTIC ARCHITECTURE

As the city's population shifted northward beginning in the 1880s, many of Buffalo's existing churches and religious organizations also began to migrate from downtown to be closer to their congregants and because their downtown land was in demand for commercial growth. In the first half of the nineteenth century, Buffalo's religious buildings were located close to the population center, with many on Church Street or Main Street. As residents moved northward out of the rapidly commercializing downtown area after the Civil War, churches were forced to choose between relocating or closing due to dwindling congregants within walking distance. Still many other congregations were founded in the Elmwood district because of the number of residents and the variety of religions in the area. Many of the church buildings reflect traditional Protestant religious groups such as Presbyterian, Lutheran and Episcopal denominations. These Protestant faiths reflect the background of the Elmwood Avenue community during the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, as many residents were of Western and Northern European descent.

Churches and religious buildings in the Elmwood Historic District are typically of stone or brick construction and later feature structural steel skeletons. Many of the earliest wood-frame church buildings in the nominated district, noted as being founded as early as the 1870s, were subsequently demolished or removed to make way for more permanent, large-scale religious buildings by the late nineteenth century. They frequently occupy highly-visible sites in the nominated district, located at street intersections or at Olmsted's landscaped circles, allowing the church to be visible from many angles. Architectural styles present in the churches and religious buildings in the Elmwood Historic District are typical of those designed and built during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. These styles include the Gothic Revival and Romanesque Revival styles that were nationally popular during this era.

One example of a church that migrated northward to the Elmwood Historic District (East) area was the Lafayette Street Presbyterian Church, which was founded initially as the "Park Church Society," the congregation dating back to 1845. In 1863, the congregation constructed a Gothic Revival church building on the north side of Lafayette Square in downtown Buffalo. Once the city's population began to shift northward, the church was forced to follow suit, purchasing a large parcel of land on the east side of Elmwood Avenue at Bouck Street in what was described at the time as vacant farmland. In 1894-1896, a large Medina sandstone church building was constructed on the parcel by the architectural firm of Lansing and Beierl. No longer located on Lafayette Square, questions were raised about what to name the new building. Some parishioners suggested "Elmwood Avenue Presbyterian Church" in deference to their new location; however, in July of 1898 the

congregation successfully petitioned the city to change the name of the street from Bouck Street to Lafayette Avenue, ending the debates. Thus, the new church was able to retain its original identity, carrying the name of "Lafayette" from downtown to the northern suburbs, becoming the Lafayette Avenue Presbyterian Church (NR listed).[286]

The Elmwood Historic District (East) contains a diverse array of other religious institutions, servicing multiple congregations and faiths within a relatively small geographic area. The Unitarian Universalist Church, located at the corner of West Ferry Street at 695 Elmwood Avenue (NR listed), was completed in 1906 by Edward Austin Kent. Kent was not only a highly successful architect in the city, but also was the only Buffalo citizen to die tragically on the Titanic, making his limited commissions throughout the city even more valuable.[287] The church serves as an excellent example of the English Country Gothic style in its asymmetrical plan and the steep roof with low, overhanging eaves. The exterior, interior walls and floors are all constructed of Indiana limestone, making the building remarkably fireproof. A crenellated turret, oak doors and arched stained glass windows were all executed with attention to detail, accompanied by large oak doors decorate with cast iron fleur de lis. The interior features an impressive Arts and Crafts-inspired sanctuary space, with stained glass windows designed in the Art Nouveau style by Harry Goodhue, of Boston.[288] Complementing the limestone walls, the interior woodwork represents a return to the values of hand craftsmanship, with a large oak hammer beam ceiling connected by stone corbels about ten feet above the floor. The church was built on land donated by John J. Albright, who was also a member of the congregation, and also features a volunteer-run garden on the property.[289] As the first Unitarian church in the Elmwood district, this religious building continues to serve the neighborhood's congregation today.

Later, as the city's Jewish population grew and migrated to the Elmwood Avenue area, a Jewish synagogue also was also built in the Elmwood Historic District (East), at 1073 Elmwood Avenue (1914, contributing). The two-and-a-half story wood frame building features a front gabled roof with returns, large arched window with colored glass, and an entrance with a small pedimented portico and simple Tuscan columns. Constructed around 1914, the exterior appears to be more typical of a residence than a temple, the open interior and high ceiling is more characteristic of a place of worship. The building operated as the Elmwood United Brethren church until 1922, when the Sanborn Map identifies this building as the Temple Beth Israel. The Temple

[286] For more information on the history of the Lafayette Avenue Presbyterian Church, refer to: Jennifer Walkowski, *Lafayette Avenue Presbyterian Church*, ed. Daniel McEneny, report no. NR Ref. No. 09NR05997, State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination (Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, 2009).
[287] William H. Siener, *Upstairs, Downstairs: Western New Yorkers and the Titanic* (Buffalo, NY: Western New York Heritage Press, 1998), 5.
[288] Charles Jamieson, *Heritage of Heresy: Unitarian Universalist Church of Buffalo, N.Y. 1832-1982* (Kenmore: Partners Press, 1982.
[289] Austin M. Fox, *Church Tales of the Niagara Frontier: Legends, History & Architecture* (Buffalo, NY: Western New York Wares, 1994), 2.

became the Congregation Beth Abraham shortly thereafter. Today, the congregation performs regular services in the temple, and is the oldest congregation in the Elmwood district.

Interestingly for a city with a predominantly Roman Catholic population, there were no Catholic churches constructed in the district until much later. A few blocks north of the Temple Beth Abraham, the Newman Center provides Catholic services at 1219 Elmwood Avenue (ca. 1915, contributing). As the Catholic ministry of the nearby Buffalo State College campus, the Newman Center occupies a modest, two-story brick building originally built as an apartment complex. A small portico adorns the entrance in the central bay, supported by thin, square columns. After remodeling the building for religious uses, the Newman Center opened in 1962, initially serving 1400 Roman Catholic students.[290] The ministry hosts a number of religious services and events for the College and neighborhood, including mass, weekly dinners, retreats and community service opportunities. The Newman Center is the first and only Catholic institution in the Elmwood Historic District (East), and thus contributes to the historic diversity of religious offerings in this community.

BUILDERS AND DEVELOPERS OF THE ELMWOOD DISTRICT

Unlike some streetcar suburbs that were developed by a single owner or developer, the Elmwood Historic District was shaped by numerous real estate developers, builders, contractors, architects and others involved in buying, parceling and developing the formerly vacant land. Real estate agents played an important role in the creation of the streetcar suburb, buying and subdividing large tracts, then selling or developing the various smaller lots. In an era before specialized training and certification, many of the city's wealthier citizens dabbled in the lucrative real estate market, while others made a more specialized career in the sale of land and properties. Many of real estate agents also offered loans, credit and mortgages to their clients as banks were prohibited from this service, further encouraging the real estate boom. Real estate brokers often sold smaller city lots, ready for construction, or newly built speculative houses. Some also offered large tracts for sale to larger syndicates or companies that could divide and build several properties. William G. Hartwell offered many large tracts in an advertisement from 1890, including:

> *A tract of land at the north-west corner of Elmwood and Clinton* [now Potomac] *avenues; produces 318 feet on Elmwood avenue and 650 feet on Ashland avenue, price $55,000.*
>
> *A tract of 800 feet on the south side of Delavan avenue, between Elmwood avenue and Chapin Parkway, price $46,000.*[291]

[290] "Bishop Smith Dedicates Newman Club Building" *Buffalo Courier Express* (Buffalo, NY), Feb 26, 1962.
[291] Real Estate and Financial News

William G. Hartwell also offered a wide variety of real estate options. Real estate transactions at the time must have been such a prominent part of life, that his offerings were prefaced:

> *If you want some fine residence property as a Holiday gift or as an investment, you will find it below in a choice selection from the list…*[292]

One of Buffalo's most successful and prominent real estate companies in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was the firm of Thorne & Angell. Composed of partners George L. Thorne and Byron Pomeroy Angell, this firm only dealt with property located within the bounds of the city of Buffalo, ignoring the rapidly developing suburbs like Kenmore or Williamsville. The firm was credited with the following:

> *It is to this firm that the city owes the conception and the development of the Elmwood district, the Richmond avenue section, the parkways, Central Park, Parkside, the Hertel avenue section and the beginning of the Niagara Park section of north Buffalo, then known as Stratton Park.*[293]

While these claims may be a bit overinflated, Thorne & Angell were certainly one of the most prominent real estate firms active in the city. George L. Thorne is credited with being instrumental in the opening and extension of Elmwood Avenue.[294] Both men even chose to reside in the fashionable Elmwood district; Byron P. Angell's house, designed by architect William W. Carlin, is located at 506 Lafayette Avenue (1886, non-contributing) and George L. Thorne's house, designed by Bethune, Bethune and Fuchs, is at 40 Bidwell Parkway (ca.1885). The firm successfully weathered the panic of 1893 and the subsequent real estate bust in Buffalo, doing yearly business of over one million and a half dollars. However by 1895, the depreciation of the real estate market hit the firm, as well as several failed development projects, and the company appears to have dissolved shortly after. However, Thorne & Angell are credited amongst the builders of suburban Buffalo: "While he cannot be numbered among the founders of Buffalo, George L. Thorne will always be mentioned in connection with her suburban growth and development."[295]

Walter Grant Hopkins was another prominent real estate developer in Buffalo and had a unique tie to the Elmwood Historic District. Hopkins was born in 1868 to Hon. Nelson K. Hopkins, who served as state comptroller 1872-1875. By 1872, only a few years after Walter's birth, Nelson K. Hopkins owned a spacious property at 771 Ferry Street, just west of Delaware Street, in what would become the Elmwood district. So it is likely that Walter G. Hopkins grew up in Elmwood, becoming familiar with it as it developed into a desirable

---

[292] Real Estate and Financial News
[293] "Developer of Elmwood Avenue Section Dies" *The Buffalo News* (Buffalo, NY), April 23, 1923.
[294] Truman C. White, *Our County and Its People; a Descriptive Work on Erie County, New York.* vol. II (Boston History, 1898), 153-154.
[295] White, vol. II, 154.

residential neighborhood. After working at a law office for several years, Hopkins entered the real estate field around 1885, operating an office in the Austin Building at 110 Franklin Street. With his background in law, Hopkins became a prominent real estate developer in the growing Elmwood district. In July of 1890, Hopkins offered "15,000 feet of the choicest residence property in Buffalo for sale at prices ranging from $15 to $400 per foot" in Elmwood and appears to have focused much of his business on the real estate of the area.[296] Still another advertisement noted "Real Estate for Sale! Money to Loan! Give me a call! Specialty: The Elmwood Avenue District."[297] By 1893, Hopkins had partnered with Fred C. Humburch and added the legal assistance of his father Nelson K. Hopkins, in the firm of Hopkins & Humburch, who were among the earliest developers in the new suburb of Depew, just east of Buffalo. Like many of the Elmwood district developers, Hopkins also resided in the neighborhood. In 1900, he rented a house at 896 Elmwood Avenue, and by the 1920s he and his family resided at 485 Ashland Avenue; at his death in 1921 he resided at 150 Bidwell Parkway.[298]

Spencer S. Kingsley and Russell Hayward Potter were also active in real estate during the 1890s and 1900s in Buffalo. Potter was born in Buffalo in 1867 and learned Mechanical Engineering at Cornell before returning to Buffalo. After his return, he studied in the law office of Nelson K. Hopkins, learning real estate law. In January 1890, Potter formed a partnership with Spencer S. Kinsley, establishing the firm of Kingsley & Potter. Kingsley was also born and raised in Buffalo and operated a book business with Otto Ulbrich before joining with Potter in the real estate field. Kingsley & Potter were prominent developers in the Elmwood district in the early 1890s and in December of 1890 advertised numerous properties, well over 100, for sale in the Elmwood district. "If you want to buy, sell, syndicate, negotiate, rent, insure, or mortgage Real Estate of any Kind, Class or Description, call on Kingsley & Potter."[299] The firm closed in 1892, when Potter bought out Kingsley from the company.

One developer promoted his own special building type for the Elmwood district. Harry E. Phillips, whose office was located at 9 Niagara Street, promoted what he called the "Model of Perfection." These two-family flats were available to rent or to purchase and were clearly targeted toward a more modest middle-class purchaser. Phillips marketed the "Phillips plan" for these building as the height of "modern science" and convenience. The Phillips plan offered an alternative for those who could not afford to purchase a house outright or could not get a mortgage loan from a bank, which generally required a large down payment:

[296] Walter G. Hopkins, "The Elmwood Avenue District," advertisement, *Buffalo Real Estate News*, July 15, 1890.
[297] Walter G. Hopkins. "Real Estate for Sale!" Advertisement. *Buffalo Real Estate News*, September 15, 1890.
[298] White, vol. II, 40-41.
[299] Kingsley & Potter, "Real Estate," advertisement, *Real Estate and Building News*, December 1890.

> *Buy one of these flats in the heart of the Elmwood District for a small payment down and the balance the same as rent. The rent from one flat will pay all the carrying charges, interest and principal installment.*[300]

Many of the houses in the Elmwood Historic District were created by local builders. Some builders also doubled as real estate investors and speculators and also provided credit and loans for construction. Scores of local contractors and builders were building in the Elmwood district in the decades surrounding the turn of the twentieth century. The November 1902 issue of *Greater Buffalo* noted the following builders who had projects underway at the time:

> *Among the builders who are constructing houses in this district may be mentioned H.H. Lanctot, who is building on Bidwell Parkway and also on Elmwood Avenue; Walter D. Putnam, who is building seven houses on West Delavan Avenue; F. Stephen Grist, who is building three four-family flats on North Ashland Avenue for M. Nellany; Arthur Meyes, nearly finished near entrance of Dorchester Road; E.C. Coulter, who is building two two-family houses of press brick on Bidwell Parkway; H.J. Tharle, who is building for the McNeil Lumber Company five four-family houses on North Ashland and Potomac avenues; John W. Gibbs, now of the firm of Niederpruem, Gibbs & Schaaf, is also building three houses on Elmwood Avenue just above Potomac; Mr. Gibbs has built a large number of houses in the Elmwood district, among others being the fine houses on Richmond Avenue and Bidwell Parkway shown in the illustration.*[301]

John W. Gibbs, noted in the passage above, was one of the more prolific builders in the Elmwood district. He also had a diverse background, reflecting how popular and prominent real estate speculation was amongst a wide range of people with a variety of experience and knowledge. Born in Almond, NY in 1869, Gibbs took courses at Alfred University before going through business school in Elmira. He then graduated from the Buffalo College of Pharmacy. Combining his medical knowledge and his business acumen, Gibbs was proprietor of two drug stores which he founded in 1889 in Buffalo. At the turn of the twentieth century, Gibbs entered the world of real estate and developing. By 1902, he was working with the firm of Niederpruem, Gibbs & Schaaf, building many of the buildings in the Elmwood district. Gibbs had a wide range of other business interests, establishing one of the largest automobile shops in the city, at Main and Summer Streets. In 1909 Gibbs established the Main Street Realty Company. In 1912 he organized the Main Street Developing Company, and in 1914 he formed the Greater Buffalo Real Estate Corporation.[302] Many properties were built by John W. Gibbs, including 827 Potomac Avenue (1908, contributing), 837 Potomac Avenue (1908, contributing), and 847 Potomac Avenue (1908, contributing).

---

[300] Harry E. Phillips, "Model of Perfection," *Buffalo Live Wire* (Buffalo, NY), advertisement, March 1913.
[301] "The New Elmwood District," November 1902, 19.
[302] Hill, vol. III, 193.

While the Elmwood Historic District (East) shared many common builders and developers with its western counterpart, it also included some figures whose contributions lie solely east of Elmwood Avenue. Perhaps the most recognizable real estate developer was Darwin R. Martin, son of Larkin company executive Darwin D. Martin, who left a considerable mark on the district with his apartment buildings, at 800 West Ferry Street (1929, contributing) and 245 Elmwood Avenue (1921, contributing). Martin also resided in the district at 180 Summer Street (c.1900, contributing), in architect E.B. Green's former residence. Contemporaneously, the real estate firm of Gurney, Overturf and Becker also played a significant role in the development of the Elmwood Historic District (East), to quite different effect. Melbourne Court serves as one of the most prominent examples of their work, which attempted to create a somewhat suburban enclave inside the city in the late 1920s.

During midcentury, Hugh Perry developed a considerable portion of the district, particularly on and near the former Albright estate. Hugh Perry (1908-1986), a graduate of Nichols School and Amherst College, had a financial interest in and worked for the Rigidized Metals Corporation in Buffalo's industrial first ward during World War II. After the war he left this business to pursue his passion for architecture and real estate, running his own successful business until his death. Many of his projects were located in the Elmwood Historic District (East), where he not only developed these cul de sac streets but also converted several houses into apartments, including the Ronald McDonald house at 780 West Ferry Street, 21 Oakland Place and 88 Oakland Place. He also resided in the Elmwood Historic District (East), in a building of his own design on the site of the former Albright estate at 20 Queen Anne's Gate.[303]

The majority of Perry's projects were conducted alongside Gordon Hayes (1912-1983), a prominent architect who lived and worked in the Elmwood Historic District (East). Also a graduate of Nichols School, Hayes continued his education at Andover and the University of Buffalo before obtaining his degree in architecture from the University of Michigan. He returned to Buffalo and resided in the district at 541 Lafayette Avenue (contributing to the western portion of the district), where he designed not only several important projects with Hugh Perry but also the chapel at First Presbyterian Church on Symphony Circle, St. Martins Church on Grand Island, and several lakefront residences in Buffalo and nearby Ontario. Together, Perry and Hayes made an indelible impact on the Elmwood district, where their developments ranged from entire streets to individual houses, each of which provides an excellent representation of midcentury style design.

ARCHITECTS OF THE ELMWOOD DISTRICT

[303] *Albright Tract Historic District*, draft, 23.

While many of the residences in the Elmwood district were built by builders and speculators, there are also many examples of architect-designed houses. While rare, there are a few examples of houses in the Elmwood Historic District (East) designed by nationally prominent architects and firms. Perhaps the most distinguished, nationally significant architect to have designed a building in the district is Frank Lloyd Wright, who built the William Heath house on a narrow lot at 76 Soldier's Place in 1904-1905 (contributing). The house bears Wright's distinctive Prairie style elements, including cantilevered roofs and art glass window, and is often considered a direct precursor to his Robie House design in Chicago. Another nationally prominent architect, C.P.H. Gilbert, was hired to design the house for Seymour Knox Jr. at 57 Oakland Place (c. 1901, contributing). After receiving his education at the famous Ecole des Beaux Arts in Paris, Gilbert quickly established his reputation in New York City as an architect specializing in opulent townhouses and mansions. Today his designs for the Woolworths, Otto Kahn and Felix Kahn are well known in New York City, and the Knox residence serves as the only example of his work in Buffalo.

However, unlike the more wealthy areas of Buffalo, such as Linwood Avenue or Delaware Avenue, where nationally prominent architects such as McKim Mead and White or Joseph L. Silsbee were commissioned, those architects who designed residences in the Elmwood Historic District were generally local architects. The Elmwood Historic District (East) includes more architect-designed buildings than appear in the western portion of the district. From the late nineteenth century onward, many of the city's most prominent architects were designing houses, schools, and cultural institutions for the district's wealthy population. While the entirety of the Elmwood Historic District exhibits stunning architectural examples in a diversity of styles, the eastern portion of the district contains several mansions and grand buildings designed by some of the most notable architects of their time.

While there were a few architects from other cities who were commissioned to build in the district, the vast majority of architecture was designed by local firms. The sheer number of architectural commissions in the Elmwood Historic District (East) enabled Buffalo to develop a strong local architectural scene. Several houses were constructed by Buffalo's most prominent and prolific architect, Edward Brodhead (E.B.) Green. Of the over 370 buildings Green designed in Buffalo during his long and prominent career, over 200 remain standing, making his architectural contributions and influence unmatched. He and his partner William S. Wicks were Buffalo's master practitioners in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, and together they designed over 25 buildings in the Elmwood Historic District (East) alone. Green and Wicks contributed buildings such as 180 Summer Street (ca. 1900, contributing), 677 West Ferry Street (1906, contributing) and the former Albright estate (demolished), 54 and 85 Highland Avenue (1910 and 189, respectively, both contributing), and 27, 33, and 111 Penhurst Park (all c.1910, contributing). Green and Wicks mastered several revival styles, and the Tudor revival house at 17 Tudor Place (1882, contributing) exemplifies their approach to this style in the district. The two-and-a-half story house features several qualities indicative of the Tudor revival style, including

an asymmetrical plan, cross gabled slate roof, and decorative vertical and horizontal half timbering. Additionally, Green and Wicks also built several Colonial Revival houses in the district. The house they built at 677 West Ferry Street provides a typical representation of their work in this style, featuring a two-and-a-half-story, three-bay residence with Flemish bond brick construction, raised brick quoins, and a side entry with Tuscan columns supporting a flat hood entry roof over the entrance's multi-light sidelights and transom window. With these contributions and many more, the scope of their presence in the district is still palpable today.

Esenwein and Johnson, another of Buffalo's most successful local firms, also contributed several works to the Elmwood Historic District. Composed of partners August C. Esenwein and James S. Johnson, the firm created several prominent buildings in downtown Buffalo, including the neoclassical Electric Tower (1912, NR listed) and the terra-cotta tile-clad Calumet Building on Chippewa Street (1906, NR listed). For the Elmwood Historic District (East), Esenwein and Johnson's contributions include 24 and Lincoln Parkway (1908 and 1904 respectively, contributing), 57-59 Oakland Place (1901, contributing) and 61 Hodge Avenue (ca. 1900, contributing).

Several other architects contributed buildings to the district, including more modern styles into the architectural diversity of the region. The Crane branch library at 633 Elmwood Avenue (1955, contributing) exhibits a midcentury sensibility, with a design emphasis on horizontality typical of the era. The prominent architecture firm of Backus, Crane and Love designed this building, along with many other works in Buffalo.[304] Around that same time, architect Gordon Hayes also designed several buildings in the district, from roughly 1962-1965. Several houses on St. Andrew's Walk and St. George's Square exemplify his midcentury revivalist approach to residential architecture, many of them in a Georgian revival style that intentionally evoked Colonial Williamsburg, a popular destination during this time. The diversity of architectural styles representing midcentury in the district demonstrates the appeal of this neighborhood for designers to expand their portfolio in a myriad of ways.

The prevalence of architect-designed houses in the Elmwood Historic District (East) is especially impressive, featuring far more examples than in the western portion. Some blocks in particular are almost entirely architect-designed residences, making them distinctive to this portion of the district. For instance, the former Albright tract, stretching from Delaware to Elmwood and from Cleveland Avenue to West Ferry Street, is almost entirely populated with architect-designed houses. Works by locally celebrated architects such as E.B. Green, Edward Austin Kent, Frederick Backus, Bley and Lyman, Olaf Shelgren Sr., and Gordon Hayes appear in great numbers in this area. The sheer number of architect-designed houses in this block attests not only to the wealth present in

[304] For more on this firm, and this library, see "Public Services"

this portion of the district, but also illustrates the different pattern of development in this portion of the district than in the west. While real estate developers carved out parcels of land on both sides of Elmwood Avenue, the presence of large estates, and subsequently wealthy residents, enabled architects to exercise a greater influence over these settlement patterns in the eastern portion of the district than in the west.

CONCLUSION

The Elmwood Historic District is significant under Criterion C for its excellent, intact collection of turn of the twentieth century architecture and also under Criterion A as an intact, early streetcar suburb in the city of Buffalo. The Elmwood Historic District was one of Buffalo's earliest streetcar suburbs, growing within Frederick Law Olmsted's parks and parkways system and linked to the urban center of the city via a streetcar line on Elmwood Avenue beginning in 1889. While some houses had been constructed in the 1860s and 1870s, the vast majority of properties were built in a relatively short period of time between the 1890s and the 1910s. Whether architect designed or constructed from a builder's catalog, the vast majority of individual properties retain a distinctive high level of architectural quality and integrity, reflecting common architectural styles from the late 1800s and early 1900s and into the mid-twentieth century. Overall, the historic district maintains a high level of integrity in its design, plan, streets, and overall landscape, reflecting few minor changes to bring the area up to modern residential standards.

For roughly a century between ca. 1867 and ca. 1965 the Elmwood district flourished as a highly desirable neighborhood in the city of Buffalo. Attracting the city's most prominent businessmen and families, the district served as a showcase for some of Buffalo's best talent in architecture and urban design. The Elmwood Historic District (East) was built up slightly later than the area west of Elmwood Avenue, reflecting a related but slightly different development history. Notably, the early presence of large estates created a unique settlement pattern for the eastern portion of the district, separate and distinctive from the west. In addition to exhibiting high style architecture and manicured grounds, these estates also impacted the future development pattern of the Elmwood Historic District (East). Filling in around these large estates and then subdividing them for further development once they became available for purchase in the 1920s, real estate developers created a more patchwork pattern in the eastern portion of the district by working around the presence of these early large estates. Lending a distinctive appeal and demonstration of wealth to the eastern portion of the district, these estates were a distinguishing feature of the Elmwood Historic District (East), compared to the Elmwood Historic District (West).

Furthermore, the presence of these estates and subsequent parceling and automobile-centric development resulted in a lengthier development period in the eastern portion of the district than the west. The Elmwood Historic District (East) continued to experience new settlement patterns about twenty years after development in

the western portion had largely ceased. The presence of later building styles and development patterns, such as median streets and small cul de sacs, in the Elmwood Historic District (East) testifies to its continual evolution in relation to advancements in transportation methods. The district's transition from forest and farms to estate parks, public parks, and eventually the small 'semi-private' parklike streets mirrors the nation's broader transition in transportation advancements, from horses and carriages to streetcars and then automobiles. Today, the entire Elmwood Historic District remains as an exceptional, highly intact residential neighborhood, representing nearly a century of superb historic character and design.

Today's Elmwood Historic District is a strong reflection of the nineteenth-century naturalistic attractions as modified by the twentieth-century influence of the automobile. As Buffalo's earliest streetcar suburb, it contains a highly intact collection of individually significant buildings, representing the broad spectrum of popular late 1800s and early and mid-1900s styles. The Elmwood Historic District included thousands of the city's business, political and cultural leaders at a time when Buffalo was at the pinnacle of its international prominence. While Buffalo as a whole faced challenging economic times during the late twentieth century, resulting in a dramatic and steady loss in population, the Elmwood Historic District has continued to be one of the city's most popular and vibrant predominantly residential neighborhoods.

Bibliography:

1823 - First American Macadam Road." Macadam - Road Building in America! 2009. Accessed May 23, 2012. http://curbstone.com/_macadam.htm.

Ackerman, James. *The Villa: The form and Ideology of Country Houses*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1990.

"Advertisements." Erlanger Theatre program. December 1932. Accessed May 23, 2015, http://buffaloah.com/a/wferry/800/af.html.

"Advertisements." *The Outlook* 68, no. 18 (August 31, 1901).

Albright, Birge "John Joseph Albright-Part III." *Niagara Frontier* 8, no. 3 (Winter, 1963): 97-104.

American Atlas Co. *Atlas of the City of Buffalo, New York*. Philadelphia: American Atlas, 1894. http://www.erie.gov/atlases/buff_94/city_atlas.html.

Annual Report of the City Engineer, Buffalo, NY for the Year 1876. Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1877.

Annual Report of the City Engineer, Buffalo, NY for the Year 1881. Buffalo, NY: Courier Company, Printers, 1882.

Aguar, Charles E. and Berdeana. *Wrightscapes: Frank Lloyd Wright's Landscape Designs*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 2002.

Atkins, Barton. *Modern Antiquities: Comprising Sketches of Early Buffalo and the Great Lakes, Also Sketches of Alaska*. Buffalo, NY: Courier Company, Printers, 1898.

Bailey, George M. "Sketch of Buffalo." In *Buffalo 1893: A Descriptive and Statistical Sketch of the City of Buffalo and Its Suburbs*. Buffalo, N.Y.: Rowland &, 1893.

Banham, Reyner. "Introduction." In *Buffalo Architecture: A Guide*, by Francis R. Kowsky and Et Al. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1981.

Bankston, John. *Henry Ford and the Assembly Line*. Philadelphia: Mitchell Lane Publishers, 2003.

Barry, P., ed. *The Horticulturalist, and Journal of Rural Art and Rural Taste*. Vol. IV. Rochester: James Vick, Jr., 1854.

Benton, T. *Le Corbusier: Architect of the Century*. London: Arts Council of Great Britain, 1987.

Beveridge, Charles. "Buffalo's Park and Parkway System," in *Buffalo Architecture: A Guide*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1981.

Bishop, Colleen and Nation Benson. "Historic Buffalo Mansion Reopening to the Public." *WGRZ News* (Buffalo, NY), Feb 19, 2015.

Bluestone, Daniel. "Chicago's Mecca Flat Blues." *Giving Preservation a History*, edited by Max Page and Randall Mason. New York: Psychology Press, 2004.

Bonafide, John A. *Forest Lawn Cemetery*. Report no. 90000688. State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination. Albany: New York State Historic Preservation Office, 1990.

Bregger, D. David. *Buffalo's Historic Streetcars and Buses*. Charleston, SC: Arcadia Pub., 2008.

Buffalo and Erie County Public Library. "Summer Street." New York Heritage Digital Collections. 2009. Accessed June 06, 2012. http://nyheritage.nnyln.net/cdm4/item_viewer.php?CISOROOT=/VHB003.

Buffalo Bureau of Engineering. *Index to Records of Streets, Public Grounds, Waterways, Railroads, Gas Companies, Water Works, Etc., of the City of Buffalo, from 1814 to 1896.* Buffalo, NY: Bureau of Engineering, 1896.

Buffalo Commercial Advertiser. "A Public Park." July 16, 1856.

Buffalo Commercial Advertiser. "The New Park Project." August 26, 1868.

Buffalo Common Council. *Manual Containing a Sketch of Buffalo, Facts and Figures on Various Subjects ... and Full Data Relative to Public Affairs for the Year 1897*. Buffalo, N.Y.: Wenborne-Sumner, Printers, 1897.

Buffalo Common Council. *Proceedings of the Council of the City of Buffalo from January 1, 1922 to December 31, 1922*. Buffalo: Union and Times Press, 1922.

Buffalo Courier. "Children Crowded out of School 56." December 3, 1908: 6.

Buffalo Courier. "Deer Shot in Utica Street." February 19, 1911.

Buffalo Courier. "New Semi-Private Park to be Located on Site of Y.M.C.A Recreation Park." October 31, 1904: 12.

Buffalo Courier. "Object to Transfer of School 56 to New Building." April 21, 1912: 7.

Buffalo Courier. "Oldest Photographer in City Laid to Rest." January 24, 1922: 3.

Buffalo Courier. "St. Catherine's Court." March 4, 1923: 69.

Buffalo Courier. "Where Houses Grow: Marvelous Growth of the Elmwood District." September 9, 1894.

Buffalo Courier Express. "Bishop Smith Dedicates Newman Club Building." February 26, 1962: 7.

Buffalo Courier Express. "House is Halved for Move to New Site," May 12, 1958: 8.

Buffalo Courier Express. "How Easily Morgan Street Could Be Extended and Elmwood Avenue Widened." June 22, 1903.

Buffalo Courier Express. "Making Way for Progress." April 6, 1948, Courier-Express Daily Pictorial sec.

"Buffalo Courier's New Map of the City of Buffalo, Showing the Boundaries of the New City Park." Buffalo, N.Y.: Warren, Johnson & Company, 1869.

Buffalo Evening News. "Better Planning Asked as Street Loses Trees." November 8, 1938.

Buffalo Evening News. "Gordon Hayes." Obituary. March 1, 1983: C-6.

Buffalo Evening News. "Hugh Perry." Obituary. June 6, 1986: B-7.

Buffalo Express. "Another Large Sale of Real Estate." January 19, 1890.

"Buffalo Letter." The St. Louis Lumberman XLVI, no. 10 (November 15, 1910): 42-43.

Buffalo Morning Express. "Resting Place for the Dead." August 23, 1851. From a typewritten copy, Forest Lawn archives.

The Buffalo News. "Developer of Elmwood Avenue Section Dies." April 23, 1923.

The Buffalo News. "Map Outlines Proposed Richmond Avenue Extension." August 10, 1935.

The Buffalo News. "Widening of Elmwood Is Proposed - Plan Would Provide 49-foot Street." August 14, 1935.

Buffalo Times. "Boston Architect's Famous Houses." December 10, 1926.

Bureau of Business and Social Research, Ralph C. Epstein, and Florence M. Clark. *Buffalo Real Estate*

Assessments 1905-1928. University at Buffalo Studies in Business. Buffalo, N.Y., 1929.

Burr, David H. "Map of the County of Erie." Map. In *An Atlas of the State of New York*. New York, NY: D.H. Burr, Publisher, 1829. http://www.davidrumsey.com/luna/servlet/s/1d28sd.

"Chapt. 147: An Act to Divide the Town of Buffalo, in the County of Erie." In *Laws of the State of New York: Passed at the Fifty-ninth Session of the Legislature*, 200- 01. Vol. 59. Albany: E. Croswell, 1836.

"Chapt. 165: An Act to Authorize the Selection and Location of Certain Grounds for Public Parks in the City of Buffalo, and to Provide for the Maintenance and Embellishment Thereof." In *Preliminary Report Respecting a Public Park in Buffalo, and a Copy of The Act of the Legislature Authorizing Its Establishment*, 29-48. Buffalo, N.Y.: Mathews & Warren, 1869.

"Chapt. 240: An Act to Incorporate the Buffalo and Williamsville McAdam Road Company." In *Laws of the State of New York: Passed at the Fifty-ninth Session of the Legislature*, 316-18. Vol. 59. Albany: E. Croswell, 1836.

"Chapt. 256: An Act to Incorporate the Village of Black Rock." In *Laws of the State of New York: Passed at the Sixtieth Session of the Legislature,* 267-69. Vol. 60. Albany: E. Croswell, 1837.

"Chapt. 77: An Act to Authorize the City of Buffalo to Issue Bonds to Provide Money for the Construction of the Bird Avenue Sewer." In *Laws of the State of New York: Passed at the One-hundredth and Sixth Session of the Legislature*, 61-62. Albany: Weed, Parsons &, 1883.

City Planning Committee. "Extension of City Limits (1920)." Map. Buffalo Architecture and History. http://www.buffaloah.com/h/maps/extension.jpg.

Clinton Brown Company Architecture, *Entranceways at Main Street at Lamarck Drive and Smallwood Drive,* edited by Daniel McEneny. NR ref no.05001379. State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination. (Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, December 2005

The Commercial Advertiser Directory of the City of Buffalo. Buffalo, N.Y.: Thomas and Lathrops, Publishers, 1855.

Cram, George. "Map of Buffalo 1901." Barry Lawrence Ruderman Antique Maps Inc. Accessed June 07, 2012. http://www.raremaps.com/gallery/enlarge/27849.

Croly, Herbert. “Some Apartment Houses in Chicago.” *Architectural Record* 21(February 1907): 119-130.

Davis, Edwin Adams. *The Story of Louisiana*. Volume 3. New Orleans, LA: J.F. Hyer Publishing Company, 1960.

Devoy, John. *A History of the City of Buffalo and Niagara Falls: Including a Concise Account of the Aboriginal Inhabitants of This Region; the First White Explorers and Missionaries; the Pioneers and Their Successors...* Buffalo: Times, 1896.

Eleventh Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1881. Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1881.

Ellicott, Joseph, and Benjamin Ellicott. *Map of Morris's Purchase or West Geneseo in theState of New York: Exhibiting Part of the Lakes Erie and Ontario, the Straights of Niagara, Chautauque Lake, and All the Principal Waters, the Boundary Lines of the Several Tracts of Land Purchased by the Holland Land Company, William and John Willink, and Others, Boundary Lines of Townships, Boundary Lines of New York and Indian Reservations, Laid down from Actual Survey, Also a Sketch of Part of Upper Canada*. Map. [New York?]: Holland Land, 1804.

Eck, Susan. "Ellsworth Statler in Buffalo." Buffalo, NY: Western New York Heritage Press. Accessed June 2, 2015. http://wnyheritagepress.org/photos_week_2007/statler/estate/statler_estate.htm.

Emslie, Peter. "Map of Township II R.8 & W. Part T.II R.7 Holland Cos' Land and N.Y. State Reservation in the Town of Black Rock." Map. In *A Deed Atlas of the County of Erie, NY: Showing the Dimensions of Lots and Subdivisions of Lots as They Were Originally Converted by the Holland Land Co., the Farmers Loan & Trust Company and the State of New York, Together with the Village of New Amsterdam, Now City of Buffalo.* Buffalo, 1859.

Engelhardt, George W. *Buffalo, New York: The Book of Its Merchant Exchange*. Buffalo, NY: Matthews-Northrup, 1897.

Epstein, Ralph Cecil. *Trends in Buffalo Real Estate assessments 1905-28.* Buffalo: The University at Buffalo Press, 1929.

E.R. Jewett & Co. "E.R. Jewett & Cos. New Map of the City of Buffalo." Map. Buffalo, N.Y.: Sage, Sons & Company, 1862.

Fess, Margaret. "Williamsburg Influences New Homes on Buffalo Street." *Buffalo Courier Express*. April 29, 1962: 33-35.

Finch, Jonathan and Catherine Giles. *Estate Landscapes: Design, Improvement and Power in the Post-Medieval Landscape*. Woodbridge, UK: Boyell Press, 2007.

First Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, *January, 1871*. Buffalo: Warren,Johnson &, 1871.

Forest Lawn: Its History, Dedications, Progress, Regulations, Names of Lot Holders, &c. Buffalo, N.Y.: Thomas Howard & Johnson, 1867.

Fourth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1874. Buffalo, N.Y.: Warren, Johnson &, 1874.

Fox, Austin M. *Church Tales of the Niagara Frontier: Legends, History & Architecture*. Buffalo, NY: Western New York Wares, 1994.

Fox, Austin M. "The Greening of Buffalo: How Architect E.B. Green Shaped the Profile of the City." Buffalo as an Architectural Museum. Accessed November 5, 2015. http://www.buffaloah.com/a/archs/ebg/fox.html.

French, John Homer. "Buffalo City." In *Gazetteer of the State of New York: Embracing a Comprehensive View of the Geography, Geology, and General History of the State, and a Complete History and Description of Every County, City, Town, Village and Locality: With Full Table of Statistics*, 284-88. Syracuse, NY: R. Pearsall Smith, 1860.

F.W. Beers & Co. *City of Buffalo*. Map. New York: F.W. Beers &, 1880.

"Geo. W. Reese's New Map of the City of Buffalo." Buffalo, N.Y.: Clay, Cosack & Company, 1876.

Gerber, David A. ""The Germans Take Care of Our Celebrations."" In *Hard at Play: Leisure in America, 1840-1940*, by Kathryn Grover. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1992.

Geschichte Der Deutschen in Buffalo Und Erie County, N.Y.: Mit Biographien Und Illustrationen Hervorragender Deutsch-Amerikaner, Welche Zur Entwickelung Der Stadt Buffalo Beigetragen Haben. Buffalo, NY: Reinecke & Zesch, 1897.

Gilbert, W. B. "Map of the City of Buffalo." Map. A.W. Wilgus, 1835. http://www.bechs.org/exhibits/buffalo_anniversary/175th/page_c2.htm.

Gill, Brendan. *Many Masks: A Life of Frank Lloyd Wright*. Chicago: Da Capo Press, 1998.

G.M. Hopkins & Co., comp. *Atlas of the City of Buffalo, Erie County, New York*. Philadelphia: Edward Busch, 1872.

Goldman, Mark. *City on the Edge.* Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2007.

---. *High Hopes: The Rise and Decline of Buffalo, New York*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1983.

Goody Clancy Architecture, Planning, Preservation. *Historic Structures Report: The Richardson Olmsted Complex, Buffalo, NY*. Report. Boston, July 2008.

Goodyear, Anson Conger. *The Museum of Modern Art: The First Ten Years*. New York: MoMA Press, 1943.

Gowans, Alan. *The Comfortable House: North American Suburban Architecture, 1890-1930*. Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 1986.

Gray, Christopher. "Apartment Buildings, the Latest in French Ideas." *New York Times* (New York, NY), July 11, 2013.

"Great Places in America: Neighborhoods - Elmwood Village, Buffalo, New York." American Planning Association. 2007. http://www.planning.org/greatplaces/neighborhoods/2007/elmwoodvillage.htm.

Greater Buffalo: A Monthly Publication Devoted to Promoting the Prosperity of the Power City of America, December 1902.

Groth, Paul and Todd W. Bressi. *Understanding Ordinary Landscapes*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997.

Gurney, Becker & Bourne, Inc. *An Anniversary of One Hundred Years.* Buffalo: Unknown, 1965.

Gurney, Overturf and Becker, "Melbourne Court," Advertisement, 1928.

Harry E. Phillips. "Model of Perfection." Advertisement. Buffalo Live Wire, March 1913.

Harry E. Phillips. "To All Renters, Flat Dwellers and Seekers After Homes." Advertisement. Buffalo Express, November 25, 1910.

Hawes, Elizabeth. *New York, New York: How the Apartment House Transformed the Life of the City (1869- 1930).* New York: Random House Publishing, 1996.

Heinz, Thomas. *The Vision of Frank Lloyd Wright*. London: Chartwell Books, 2000.

Heritage Landscapes. *Cultural Landscape Report: The Richardson Olmsted Complex, Buffalo NY*. Report. October 2008.

Hill, Henry Wayland, and Winfield Scott Downs. *Municipality of Buffalo, New York a History, 1720-1923*. Vol. I. New York: Lewis Historical Pub, 1923.

---. *Municipality of Buffalo, New York a History, 1720-1923*. Vol. II. New York: Lewis Historical Pub, 1923.

---. *Municipality of Buffalo, New York a History, 1720-1923*. Vol. III. New York: Lewis Historical Pub, 1923.

A History of the City of Buffalo: Its Men and Institutions: Biographical Sketches of Leading Citizens. Buffalo: Buffalo Evening News, 1908.

Hodge Bros., Agents. Statistical Story of Progressive Asphalt. ca. 1889. MS, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society, Buffalo, N.Y.

Hodge, Orlando John. *Hodge Genealogy: From the First of the Name in This Country to the Present Time, with a Number of Allied Families and Many Historical Facts*. Boston: Rockwell and Churchill Press, 1900.

Hodge (younger), William. "The William Hodge Papers." In *Recalling Pioneer Days*, edited by Frank H. Severance, 109- 314. Vol. XXVI. Buffalo, NY: Buffalo Historical Society, 1922.

Holly, Henry Hudson. *Holly's Country Seats: Containing Lithographic Designs for Cottages, Villas, Mansions, etc. with Their Accompanying Outbuildings.* London, UK: D. Appleton, 1863.

Hopkin's of Buffalo, Inc. "Elmwood District 2 Family Houses." Advertisement. *Buffalo Morning Express*, March 28, 1926, sec. 5.

"Horticultural Advertisements - Erie County Nursery." In *Genesee Farmer*. Vol. 9. Rochester: B.F. Smith &, 1848. http://books.google.com/books?id=S3MXAQAAIAAJ&dq=%22Erie%20County%20nursery%22&pg=PA116IA5#v=onepage&q=%22Erie%20County%20nurser y%22&f=false.

Hough, Franklin Benjamin. *Census of the State of New-York, for 1855: Taken in Pursuance of Article Third of the Constitution of the State, and of Chapter Sixty-four of the Laws of 1855*. Albany: Printed by C. Van Benthuysen, 1857. http://nysl.nysed.gov/Archimages/88819.PDF.

Hunt, Sanford B. *The Manufacturing Interests of the City of Buffalo including Sketches of the History of Buffalo: With Notices of Its Principal Manufacturing Establishments*. Buffalo: C.F.S. Thomas, 1866.

Illinois State Horticultural Society. *Transaction of the Illinois State Horticultural Society for 1869*. Vol. III. St. Louis: R.P. Studley &, 1870. http://books.google.com/books?id=4gghAQAAMAAJ&pg=PR1#v=onepage&q&f=false.Illustrated Historical Atlas of Erie Co., New York: From Actual Surveys and Records. Map. New York: F.W. Beers &, 1880.

In the Matter of the Application of the Buffalo Traction Company for the Appointment of Three Commissioners to Determine Whether Its Railroad Ought to Be Constructed and Operated in East and West Utica Street.

New York State Supreme Court. Google Books. (March 2, 1897).

Index of Paved Streets, Sewers, Water Mains: With Important Ordinances, Regulations and Permit Forms Relating to Work in Public Streets. Buffalo: Bureau, 1912.

Index of Paved Streets, Sewers, Water Mains: With Important Ordinances, Regulations and Permit Forms Relating to Work in Public Streets, to 1957. Buffalo: Bureau, 1958.

Ins and Outs of Buffalo, the Queen City of the Lakes; a Thoroughly Authentic and Profusely Illustrated Guide. Buffalo: A.B. Floyd, 1899.

International Gazette. "Clinton Grove Popular Picnic Grounds in 60's." December 27, 1930.

Jamieson, Charles. *Heritage of Heresy: Unitarian Universalist Church of Buffalo, N.Y. 1832-1982*. Kenmore: Partners Press, 1982.

Ketchum, William. *An Authentic and Comprehensive History of Buffalo with Some Account of Its Early Inhabitants...* Vol. II. Buffalo, N.Y.: Rockwell, Baker & Hill, 1864.

Kingsley & Potter. "Real Estate." Advertisement. *Real Estate and Building News*, December 1890.

Kirwan, Susan. "Buffalo Street Name Changes." Buffalo and Erie County Public Library. 2005. http://www1.buffalolib.org/libraries/collections/genealogy/pdfs/SubjectGuides/Buffalo%20Street%20Name%20C hanges.pdf.

Kowsky, Francis, Martin Wachadlo, and Christine M. Longiaru. *Intensive Level Historic Resources Survey - City of Buffalo: Grant-Ferry-Forest Neighborhood*. Report. Buffalo, N.Y.: Clinton Brown Company Architecture, Feb 2006.

Kowsky, Francis R., and Martin Wachadlo. *Historic Resources Survey: Cold Spring/North Masten Park Neighborhood, Buffalo, NY*. Report. Buffalo: Preservation Buffalo Niagara, Aug 2010. http://www.preservationbuffaloniagara.org/files/documents/Cold_Spring_North_Masten_Park_Survey_-_updated_7.24.2011_Part1.pdf.

Kowsky, Francis R. "Delaware Avenue, Buffalo, New York." In *The Grand American Avenue: 1850 - 1920*, edited by Jan Cigliano, 35-63. San Francisco: Pomegranate Artbooks, 1994.

---. "Municipal Parks and City Planning: Frederick Law Olmsted's Buffalo Park and Parkway System." *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* 46, no. 1 (March 1987): 49-64. JSTOR.

Kunz, Mary. "F. Scott Fitzgerald: The Buffalo Years," *Buffalo Evening News*, February 20, 1994.

LaChiusa, Chuck. "The History of Buffalo: A Chronology: Buffalo 1841-1865." Buffalo as an Architectural Museum. Accessed August 07, 2012. http://www.buffaloah.com/h/1865.html.

---. "Charles W. Goodyear House, A History." Buffalo as an Architectural Museum. Accessed May 25, 2015. http://www.buffaloah.com/a/del/888/hist/

---. "Coatsworth House, 16 Lincoln Woods Lane." Buffalo as an Architectural Museum. Accessed June 19, 2015, http://www.buffaloah.com/a/lincwoods/index.html.

---. "F. Scott Fitzgerald in Buffalo, NY." Buffalo as an Architectural Museum. Accessed June 10, 2015, http://www.buffaloah.com/a/fitzbflo/fitzbflo.html

---. "Frank H. Goodyear Family in Buffalo." Buffalo as an Architectural Museum. Accessed May 25, 2015. http://buffaloah.com/h/goodyear_F/bios.html

---. "Hewitt House." Buffalo as an Architectural Museum. Accessed October 27, 2015. http://www.buffaloah.com/a/lafay/619/stair.html

Landis & Alsop. "Buffalo, Erie Co., N.Y. (1902)." Map. Library of Congress - American Memory Map Collections. http://lcweb2.loc.gov/cgi bin/query/D?gmd:4:./temp/~ammem_nE40::.

"Larkin's "Self-Serve" Store Winning Out." *Printer's Ink*, April 18, 1918, 125-26. http://http://books.google.com/books?id=ejgfAQAAMAAJ&pg=PA15#v=onepag e&q&f=false.

Larned, J. N., Charles E. Fitch, and Ellis H. Roberts. *A History of Buffalo, Delineating the Evolution of the City*. Vol. I and II. New York: Progress of the Empire State, 1911.

LeGates, Richard. *Early Urban Planning: Volume One*. London: Routledge, 2004.

Levine, Linda. "The Coit House: Prelude to Preservation," *Buffalo Spree Magazine* (November/December 2002), accessed June 12, 2015, http://www.buffalospree.com/buffalospreemagazine/archives/2002_1112/111202coit.html

"Library Dedicated in Honor of Cranes." *Buffalo Courier Express*. June 18, 1955: 4.

Livsey, Karen E. *Western New York Land Transactions, 1804-1824; Extracted from the Archives of the Holland Land Company*. Baltimore: Genealogical Pub., 1991. Ancestry.com.

Long, Elias A. *An Acre in the City: A Brief Treatise on Land, Millionaires, Fortunes in Real Estate, Buffalo, Niagara Power*. Buffalo, 1894.

Maerz Lithographing Company. "The City of Buffalo, N.Y. 1880." Buffalo, N.Y.: E.H. Hutchinson, 1880.

"Map of North Buffalo, Showing Frederick Law Olmsted Parks and Parkways and Buffalo State Asylum." Map. 1876. From the Frederick Law Olmsted National Historic Site.

"Map Showing the Territory to Be Drained by the Ferry and Bird Ave. Receiving Sewer, Buffalo NY." Map. In *Annual Report of the City Engineer, Buffalo, NY for the Year 1875*. Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1876.

Marshall, O. H. *The Niagara Frontier: Embracing Sketches of Its Early History, and Indian, French and English Local Names; Read before the Buffalo Historical Club, February 27th, 1865*. Buffalo: Joseph Warren &, Printers, 1865.

Memorial and Family History of Erie County, New York: Biographical and Genealogical. Vol. II. New York: Genealogical Pub., 1906-08.

Michaels, Albert L., and Bette A. Rupp. "A History of Forest Lawn Cemetery." In *Forest Lawn Cemetery: Buffalo History Preserved*, by Richard O. Reisem. Buffalo, NY: Forest Lawn Heritage Foundation, 1996.

Mozingo, Louise. *Pastoral Capitalism: A History of Corporate Landscapes.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2011.

"Mrs. Daniel K Stucki to Instruct Women Autoists in Buffalo," *American Artisan* 74. July 14, 1917: 27.

Nagle, Roy W. *Buffalo's Delaware Avenue.* Buffalo: R.L. Polk & Co., 1963.

Napora, James. "Pilgrim Congregational Church." In *Houses of Worship: A Guide to the Religious Architecture of Buffalo, New York*. 1995. http://buffaloah.com/how/3/3.10/pilg.html.

"The New Elmwood District." *Greater Buffalo: A Monthly Publication Devoted to Promoting the Prosperity of the Power City of America*, November 1902, 19-21.

"The New Elmwood District." *Greater Buffalo: A Monthly Publication Devoted to Promoting the Prosperity of the Power City of America*, October 1902, 8-10.

"A New Map of the City of Buffalo, Embracing All the Territory including Upper & Lower Villages of Black Rock, Cold Springs, &c. as Authorized under the Act of 1853." Map. Buffalo, N.Y.: Jewett Thomas &, 1854.

New Topographical Atlas of Erie Co., New York, from Actual Surveys Especially for This Atlas. Philadelphia: Stone & Stewart, 1866.

New Topographical Atlas of Erie County, N. Y. From Actual Surveys Especially for This Atlas. Philadelphia: Stone & Stewart, 1866.

Norton, Charles D. "The Old Black Rock Ferry." In *Publications of the Buffalo Historical Society*. Vol. I. Buffalo, N.Y.: Bigelow Brothers, 1870.

"Notable Sales." *Real Estate and Building News* III (October 17, 1891).

Nye, David. *America's Assembly Line*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 2013.

"Old and New Real Estate Ideas." *Real Estate and Building News* III, no. 1 (July 1891).

Order of the Church Session, comp. *Memoir of John C. Lord, D.D., Pastor of the Central Presbyterian Church for Thirty-eight Years*. Buffalo, N.Y.: Courier Company, Printers, 1878. http://ia600506.us.archive.org/1/items/memoirofjohnclor00buff/memoirofjohnclo r00buff.pdf.

"Original Land Subdivisions of Buffalo, N.Y. (1922)." Map. Buffalo Architecture and History. http://www.buffaloah.com/h/maps/subdivisions.jpg.

"Our Chief Thoroughfare." *Grosvenor Library Bulletin* 4, no. 1 (September 1921): 12-22.

Pickett, H. S., ed. "Buffalo." *The Architectural Era* 3 (September 1889): 195-96.

The Pictorial Year-book and Calendar for 1888 with Buffalo Events in 1887. Buffalo, NY: Matthews, Northup &, 1888.

Platt, Harold. "Planning Modernism: Growing the Organic City in the 20th Century" in *Thick Space: Approaches to Modernism*, edited by Dorthee Brantz, Sasha Disko and Georg Wagner-Kyora. Berlin: Transcript Publishing, 2012.

Rizzo, Michael F., and Genevieve M. Kenyon. *Through the Mayors' Eyes: Buffalo, New York 1832-2005*. Buffalo, N.Y.: Old House History, 2005.

Rizzo, Mike. "Turn-of-the-'previous'-century Splendor Abounds in City's Architecture." *The Buffalo News*, March 29, 2003, Home Finder ed.

Ross, Claire L. *Olmsted Parks and Parkways Thematic Resources*. Report. Ref. No. 90THM00012. National Register of Historic Places. Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, December 1981.

---. *Parke Apartments*. Report. Ref. No. 07000492. National Register of Historic Places. Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, January 2007.

"Rumsey Park." Western New York Heritage Press. 2005. Accessed May 30, 2012. http://wnyheritagepress.org/photos_week_2005/rumsey_park/rumsey_park.htm.

Rybczynski, Witold. *A Clearing in the Distance: Frederick Law Olmsted and America in the Nineteenth Century*. New York: Scribner, 1999.

Wolfgang Sachs, *For Love of the Automobile: Looking Back into the History of our Desires*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996.

Schentag, Annie. *University Park Historic District.* Edited by Daniel McEneny. NR ref no.11000273. State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination. Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, May 2011.

Schneekloth, Lynda and Robert Shibley and Thomas Yots. *Olmsted in Buffalo and Niagara*. Buffalo: Urban Design Project, 2011.

Second Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1872. Buffalo, N.Y.: Warren, Johnson &, 1872.

Siener, William H. *Upstairs, Downstairs: Western New Yorkers and the Titanic*. Buffalo, NY: Western New York Heritage Press, 1998.

Seventh Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1877. Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1877.

Sheldon, Grace Carew. "Unknown - Article about William Hodge, Sr." Unknown (Buffalo), December 31, 1909. From the Vertical Files Collection - Hodge Family, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society.

Shreves, Zona. “Readers share memories of their favorite restaurants.” *Buffalo News* (Buffalo, NY), January 23, 2013.

Sickels, Frank. *Fifty Years of the Young Men's Christian Association of Buffalo, A History*. Buffalo: Published by the Association, 1902.

Sickels, George and R.W. Goode and Company, *Penhurst Park: A Choice Location for Handsome Homes* (Buffalo, NY: The Penhurst Park Company, 1909): 1.

Sixth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1876. Buffalo, N.Y.: Press of the Courier Company, 1876.

Smith, H. Perry. *History of the City of Buffalo and Erie County with Biographical Sketches of Some of Its Prominent Men and Pioneers.* Syracuse, NY: D. Mason, 1884.

Stilgoe, John R. *Borderland: Origins of the American Suburb, 1820-1939*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988.

Storrer, William Allin. *The Architecture of Frank Lloyd Wright*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2002.

Subdivision Activity in Erie County. Buffalo: Erie County Division of Planning, 1963.

Taussig, Ellen. *Your Host, Peter Gust of the Park Lane Restaurant: His Story.* Boston: Herman Publications, 1979.

Tenth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1880. Buffalo, N.Y.: Young, Lockwood &, 1880.

Tessier, Natalie Green. "The Old Photo Album: Elmwood Avenue." Western New York Heritage, Summer 2002, 14-16.

Third Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1873. Buffalo, N.Y.: Warren, Johnson &, 1873.

Turner, O. *Pioneer History of the Holland Purchase of Western New York: Embracing Some Account of the Ancient Remains ... and a History of Pioneer Settlement under the Auspices of the Holland Company, including Reminiscences of the War of 1812; the Origin, Progress and Completion of the Erie Canal, Etc.* Buffalo: Geo. H. Derby and, 1850.

Twelfth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1882. Buffalo, N.Y.: Courier Company, Printers, 1882.

Twentieth Annual Report of the Buffalo Park Commissioners, January 1890. Buffalo, N.Y.: Courier Company, Printers, 1890.

United States of America. U.S. Department of the Interior. National Park Service. *Historic Residential Suburbs*. By David L. Ames and Linda Flint McClelland. National Register Bulletin:. Washington D.C.: National Park Service, September 2002.

Unknown. Life on Elmwood. ca. 1983. TS, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society, Buffalo, NY.

Urban, Florian. *Tower and Slab: Histories of Global Mass Housing*. New York: Routledge, 2013.

Von Moos, Stanislaus. *Le Corbusier: Elements of a Synthesis*. Rotterdam: 010 Publishers, 2009.

Wachadlo, Martin and Charles LaChiusa. *Oakland Place: Gracious Living in Buffalo*. Buffalo: Buffalo Heritage Unlimited, 2006.

Walkowski, Jennifer. *Elmwood Historic District (West)*. Edited by Daniel McEneny. State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination. Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, October 2012.

---. *Lafayette Avenue Presbyterian Church*. Edited by Daniel McEneny. NR Ref. No. 09NR05997. State and National Registers of Historic Places Nomination. Albany: NY State Historic Preservation Office, 2009.

Walter G. Hopkins. "Real Estate for Sale!" Advertisement. *Buffalo Real Estate News*, September 15, 1890.

---. "The Elmwood Avenue District." Advertisement. *Buffalo Real Estate News*, July 15, 1890.

Warner, Gene. “Spirit of School 30 Outlasts Building.” *Buffalo Evening News*. May 28, 1981: 29.

Warner, Sam Bass, and Andrew H. Whittemore. *American Urban Form: A Representative History*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2012.

---. *Streetcar Suburbs: The Process of Growth in Boston, 1870-1900*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2009.

"Western Horticultural Review: Changes." In *The Horticultural Review and Botanical Magazine*, edited by J.A. Warder, M.D. Vol. II. Cincinnati: Morgan & Overend, 1852.

"What Builders Are Doing: Buffalo, N.Y." *Carpenter and Building* XX, no. 8 (August 1898): 195.

White, Truman C. *Our County and Its People; a Descriptive Work on Erie County, New York*. Vol. I. Boston: Boston History, 1898.

White, Truman C. *Our County and Its People; a Descriptive Work on Erie County, New York*. Vol. II. Boston History, 1898.

Williams, Frank. *Williams' New Map of the City of Buffalo, Compiled from Actual Surveys & Reliable Records: Showing All the Territory Embraced within the City Limits, Dimensions of Blocks, Original Lot Lines, Public Improvements, Etc.* Map. Buffalo: Frank Willams, 1855.

Wright, Frank Lloyd. *Studies and Executed Buildings by Frank Lloyd Wright: The Wasmuth Portfolio*. Chicago: AIA Press, 1919.

Wyckoff, William. *The Developer's Frontier: The Making of the Western New York Landscape*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988.